

# RWANDA COMMON COUNTRY ANALYSIS

## FINAL REPORT

November 13 2017

Arthur Byabagambi Consultant

Table	of Contents	
	EVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	
	NTRODUCTION	
1.1	SCOPE AND OBJECTIVES OF THE COMMON COUNTRY ANALYSIS	
1.2	OBJECTIVES OF THE CCA	
1.2.1	APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY	
2. C	COUNTRY OVERVIEW	2
2.1	ECONOMIC PERFORMANCE	
2.2	SOCIO-ECONOMIC SITUATION	4
2.2.1	PRIVATE SECTOR DEVELOPMENT	5
2.2.2	REGIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL TRADE	
2.2.3	INFRASTRUCTURE, URBANISATION AND TRANSPORT	
2.2.4	INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY	
2.2.5	INDUSTRIALISATION	
2.2.6	FINANCIAL SECTOR	
2.2.7	DECENT WORK FOR ALL	
2.2.8	AGRICULTURE	
2.3	ECONOMIC CLUSTER: PRIORITIES AND ANALYSIS OF UNDAP PROGRAMMING PRINCIPLES	
2.4	HUMAN DEVELOPMENT INDEX	
2.4.1	DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE	
2.4.2	POVERTY, INEQUALITY AND VULNERABILITIES	
2.4.3	SOCIAL PROTECTION	
2.4.4	HEALTH.	
	MATERNAL, REPRODUCTIVE AND CHILD HEALTH	
	CHILD AND ADULT NUTRITION	
	FOOD SECURITY	
	HIV/AIDS	
2.4.5 2.4.6	WATER AND SANITATION EDUCATION	
	EDUCATION	
	EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION	
	TVET AND HIGHER EDUCATION	
2.4.0.3	Social cluster: Priorities and analysis of undap programming principles	
2.5	STATE INSTITUTIONS AND POLITICAL SITUATION	
2.6.1	INCLUSIVE PARTICIPATION AND DEMOCRATIC GOVERNANCE	
2.6.2	PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY AND SERVICE DELIVERY	
2.6.3	JUSTICE AND RULE OF LAW	
2.7	GOVERNANCE CLUSTER: PRIORITIES AND ANALYSIS OF UNDAP PROGRAMMING PRINCIPLES	
2.8	HUMAN RIGHTS AND GENDER EQUALITY.	
2.8.1	HUMAN RIGHTS SITUATION	
2.8.2	Gender equality	
2.9	HUMAN RIGHTS & GENDER CLUSTER: PRIORITIES AND ANALYSIS OF UNDAP PROGRAMMING PRINCI	
2.10	CLIMATE AND ENVIRONMENT	
2.10.1		
2.10.2	CLIMATE CHANGE RESILIENCE	69
2.11	ENVIRONMENT AND CLIMATE CLUSTER: PRIORITIES AND ANALYSIS OF UNDAP PROGRAMMING PRINCIPLES	
2.12	PEACE-HUMANITARIAN-DEVELOPMENT NEXUS	74
2.12.1	DISASTER RISK MANAGEMENT	74
2.12.2	Refugees	76
	MIGRATION	
2.12.4	PEACE AND SECURITY	
2.13	PEACE HUMANITARIAN DEVELOPMENT NEXUS CLUSTER: PRIORITIES AND ANALYSIS OF UNDAP	
	RAMMING PRINCIPLES	
	COUNTRY RISK PROFILE	
3.1	FINANCING LANDSCAPE	
3.2	NATIONAL SDG PROCESSES AND PROGRESS	
3.3	RWANDA TOWARDS VISION 2050	
	COMPARATIVE ADVANTAGES OF THE UN IN RWANDA	
	CONCLUSION	
	APPENDICES	
ANNE	xe 6.1: Citations	

#### TABLES

Table 1: Electricity generation mix for Rwanda, 2016	8
Table 1: Economic Clusters priorities and programming principles	
Table 2: Population structure by sex and five-year age group	27
Table 3: High-Risk fertility behaviour	
Table 4: Status of water and sanitation indicators	
Table 5: Primary school transition rates (2015 – 2016)	
Table 6: Secondary school transition rates (2015 – 2016)	43
Table 7: Social Clusters priorities and programming principles	45
Table 8: Governance Clusters priorities and programming principles	
Table 9: Human rights and Gender Clusters priorities and programming principles	66
Table 10: Climate and Environment Clusters priorities and programming principles	71
Table 12: Disasters in Rwanda (1994 – 2016)	74
Table 13: Rwanda's disaster risk exposures and vulnerability	
Table 14: Spatial distribution of refugees in Rwanda, August 2017	
Table 15: Repatriated refugees from 1994 to October 2013	79
Table 16: Peace Humanitarian development nexus Clusters priorities and programming principles	
Table 17: Composition of ODA by source of funding	

#### FIGURES

Figure 1: GDP per capita and total output by sector	3
Figure 2: Share of GDP by kind of activity, 2016	4
Figure 3: Composition of Rwanda's manufacturing sector output (2006 -2015)	11
Figure 4: District variations in poverty and extreme poverty rates	
Figure 5: Summary of Rwanda's labour force indicators	14
Figure 6: Yields development for selected crops 2013A - 2017A (2013A = 100)	18
Figure 7: Nutrition status of children in Rwanda	35
Figure 8: UR Academic Staff Profile	45
Figure 9: Student enrollment and graduation 2016/17	64
Figure 10: ODA to Rwanda, 2013/14 - 2015/16	
Figure 11: Evolution of Rwanda's major development finance flows	
Figure 12: One UN Rwanda strengths' points of convergence and divergences	92

#### ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

¢	Cents
9YBE	Nine Years Basic Education
AMIR	Association Of Micro Finance Institutions In Rwanda
ART	Anti-Retroviral Treatment
AU	African Union
BDC	Business Development Centres
BDF	Business Development Fund
BMI	Body Mass Index
BNR	National Bank Of Rwanda
BOS	Business Operations Strategy
BRD	Rwanda Development Bank
CAHW	Community Animal Health Workers
CBHI	Community-Based Health Insurance
CCA	Common Country Analysis
CEDAW	Convention On The Elimination Of All Forms Of Discrimination Against Women
CERF	Central Emergency Resource Funds
CESB	Capacity Development And Employment Services Board
CHW	Community Health Workers
CIP	Crop Intensification Programme
СМА	Capital Markets Authority
CMW	Convention On The Protection Of Migrant Workers And Members Of Their Families
COMESA	Common Market For Eastern And Southern Africa
CPD	Country Programme Document
CRC	Citizens Report Card
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
CTD	Convention Travel Documents
DaO	Delivering As One
DDMC	District Disaster Management Committee
DG	Director General
DHU	District Health Unit
DIS	Direct Income Support
DRC	Democratic Republic Of Congo
DRM	Disaster Risk Management
DRR	Disaster Risk Response
DS EAC	Direct Support
EAC	East African Community
EBM ECCAS	Electronic Billing Machine Economic Community Of Central African
ECCAS	Early Childhood Development
ECE	Early Childhood Education
EDPRS	Economic Development And Poverty Reduction Strategy
EGF	Export Growth Facility
EIA	Environment Impact Assessment
EICV	Integrated Household Living Conditions Survey
ENR	Environment And Natural Resources
ESSP	Education Sector Strategic Plan
ESWG	Education Sector-Working Group
F2F	Funding To Financing
FARG	Genocide Survivors Support And Assistance Fund
FBO	Faith Based Organizations
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FFS	Farmer Field School
FGD	Focus Group Discussions
FONERWA	Rwanda Environment And Climate Change Fund
FSP	Financial Services Product
FSW	Female Sex Workers
FY	Fiscal Year
GBV	Gender Based Violence
GDI	Gender Development Index
GDP	Gross Domestic Product

GER	Gross Enrolment Rate
GGCRS	Green Growth And Climate Resilience Strategy
GII	Gender Inequality Index
GMO	Gender Monitoring Office
GNI	Gross National Income
GoR	Government Of Rwanda
GVA	Gross Value Addition
НС	Health Centre
НСТ	HIV Counselling And Testing
HDI	Human Development Index
HDR	Human Development Report
HEC	Higher Education Council
HEI	Higher Education Institutions
HMIS	Health Management Information System
HSSP	Health Sector Strategic Plan
HSWG	Health Sector Working Group
ICBT	Informal Cross-Border Trade
ICPC	Integrated Craft Production Centres
ICT	Information And Communication Technology
ICT	Information And Communication Technology
IDP	Integrated Development Programme
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IOM	International Organisation For Migration
IOSC	Isange One Stop Centres
ISP	Internet Service Provider
IΤ	Information Technology
IWRM	Integrated Water Resource Management
JIMC	Joint Intervention Management Committee
KII	Key Informant Interviews
KSEZ	Kigali Special Economic Zone
KW	Kilo Watt
kWh	Kilo Watt Hour
LFS	Labour Force Survey
LMIS	Labour Market Information System
LODA	Local Administrative Entities Development Agency
LTE	Long-Term Evolution
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MFIs	Micro Finance Institutions
MICE	Meetings, Incentives, Conferences, And Exhibitions
MIDIMAR	Ministry Of Disaster Management And Refugees Affairs
MIFOTRA	Ministry Of Labour And Public Service
MIGEPROF	Ministry Of Gender And Family Promotions
MINAFET	Ministry Of Foreign Affairs
MINAGRI	Ministry Of Agriculture And Animal Resources
MINALOC	Ministry Of Local Government
MINEACOM	Ministry Of Trade, Industry And East African Community Affairs
MINECOFIN MINEDUC	Ministry Of Finance And Economic Planning Ministry Of Education
MINIJUST MININFRA	Ministry Of Justice Ministry Of Infrastructure
MININFRA	Ministry Of Natural Resources
MINITEC	Ministry Of ICT
MOH	Ministry Of Health
MPG	Minimum Package For Graduation
MPG MPI	Multidimensional Poverty Index
MSM	Men Who Have Sex With Men
MSME	Micro Small And Medium Enterprises
MT	Metro Small And Medium Enterprises
MTCT	Mother-To-Child Transmission
MW	Mega Watt
NAEB	National Agriculture Export Promotions Board
	o recorded and

NDMEC	National Disaster Management Executive Committee
NDMTC	National Disaster Management Technical Committee
NEP	National Employment Programme
NER	Net Enrolment Rate
NGO	Non-Government Organisation
NHCR	National Human Rights Commission For Rwanda
NHRAP	National Human Rights Action Plan
NIRDA NISR	National Industrial Research And Development Agency Rwanda National Institute Of Statistics
NPDRR NIB A	National Platform For Disaster Risk Reduction
NRA	Non-Resident Agency
NST	National Strategy For Transformation
NTA	Non-Traditional Assistance
NTB	Non-Tariff Barriers
NWC	National Women's Council
ODA	Official Development Assistance
OLPC	One Laptop Per Child
OMT	Operations Management Team
OSBPs	One Stop Border Posts
PAYE	Pay As You Earn
PBF	Performance Based Financing
PLHIV	People Living With HIV
PMTCT	Prevention Of Mother-To-Child Transmission
PPOC	The Programme Planning And Oversight Committee
PPP	Public Private Partnership
PSC-F	Peace, Security And Cooperation Framework For The Democratic Republic Of The Congo And The Region
PSF	Private Sector Federation
PSTA	Plan For Strategic Transformation Of Agriculture
PW	Public Works
PWD	People With Disabilities
R&D	Research And Development
RAB	Rwanda Agriculture Board
RBC	Rwanda Biomedical Center
RDB	Rwanda Development Board
RDHS	Rwanda Demographic And Health Survey
RDRC	Rwanda Demobilization And Reintegration Commission
REB	Rwanda Education Board
REMA	Rwanda Environmental Authority
RENCP	Rwanda Education Ngo Coordination Platform
RGB	Rwanda Governance Board
RGS	Rwanda Governance Scorecard
RLMUA	Rwanda Land Management And Use Authority
RMA	Rwanda Meteorology Agency
RMC	Rwanda Media Commission
RMPGB	Rwanda Mining, Gas And Petroleum Board
RNP	Rwanda National Police
RRB	Rwanda Reconciliation Barometer
RSE	Rwanda Stock Exchange
RSSB	Rwanda Social Security Board
RUDP	Rwanda Urban Development Program
RWFA	Rwanda Water And Forestry Authority
SACCO	Savings And Credit Co-Operative
SDC	Sero-Discordant Couples
SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
SDMC	Sector Disaster Management Committees
SEZ	Special Economic Zone
SGBV	Sexual Gender Based Violence
SPSWG	Social Protection Sector Working Group
SRMP	Smart Rwanda Master Plan
SSA	Sub-Saharan Africa
SSP	Sector Strategic Plan

STEM	Science Technology, Engineering And Mathematics
SWAP	Sector Wide Approach
SWG	Sector Working Group
TSS	Technical Secondary School
TTC	Teacher Training Colleges
TVET	Technical And Vocational Education And Training
TWG	Thematic Working Group
U-SACCO	Umurenge-Savings And Credit Co-Operative
UN	United Nations
UNCG	United Nations Communication Group
UNCT	UN Country Teams
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDAP	United Nations Development Assistance Plan
UNDG	United Nations Development Assistance Group
UNDG	United Nations Development Group
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific And Cultural Organization I
UNHCR	United Nations High Commission For Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNTFHS	UN Trust Fund For Human Security
UPR	Universal Periodic Review
UR	University Of Rwanda
USD / US \$	United States Dollars
VAWG	Violence Against Women And Girls
VTC	Vocational Training Centres
VUP	Vision 2020 Umurenge Programme
WASAC	Water And Sanitation Corporation
WASH	Water And Sanitation Hygiene
WDA	Workforce Development Authority
WEF	World Economic Forum
WFP	World Food Programme
WRD	World Refugee Day

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

The United Nations Development Assistance Plan (UNDAP) 2013-2018 is the strategic programme framework for the UN system in Rwanda. It describes the UN country teams' (UNCT) collective response to the priorities in the national development framework as espoused in Rwanda's long-term development Vision 2020 and medium-term strategy as expressed in Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy (EDPRS) II 2013 -2018. The UNDAP will end on 30 June 2018 and planning for the next UNDAP (UNDAP 2) has commenced. As part of this planning process, the One UN in Rwanda needs to determine the development situation and challenges facing Rwanda and identify where the UN can best position itself to support national priorities in order to bring about transformational and sustainable development for Rwanda.

It is in this context that this Common Country Analysis (CCA) was conducted to articulate the Rwandan context, opportunities and challenges encompassing sustainable development, human rights, gender equality, peace and security and humanitarian perspectives.

#### 1.1 SCOPE AND OBJECTIVES OF THE COMMON COUNTRY ANALYSIS

The CCA is a required and essential element of every UNDAP process. It is the UN system's independent and mandate-based articulation of the country context, opportunities and challenges, encompassing sustainable development (key sectors), leave no one behind, human rights, gender equality, peace and security, and humanitarian perspectives. The CCA serves as a basis for the prioritization exercise, the definition of outcomes, the preparation of the UN Vision 2030 and subsequent development of the overall UNDAP theory of change<sup>1</sup>.

The CCA's assessment and analysis, based on a variety of data sources and applying a causal analysis, inform the trend analysis of the UN Vision 2030, while the longer-term horizon of the same UN Vision 2030 guides the orientation of the CCA. The analyses of the CCA and the UN Vision 2030 seek to identify immediate, underlying and structural development challenges at the national level. The analytical frame of the CCA is directly linked to key elements of the programming principles in the UNDAF Guidance. The CCA delivers thematic analyses based on the principles of leave no one behind and reaching the furthest behind first, with a focus on defining the needs of the most vulnerable and at-risk people; human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment; sustainability and resilience; and accountability.

The CCA informs the design of UN policies and programmes at the country level based on the review of context-specific data that correspond to the 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and 169 targets of the 2030 Agenda. The integrated and indivisible nature of the SDGs will require UNCTs to reinforce a "delivering as one" approach to analysis that builds on a "whole-system" engagement for planning and implementation. The CCA should assist in identifying links among goals and targets in order to effectively determine mutually reinforcing priorities and catalytic opportunities for implementation of the new agenda as a whole. It should seek to move beyond the aggregation of sectoral analysis to develop a comprehensive and common understanding of the interdependence of the SDGs across the peace, humanitarian and development nexus. Therefore, the CCA provides a good overview of the UN comparative advantage and facilitates the development of strategic interventions both at national as well as at local levels. Through the pooling of data and blending of technical resources in the CCA process, UNCTs seek to develop an integrated strategic analysis that identifies a clear set of unifying and collective outcomes with the potential to advance national development across the widest possible range of the SDGs<sup>2</sup>.

#### 1.2 OBJECTIVES OF THE CCA

The objective of the One UN Rwanda CCA is to provide an independent and mandate-based articulation of the country context, opportunities and challenges, encompassing sustainable development, human rights,

gender equality, peace and security and humanitarian perspectives, with the view to inform UN's programmatic priorities for the next 5 years. The sector analysis will aim to<sup>3</sup>:

- I. Determine the development situation in terms of key sector outcomes disaggregated by beneficiaries, geographical coverage and any other equity dimensions, guided by the UNDAP programming principles.
- II. Highlight the underlying causes and challenges related to the development situation and reported outcomes with regards to;
  - i. The extent to which sector analysis meets minimum standards to sufficiently inform UN prioritisation.
  - ii. Possible shortfalls in sector analysis (policies, strategy formulation, planning, implementation, reporting and funding) and indicate where additional analysis may be required to inform UN interventions, as well as data availability.
  - iii. Identification of key areas and opportunities where UN's interventions can add value in particular regarding the UN's normative agenda i.e. policy dialogue, Rights, Gender, Sustainability, Resilience.
- III. Based on the UN Comparative advantage, identify the national priorities as per the National Strategy for Transformation (NST) to provide strategic direction for the One UN in Rwanda.
- IV. Assess the One UN's capacity and comparative advantage.

#### 1.2.1 APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY

The CCA was conducted between June and September 2017 using multi-method data collecting techniques including desktop reviews of relevant background information and collecting both secondary and primary data through reviewing different sector reports and analyses, in-depth and semi-structured interviews, only where applicable. The CCA was conducted in four consecutive phases including; the planning and strategizing phase; Data gathering; Data analysis and report synthesis, Presentation and validation.

This initial phase commenced with in-depth consultations with key individuals of the UNCT's to establish their expectations from the CCA, its history, communication goals and business environment. The consultations were conducted face-to-face, via telephone and email. The strategizing aspect of this phase included detailing of the scope of work to establish data source and research questions. At this stage mapping of available data and finalisation of data gathering tools was done.

The CCA data-gathering phase has been structured under key information need areas (themes). Guided by the UN programming principles, the CCA analysed the cross-cutting themes structuring the context analysis, and detailed how available data was identified and incorporated into an evidence base, how country risk profiling will be done and national policy and institutional frameworks will be analysed, gender assessments done and the financial landscape assessed in the local context.

Using the SDGs framework the CCA's data collection process was structured into **FIVE** key thematic areas that will define the national context through consideration of data availability, civil, cultural, socioeconomic, environmental and political concerns. The process will also integrate an analysis of the interlinkages between the themes as well as identify accelerating factors.

The country context thematic areas analysed in this CCA report include; Socio-economic situation; State institutions and political situation; Human rights and gender equality; Climate change and environment; and Peace-humanitarian-development nexus.

#### 2. COUNTRY OVERVIEW

Rwanda is a land locked country situated on the borders of Central Africa and East Africa, with a total surface area of 26,338 km<sup>2</sup>. The country has a total population of 11,533,446 people, population density of 421 persons per square kilometre and high population growth rate of 2.6 percent, which could bring the population to 16 million by 2020 if this rate is maintained. Rwanda has a Human Development Index of 0.498 as of 2015, ranking the country 27<sup>th</sup> in Africa and 159 out of 188 countries globally<sup>4</sup>. The population is majorly youthful with 39 percent comprising people between the ages of 14 and 35 years<sup>5</sup>. Rwanda has

had a unique context in the history of Africa. With the 1994 genocide against the Tutsis, the country lost an estimated one million people. Subsequently. more women were left as widows and children became orphans and were forced into work for their survival. In addition, millions of Rwandans who were in exile for several decades returned to the country following the liberation further aggravating population pressure challenges. Despite its tragic history Rwanda continues to be recognised as one of Africa's success stories.

#### 2.1 ECONOMIC PERFORMANCE

Boosted by an average annual economic growth rate of more than 10 percent in the decade after 1995, this momentum has been sustained culminating in sustained economic growth (8 percent average), poverty reduction (12 percent points) and a reduction in income inequality<sup>6</sup>. Remarkable socio-economic progress has been made over the last two decades demonstrated by a 312 percent increase in per capita GDP from \$206 in 2002 to \$729 in 2016 while resisting any inflationary pressure, majorly attributed to the GoR's successful management of the economy. The average realized growth for the period 2013-2016 was 6.8 percent against a target of 9.7 percent for the mid-term period. Meanwhile, poverty dropped from 44.9 percent in 2010/11 (EICV 3) to 39.1 percent in 2013/14 (EICV 4).





Rwanda continues to be a top performer in the region and globally. The country's economic performance has remained strong, with the 2016 GDP growth rate of 5.9 percent (services contributed 3.4 percent, industry 1.2 percent, agriculture 1.1 percent and taxes less subsidies on products 0.3 percent), compared to 5.8 percent in Kenya, and 4.6 percent in Uganda. The growth has been mainly driven by the services sector, with somewhat lower growth in agriculture due to the repeated droughts, and a contraction in manufacturing and construction following the end of the 2014/16-infrastructure investment boom. The consumer price inflation increased by 6 percent, due mainly to higher food prices and depreciation of the Rwandan franc, but continues to be the lowest in the East African Community.

The 14<sup>th</sup> edition of the World Bank 2016 Ease of Doing Business Report ranked Rwanda second after Mauritius in Africa and 56<sup>th</sup> out of 190 countries globally, improving six places since the 2015 edition of the report<sup>7</sup>, a testimony to strong national efforts to promote policy reforms geared at attracting private investment. However, with 57.3 percent of Rwandans involved in subsistence agriculture, the GoR recognizes that the economy needs structural transformation if it is to maintain the current economic growth pattern.

Strong and balanced economic performance has been derived from sustained growth across all sectors of the economy. Services have been the main driver of growth. Out of the 49 core EDPRS 2 indicators, 47 were assessed. 16 (34 percent) were achieved, 13 (26 percent) are on-track, 16 (32 percent) are on-watch<sup>I</sup> and 2 (4 percent) are lagging behind. 2 (4 percent) indicators were not assessed due to lack of data. Accountable Governance and productivity and youth employment had the highest number (50 percent) of achieved targets, followed by foundational and crosscutting issues (38 percent), economic transformation (36 percent) and rural development (14 percent).

Overall Rwanda's real GDP grew by over 7.3 percent between 2010 and 2016 and 8.2 percent during 2000 – 2010. Agriculture grew on average by 5.5 percent while industry and services have grown by 9.4 percent and 9.5 percent respectively during 2000 - 2016. Agriculture contribution to GDP has declined from 37 percent in 2000 to 30 percent in 2016, while services increased marginally from 47 to 48 and industry from 33 percent to 17 percent over the same period.





#### Figure 2: Share of GDP by kind of activity, 2016

Although these economic trends are promising, Rwanda is far from attaining its primary Vision 2020 goal to transform from a subsistence agricultural economy to middle–income, services and knowledge-based society, with a vibrant class of entrepreneurs.

#### 2.2 SOCIO-ECONOMIC SITUATION

The socio-economic situation theme of the CCA provides a description of the economic situation of Rwanda as well as poverty and other sustainable development challenges of the country context. Economic sectors covered in this section of the CCA include regional and international trade, private sector development, ICT, infrastructure and urbanisation, financial sector, agriculture and decent work. The social sectors broadly addressed include social protection, health, WASH and education. Under each of these broad sectors, the situation in different sub-sectors is also described and circumstances surrounding

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> On-track: EDPRS II targets that have been 90-100 percent achieved, On-Watch: Targets that have been 50-90 percent achieved, Lagging behind: Targets below 50 percent achievement

inequality, discrimination and vulnerability among others are explained as part of the analysis of underlying issues for prioritisation.

#### 2.2.1 PRIVATE SECTOR DEVELOPMENT

Rwanda has achieved tremendous growth of its private sector over the last 15 years with a 103 percent increase in large private establishments (100+ workers) being the most notable growth. Between 2011 and 2014 micro (1-3 workers), small (4 -30 workers) and medium (31 -100 workers) private establishments increased by 24 percent, 28 percent and 19 percent respectively. The percentage increase of establishments is higher in rural areas (38.1 percent) compared to urban areas (7.3 percent)<sup>8</sup>. In 2015 alone the Rwanda Development Board (RDB) registered 144 businesses worth USD\$ 1,078 billion while in 2016, 28,078 business were registered. The 2016 doing business report attributes this progress to mainly new reforms including business registration, acquisition of construction permits, property registration, and cross-border trade, among others, which spur Rwanda's competitiveness, attract new investments into the country and support existing enterprises. A new Investment Code was adopted in 2015 among other things, to promote private investments in the EDPRS II strategic sectors. As part of the National Industrial Policy's implementation, the GoR is developing infrastructure and other required services for the Kigali Special Economic Zone (KSEZ) and industrial parks across the country and these interventions have already attracted private investment in key sectors such as construction materials, light manufacturing, agro processing and agribusiness<sup>9</sup>. The GoR is also developing infrastructure and other services in six secondary cities to transform these trade and transport corridors into regional growth poles and centers of local economic development. The EDPRS II target of private investment contributing 13 percent to GDP has been slightly surpassed achieving 13.3 percent so has the Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) as share of GDP increased from 2.3 percent in 2014 to 4.1 percent in 2017<sup>10</sup>.

Overall, there is a comparatively rapid shift from employment towards high value-added sectors in Rwanda. There are signs of emerging structural changes in the overall economy with the contribution of agriculture to the GDP declining from 37 percent to 30 percent between 2000 and 2016. In the period 2011-14 the annual decline in the share of employment in agriculture remained at 1 percent per annum and most of the jobs created over this period occurred in industry (0.66 percent) rather than services (0.33 percent)<sup>8</sup>. However, being a landlocked country far from sea makes it extremely difficult for Rwanda to achieve its industrial sectors' economies of scale. Thus, the country is more focused on development of the services sector, as such the increase in services contribution, though marginal, keeps increasing with the current share of GDP standing at 48 percent. Business tourism and improving agricultural productivity (promoting competitive value chains) are among the key drivers of the services sector. As part of the priorities to achieving its services sector objective, Rwanda has prioritized increasing the external connectivity of its economy and boosting exports. The GoR has committed large resources in expanding its national airline, RwandAir, and developing the Meetings, Incentives, Conferences, and Exhibitions (MICE) strategy and is in the process of securing financing for a new airport. This increased focus on connectivity and business tourism has resulted in the international passenger arrivals doubling from 2010 - 2015 to over 1.3 million visitors and annual tourist revenue increased from US \$202 million in 2010 to over US \$400 million in 2016<sup>11</sup>. However, the exports sub-sector has not performed as anticipated with the country not achieving its EDPRS II target of 21.1 percent (US \$2,0538 million) and achieving only 15.3 percent (US \$1,369 million) share of GDP in 2016. More action needs to be done to cover an ever-growing trade deficit estimated at US\$ 1.3 billion in 201610.

Despite the considerable growth of the private sector and substantial contribution of services to Rwanda's economic development, various factors continue to constrain potential growth of the private/services sector. Services skills in Rwandan workforce need continuous upgrading to meet regional and international competitive standards. Improvements have been made to the average level of secondary and higher education, but enrollment and completion remain low, and repetition and dropout remain higher than the

Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) averages. To address this challenge, the GoR has allowed the free flow of labor into Rwanda from other EAC countries, in particular, Kenya and Uganda and made substantial adjustments to the national curriculum at all levels by introducing a competence-based education curriculum, however, its roll out is still nascent and its results not yet sufficiently evident.

Public sector investment has been pivotal to the achievements of Rwanda's private sector. Rwanda has been particularly astute in channeling scarce foreign resources into productive investments. Between 2010 and 2014 the country's public investment ratio averaged 12 percent of GDP and stood at 11 percent in 2016, making it one of the countries in Africa with the highest average public capital spending, only rivaled by Mozambique and Burundi<sup>12</sup>. Despite the commendable public sector investments in private sector development, this has led to the sharp rise in public debt from 18 percent of GDP in 2012 to a projection of 47.1 percent by 2018<sup>11</sup>, implying limited room for further government borrowing.

Stimulating private investment in Rwanda remains a challenge mainly because of the size of the economy, limited availability of raw materials and land-lockedness. The GoR is trying to address this through regional integration. EAC regional integration is seen as an opportunity for Rwanda to reduce barriers to private sector investment by increasing size of the markets, lowering the costs of imports and improving connectivity in terms of land-transportation. The GoR has so far been successful in lowering non-tariff barriers and is in the process of establishing a dry port in Kigali to ease in traffic transit through Kigali to Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC). Despite this progress, challenges in the cost of doing business and size of markets continue to impede private sector development in Rwanda.

Over the past two years, credit to the private sector in Rwanda increased at a more rapid pace than in any of its peers in the East African region reaching 19.2 percent in 2016 from 11.8 percent in 2009 (averaging 13 percent per annum) in real terms. Although this credit deepening suggests an increasingly important role of the private sector in Rwanda's economic growth it raises the stakes for maintaining financial stability.

#### 2.2.2 REGIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL TRADE

Increasing the external connectivity of Rwanda's economy was one of the key priority areas under the economic transformation pillar of the EDPRS II. Being a land-locked country, trade facilitation and regional integration have remained a key focus of the GoR in order to enhance the country's ability to connect with regional and global markets. As part of these endeavours, key projects have been completed and others commenced during the second EDPRS timeframe. Following the admission of Rwanda into the EAC in 2007 the customs union and common market protocols were ratified in 2004 and 2010 respectively and are currently being enforced. The common market provides for: free movement of goods, persons, services, capital and labour and right of establishment and of residence. The common market protocol allows workers from any partner State to accept employment within any other EAC country. The different states are at different levels of implementation of the common market protocol with Rwanda and Kenya being the most advanced having abolished work permits' fees for EAC nationals working in the two countries. Also using ILO classifications, both states have opened their labour markets to professionals and technicians and associate Professionals in Rwanda<sup>13</sup>.

Since 2000, imports and exports have increased their combined share of the economy from 31 percent to 48 percent. Exports alone have realised rapid growth rates of 13.2 percent per year between 2000 and 2016<sup>14</sup>. Consequently the export base share of the economy has increased from 6 percent to 15 percent over the last 16 years. Services exports have seen growth of 16.3 percent per year, while goods exports grew by 10.6 per cent per year<sup>15</sup>. Imports have seen lower growth rates than exports, averaging 10 percent per year and increasing their share of the economy from 25 percent to 33 percent<sup>16</sup>. However, for the past few years, the share has been relatively constant. This growth in global and regional trade is primarily a result of Rwanda's intensified collaboration with regional partners through the EAC, Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa (COMESA), Northern Corridor Initiative, and Economic Community of

Central African (ECCAS) leading to improved trade procedures and significantly reduced time and costs of maritime trade.

To increase external connectivity and ease exports and re-exports from Rwanda, the national carrier, RwandAir fleet increased from 5 to 12 aircrafts between 2005 and 2017 while network destinations increased from 12 to 23, Kigali International and Kamembe Airports were upgraded and renovated to accommodate traffic growth, Bugesera International Airport construction project commenced in August 2017 and the first phase of the project is expected to be completed in 2019. Meanwhile, the Dar es Salaam-Isaka-Kigali/Keza-Musongati (DIKKM) Railway Project is currently under Public Private Partnership (PPP) transaction phase. In regards to logistics systems management, Rwanda aims to become a regional trade logistics centre with establishment of US \$40 million dry port. To achieve this, a 25-year concession was awarded to Dubai Port World to finance, develop and manage the facility in Masaka, Kigali. The inland port that will be completed in 2018 will link the Northern and Central corridors. In addition, 5 modern One Stop Border Posts (OSBPs) were constructed at Rubavu, Kagitumba, Rusumo, Nemba, and Ruhwa and Works for Gatuna and Bweyeye border posts are on-going<sup>17</sup>.

Subsequently, 244 Non-tariff barriers (NTBs) have been gradually eliminated between 2013-2017, and the impact on cost and time of trading across borders is as follows: transit time from Mombasa to Kigali is now between 5 and 6 days from 21 days in 2010, while transit time from Dar es Salaam to Kigali has been reduced from 17 days in 2010 to between 3 and 5 days<sup>18</sup>. In addition, the cost of transporting a 20-foot container from Mombasa to Kigali has been reduced from 6,595 USD in 2010 to 4,833 USD in 2015. The cost from Dar es Salaam to Kigali has been reduced from 4,990 USD in 2010 to 4,740 USD in 2015. The turnaround time for trucks has moved from 1 trip to between 2 and 3 return trips per month from Kigali to the ports<sup>17</sup>.

Despite the substantial growth in the private sector and public investment in policy and infrastructure aimed at increasing external connectivity and boosting Rwanda's regional and international trade, exports as a percentage of GDP reached 15.3 percent in 2016, well short of the 21.1 percent target. This shortage has been attributed to mainly global commodity prices shocks, especially coffee and minerals and regional instability that affected both Rwanda's exports and realisation of key regional infrastructure projects intended to boost connectivity.

Further more, Rwanda has not yet been able to compete with its neighbouring countries closer to the seas. Over the last 15 years while Rwanda's exports to Uganda have been able to increase to 18 percent of its total exports, Rwanda remains a net-importer of Uganda's exports. Conversely, it has been successful in exporting (mainly re-exports) to DRC which accounts for 26 percent of Rwanda's total exports<sup>11</sup>. However, many of these exports are low value-added products, as only limited transformation occurs in Rwanda. This is worsened by the competition with overseas products that are often competitively priced and higher quality.

#### 2.2.3 INFRASTRUCTURE, URBANISATION AND TRANSPORT

EDPRS II recognised Rwanda's high growth rate and increasing population density's pressure on the country's connectivity infrastructure and natural resources, in particular land. It is line with this situation that the strategy hinged components of the country's economic transformation on soft and hard infrastructure development, primarily energy generation, access to public goods and strengthening value chain inter-linkages.

Rwanda produced 185.08 MW of electricity in 2016 from both on and off grid sources and total installed capacity in 2017 is 208 MW<sup>19</sup>. These achievements are attributed to GoR led interventions as well as private sector investments such as GIGAWAT (8.5 MW), Nyabarongo 1 Hydro-Power Plant and KivuWatt (25

MW)<sup>17</sup>. Others in the pipeline include Hakan and the scaling up of methane gas extraction from the Kivu project. Although the total electricity generated is way below the EDPRS II target of 563 MW the total supply has been able to match both the industrial and households demand, indicating the need to boost Rwanda's manufacturing and industrial sectors to operate optimally. More still, most of the energy projects are implemented and managed by foreign contractors due to the limited local capacity to handle complex energy infrastructure projects.

To accelerate access to electricity, water, roads and land by priority sectors the GoR established a public institutions coordination mechanism to ensure provision of basic infrastructure to priority investment areas. As a result, in 2016 electricity connections to priority areas stood at: 25 water pumping stations, 324 markets, 34 milk collection centres, 16 irrigation sites, and 171 telecom towers across the country<sup>20</sup>. Also having identified the cost of electricity as one of the bottlenecks to competitiveness of Rwanda's private sector, industrial electricity tariffs were lowered to a regional competitive level of ¢11-12/kWh.

	Plant type	Installed Capacity (MW)	Contribution per source (percent)
1	On-Grid hydropower	103.73	56
2	Diesel generators	51.8	28
3	Methane gas	28.6	15
4	Solar	8.75	5
5	Off-grid generation	1.7	1
6	Imports	15.5	8
	Total	185.08	100

Table 1: Electricity generation mix for Rwanda, 2016

Source: Sida, GOR, Energy Mapping Study in Rwanda, 2016

To further streamline priority investment areas' access to basic infrastructure the KSEZ was completed and is fully operational with basic infrastructure and amenities. Phase one of KSEZ is fully booked, while phase II (178 ha) is currently at 97 percent completion stage and already has 77.5 percent of the plots booked. Additionally, four Provincial Industrial Parks are under development. These are located in Bugesera (330 ha) in Eastern Province, Huye (50 ha) in Southern Province, and Rusizi (57 ha) and Nyabihu (44 ha) in Western Province. MINEACOM is also developing district industrial parks in Musanze, Rwamagana, Nyagatare and Muhanga. These SEZs aim to put together main factories to boost local production through increased manufacturing and agro-processing capacity<sup>17</sup>.

However, major focus on SEZs has contributed to other productive areas such as irrigation schemes, mining sites, markets, milk collection centres, water pumping sites not being accorded sufficient attention and data collected is also not disaggregated for detailed analysis of the progress in these other area.

Urbanization and Rural Settlement aims to help achieve good living conditions in urban and rural settlements by providing public services, quality infrastructure, thus contributing to economic development and poverty reduction in the country. Infrastructure development in Rwanda is cognisant of the importance of good urban and development management, which is inclusive, involves participation in planning and focuses on the facilitation of economic activity while safeguarding the built and unbuilt environment for liveability, and to the establishment of a comprehensive planning system and principles.

Over the years most urban growth has concentrated in the City of Kigali, however, after Vision 2020 and EDPRS I highlighted urbanization as one of the driving forces of economic growth, strategic measures now prioritize the development of six Secondary Cities; Rubavu, Musanze, Huye, Rusizi, Nyagatare and Muhanga, for the purpose of deconcentrating socio-economic development to the whole country through pointed public investment, and in order to attract private investment. Along with these strategic measures, following the creation of the urbanisation and urbanisation and rural resettlement sector under the EDPRS II various policies including the national urbanisation policy, national housing policy, national road map for green secondary city development, and national informal urban settlement upgrading strategy, among

others have been developed in the last six years to ensure a streamlined and coordinated approach to urbanisation and human settlement.

Progress in land use management and administration has been marked by establishment of a comprehensive legal framework for the inclusive registration and management of land, and creation of a national database for property records and land use maps. This has provided a foundation for accelerated urbanization. Even though planned settlement and urbanisation targets of the EDPRS II were not achieved, significant progress has been realised whereby 55.8 percent of households in Rwanda live in planned settlements against a target of 70 percent by 2017/18, while only 17.3 percent of Rwanda's population live in urban areas, against a target of 30 percent<sup>21</sup>. Also 29 out of the 30 districts in Rwanda have developed master plans in accordance with the 2015 urbanisation policy. During the second EDPRS period, construction projects worth over US \$1,800,000 have been implemented, 12 ha of land have been acquired in secondary cities and at least 616 houses were under construction against a target of 6,000 houses by 2016. Meanwhile, commercial bank lending to mortgages reached its highest in 2016 with mortgages accounting for 36.6 percent of total loans<sup>22</sup>. In 2017, the GoR established an affordable housing financing fund worth about US \$250 Million as initial capital to subsidise mortgage loans and provide funding to private developers at low interest. The facility will cap interest rates for mortgage loans at 10 percent from 17 percent and provide a guarantee facility for developers, producers of locally made construction materials and any investors going into affordable residential housing.

There has been significant progress with regards to rural settlement particularly with the establishment of Integrated Development Programme (IDP) model villages. Each secondary city has at least two completed model villages. The World Bank and GoR have over the last years jointly prepared the Rwanda Urban Development Program (RUDP) for implementation 2016-2021, implementing it through a loan of US \$95 Million. The finances are for implementation of infrastructure investment projects in the six secondary cities and one neighbourhood in the City of Kigali, paired with technical support aiming at local economic development and capacity development<sup>23</sup>. To ensure services reach secondary cities, the following roads have been upgraded: Ngororero-Mukamira (55km), Rusumo-Kayonza (92km), Kayonza-Kagitumba (116km), Muhanga- Karongi (78km), Rusizi-Bugarama (38.4km), Musanze-Rubavu (67 km), Kicukiro-Nemba (61 km), Kigali-Huye-Akanyaru (157km). Other roads have been approved for rehabilitation and widening for FY 2017/18. A total of 20 bus parks were constructed countrywide including: Nyanza-Kicukiro, Giporoso, Nyabugogo, Kimironko, Kabuga, Muhanga, Nyanza, Huye, Nyamagabe, Ruhango, Gicumbi, Rusizi, Rubavu, Mukamira, Ngororero, Musanze, Kayonza, Nyagatare, Ngoma, Nyakarambi and Nyamata. As part of implementing the smart city agenda, an automated fare collection system for public transport buses was also introduced as well as routes bundling/zoning in the City of Kigali and countrywide to enhance efficiency of public transport services <sup>17</sup>.

The progress registered in urbanisation has not come without significant challenges as reflected in the sectors failure to meet the EDPRS II targets. The shortfall has been attributed to various challenges in the sector including the high mortgage interest rates and high cost of land and construction materials that are mainly imported. Financing and supply options for affordable housing is lagging behind owing to delays in the development of the necessary financing mechanisms, notwithstanding the modest progress registered by 2017. Also, adherence to the master plans has been limited owing to limited capacity of the one-stop centres at district level. Only 11 out of 30 one-stop centres are fully operational with critical staff and basic office equipment.

#### 2.2.4 INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY

The information and communication technology (ICT) sector in Rwanda has realised not only unwavering progress especially since 2000 but has continually risen in importance from a department in the office of the president till 2009 when an autonomous ministry was created and the Rwanda Information Society

Authority (RISA) established in 2017 to implement all ICT policies and strategies. Also Rwanda hosts the SMART Africa Headquarter in Kigali since 2016. Under the EDPRS II ICT was positioned as a key crosscutting priority under the productivity and youth employment thematic area focusing on enhancing productivity in the private and public sectors. However, achievements to date indicate the sector has not only contributed beyond this anticipated scope but also been elevated to a position of one of the key drivers of Rwanda's socio-economic development. Overall ICT development in Rwanda has been guided by the Smart Rwanda Master plan (SRMP) 2016 -2020 that has set the scene for the strategy currently being undertaken with an overarching goal of transforming Rwanda into a Knowledge based economy. The SRMP, adopted in 2015, drew its orientation from the Smart Africa Manifesto that was launched during the Transform Africa Summit in October 2013 where the African Union Heads of State signed the SMART Africa Manifesto in Kigali. The plan is currently halfway its implementation.

The ICT Gross Value Addition (GVA) for Rwanda grew at an average of 21.1 percent annually over the period 2000-2015 and the telecom sector alone generated a total investment of RWF 590.4 Billion over the period 2001-2015. The GVA of the ICT sector has grown at a much faster rate than any other sector of the economy that has grown at an average of only 5-8 percent over the same period. The telecom subsector remains the largest contributor to the ICT sector (75 percent) with 3 telecoms operators and 16 Internet service providers (ISPs), but the ICT services industry contribution is also growing at fast rate. However, the growth in the ICT sector is majorly attributed to the GoR public investments in the sector, which account for 83 percent of the budget allocation in the period 2011-16. As a result of the public and private investments, between 2011 and 2017 internet penetration in Rwanda increased from 7 percent to 39.8 percent, mobile phone penetration from 33 percent to 79.2 percent, mobile phone subscribers increased from 639,673 to 9,735,694 and the value of mobile money transactions rose from RWF 51 billion to RWF 1,040 billion. 4G LTE introduced in 2013 following an agreement signed between the GoR and Korea Telecom has been rolled out to cover 64.3 percent of the country. In 2014, the GoR signed an agreement with the Latin American multinational POSITIVO and established a local computer manufacturing plant. Since July 2015, POSITIVO BGH plant has so far assembled 95,580 laptops as of July 2017, including 24,180 XO (OLPCII) and 71,400 mini-laptops. In line with the Smart cities program Wi-Fi is now provided in public spaces and over 485 public transportation buses in Kigali city. In 2014, Rwanda completed migration from analog to digital terrestrial television that resulted in the increase of the number of TV stations from one to 12. As part of digitisation of public services, Irembo, an online portal, was established in 2014 and has so far digitised 56 e-services and has up to 1,445,186 transactions per month<sup>24</sup>.

Globally, Rwanda's ICT ranks highly in areas of promotion and regulation but other critical indices remain average as follows; Global ICT development index (150/175)<sup>25</sup>, Network Readiness Index (80/139)<sup>26</sup> and eGovernment index (138/193)<sup>27</sup>. The encumbered performance of Rwanda's ICT sector universally reflected by the global indices indicates the continued need to address challenges in bridging the digital divide by accelerating broadband access, adoption and usage of all citizens.

The tremendous progress and achievements realised by Rwanda's ICT sector have not been reached without challenges. Some of the key bottlenecks affecting the sector's growth and utilisation include; low digital literacy (8.4 percent), low production of local content in local language affecting usage by citizens, high cost local hosting, low device and internet penetration (39.8 percent) with a higher geographical divide between rural and urban areas, low electricity penetration (27 percent) and high cost of broad band and smart devices. More still, realisation of returns from the ICT sector requires substantial upfront investments which are not affordable from the ordinary budget allocations, which limits the public sector's ability to address most of the identified challenges. It is therefore, the reason the next phases of national development

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>II</sup> One Laptop Per Child

should focus on addressing these challenges in order to sustain the gains from the ICT sector thus far.

#### 2.2.5 INDUSTRIALISATION

Rwanda's industrial sector is gradually taking a more important role in the economy with its contribution to GDP increasing from 16.1 percent in 2013 to 17.6 percent in 2016. However, industry, specifically, manufacturing, plays a smaller role in the Rwanda economy than elsewhere in sub-Saharan Africa. Manufacturing is considerably below other East African countries but its importance in Rwanda in terms of output share in the GDP (6.0 percent) is closing in on the average for low-income developing countries (7.7 percent)<sup>11</sup>. 36 percent of output from industry has been contributed by the formal sector, implying the existence of a large informal sector (64 percent). Rwanda's investment strategy recognises the challenges in stimulating manufacturing in the country's land locked context and therefore focuses mostly on agriculture and services.

Most of the growth realised in the industry sector in the last three years is mainly attributed to the buoyant construction sector (51.2 percent) that has seen the commencement and completion of major public and private infrastructure projects. Thus as the construction boom stabilises, the industry sector can be expected to also drop. Manufacturing contributed 33.1 percent and mining 11.2 percent of the sectors output in 2015<sup>28</sup>. This trend has been the same since 2006 with agro-processing dominating the manufacturing output as shown in the figure below.



Figure 3: Composition of Rwanda's manufacturing sector output (2006 -2015)

To ensure continual growth of the sector, GoR has put in place upbeat strategies such as the "Made in Rwanda" campaign that aims to promote production and consumption of locally produced goods and institutional arrangements have been strengthened especially with the creation of National Industrial Research and Development Agency (NIRDA) in 2013 to reinforce implementation of the national industrial development policy. Also, the industrial policy has placed more focus on processing and value addition, with a particular emphasis on textiles, mineral processing, construction, light manufacturing as well as diversified tourism. Rwanda is also developing specific strategies to supplement export earnings and is focusing on light manufacturing (garments, shoes) and mining. It is also developing a policy of import substitution to conserve on foreign exchange needs and has identified cement, basic clothing, rice and sugar as products with the most potential of displacing imports <sup>11</sup>.

Key strategies geared at fostering industrial exports by the GoR have included setting up of special economic zones and reformulation of investment incentives for the industries. The new investment code that prioritizes exports and industrial manufacturing, among other key sectors, has introduced corporate income tax reduction among its incentives. Investments of US \$10 million can exempt a company from corporate income taxes, with a US \$50 million investment unlocking a seven-year tax holiday. Also all industrial manufacturing investors within SEZs that opt to be part of the Economic Processing zone and

are able to export no less than 80 percent of their production are able to obtain exemptions from VAT, import duties and corporate taxes<sup>29</sup>. These incentives not only aim to attract investment into manufacturing but also lower the cost of doing business for industries which remain among the key challenges of growth and sustenance of the sector.

The costs and delays related to mainly production and transportation of both imports and exports are among the main challenges of industry in Rwanda. Until 2015, the cost of electricity was among the major constraints for the industry sector with 1 kWh costing between 30 – 50 cents, which is relatively higher than Rwanda's neighbouring countries, Uganda (16), Tanzania (17) and Kenya (22)<sup>11</sup>. This mainly affected the competiveness of the industries. However, since 2016 the cost of electricity for industry and services has been lowered to ¢11-12/kWh to address mainly issues in competitiveness. Nevertheless, the persistent issue to date is the availability of electricity that has been attributed to inadequate transmission capacity. More still, the high cost of transportation adds to the cost of imported inputs. The 2016 trade logistics component of the 2016 World Bank's doing business indicators ranks Rwanda 156, below the Sub Saharan Africa average, with the cost and time taken to import goods as a major deterrent<sup>30</sup>.

#### 2.2.6 FINANCIAL SECTOR

The GoR adopted the Financial Sector Development Program in 2008 as Rwanda's long-term financial sector development strategy. The overarching goal of the FSDP is to develop a stable and sound financial sector that is sufficiently deep and broad, capable of efficiently mobilising and allocating resources to address the development needs of the economy and reduce poverty. The second phase of the strategy that commenced in 2013 comprised four main programs including: financial inclusion; developing financial institutions, markets and the supporting infrastructure; investment and savings to transform the economy; protecting consumers and maintaining financial stability. It is these components that comprise the financial sector (banks, microfinance institutions, insurance and pensions), with exception of the Rwanda Stock Exchange (RSE) that has been under The Capital Markets Authority (CMA) since 2011. As such, BNR is responsible for the legal and regulatory framework for the financial sector which is constantly undergoing improvements and revisions due to the dynamic nature of the sector.

Financial inclusion is the second most progressive component of financial sector strategy with at least 41 percent of its planned policy actions completed or going on<sup>31</sup>. Most progress is in the areas of capacity building for Savings and Credit Co-operatives (SACCOs) and Micro Finance Institutions (MFIs) and strengthening access to finance programs such as Association of Micro finance institutions in Rwanda (AMIR) and FinScope 2015/16 and considerable advances in the financial education and literacy including the conclusion of the national financial literacy strategy. Sustained growth in microfinance and mobile financial services has contributed most to financial inclusion in Rwanda. Total assets of microfinance institutions almost doubled from end-2013 to 2016, while deposits increased by 65 percent over the same period. The rapid increase in microfinance activities, in particular through Umurenge SACCOs, has been one of the drivers of financial inclusion in Rwanda.

The 2016 FINSCOPE survey indicates a significant overall increase in financial access of the adult population over the past four years, from 72 percent in 2012 to 89 percent in 2016, with 68 percent being formally banked and 21 percent informal<sup>32</sup>. Uptake of mobile financial services peaked with 9,735,694 users and the value of mobile money transactions rose from RWF 51 billion to RWF 1,040 billion between 2011 and 2017. Nearly one million users had subscribed for mobile banking services, and the value of total e-payments rose to more than 30 percent of GDP between 2011 and 2016. Overall Rwanda is among the leading countries in the region in creating an enabling regulatory environment for financial inclusion, coming in the 8th position among low-income developing countries<sup>33</sup>.

Financial institutions, markets and the supporting infrastructure, register significant progress with at least 51 percent of planned policy actions completed or on going<sup>34</sup>. This is mainly attributed to advancements realised in the growth of the banking sector, the capital markets - especially in the issuance of government bonds, passing of the pension law, separation of life and non-life insurance that have contributed to growth in the insurance sector and achievement of almost all targets in development of the payments systems. However, the Rwandan financial sector is still fairly simple structured. Total assets of the system increased from 31 to 54 percent of GDP in December 2016, in the face of strong economic growth that averaged 7.8 percent per year over the same period. The financial sector remains dominated by commercial banks, which hold two thirds of financial assets, followed by the pension fund, insurance, and microfinance. There is notable progress in the Rwanda banking sector with the growth in the number of commercial banks from six to nine foreign owned and from two to three locally owned, one cooperative bank and five microfinance banks from four and one development bank between 2011 and 2016<sup>34</sup>. Even though foreign owned banks dominate the banking system, funding of banks is overwhelmingly domestic and comes mainly from deposits, which limits upstream vulnerability from exposure to cross-border financing shocks.

Bank and non-bank financial institutions of Rwanda are mainly interconnected through bank liabilities. The biggest nonbank institution, Rwanda Social Security board (RSSB), does not appear to pose a risk to the banking system. For illustration, 33 percent of the pension fund's assets are comprised of bank deposits (24 percent) and bank equity (9 percent). Conversely, the pension fund contributes about 10 percent to banks' deposit funding<sup>11</sup>. Given these orders of magnitude, systemic risk will likely be channelled through the banking system rather than nonbank institutions.

The Rwanda stock exchange was established in 2005 and currently provides a platform for transactions of domestic and foreign shares as government and a few corporate bonds. The number of listed companies has risen from one local listed company in 2010 to four local and four cross-listings in 2017. The stock markets capitalisation was estimated at 26 percent of GDP as of 2016. Capital markets in Rwanda remain relatively undeveloped and the bond market, introduced in 2008, is shallow. While the size of the government primary market has increased, corporate sector participation remains depressed, with only two issuances in 2016. The market also lacks intermediaries (primary dealers) and is illiquid, as most investors hold securities to maturity, so there is next to no secondary market. To deepen the bond market, the authorities are implementing a seven-year capital markets plan. It includes an improved and more regular sovereign bond issuance program; measures that encourage retail and foreign investors; and professional capacity building<sup>35</sup>.

Overall, despite notable progress in Rwanda's financial sector, financial development indicators do not fully reflect the recent financial innovations, in particular microfinance and mobile financial services that have greatly impacted economic participation and small-scale enterprises. In addition, new internet-based alternative financing models present greater potential for enhancing financial inclusion and innovation but are proving more difficult to measure and regulate.

There also exists a fundamental mismatch between supply of financial services and quality of Financial Services Products (FSPs) compared to the demand, especially in the rural areas, implying products or delivery channels currently available may not necessarily fully respond to citizen's needs, especially for youth and Micro Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs).

Almost 50 percent Rwandans feel out of control with their borrowing and debt and a higher percentage confirms knowledge of different FSPs<sup>36</sup>. MSEs in the broad sense and potential youth and women entrepreneurs overall lack experience and understanding of FSPs and do not have the necessary technical skills to make successful loan applications. Financial products and delivery channels in rural areas remain to a large extent manual and cash-based.

58 percent of Rwandans still use informal financial services, and this uptake grew even faster than for formal services. More still, 55 percent save or invest in financial assets and only 26 percent in formal financial institution<sup>37</sup>. Close to 80 percent of Rwandans between the ages of 18 - 50 years (working ages) are without any form of social security, the Finscope report shows that out of the formally included, 7.3 percent had insurance/pension products of which 29.9 percent had pension/provident funds. This forms an inherent future risk for the Rwanda society. Without an effective policy response, poverty among the elderly may emerge as a dominant cause for increased poverty in Rwanda in the mid and long-term<sup>38</sup>.

#### 2.2.7 DECENT WORK FOR ALL

Rwandan citizens above the age of 16 years are considered to be part of working age population. Rwanda has a total population of 11,533,446 people of which 6,709,000 people are of working age including, 54 percent females and 46 percent males. 82 percent of the working age population lives in rural areas and only 18 percent reside in urban areas. The labour force consists of 3,636,000 people of which 3,019,00 people are employed and 607,000 are unemployed. Overall employment in Rwanda is high with at least 82.3 percent of the population in the labour force having work and 16.7 percent unemployed, indication that roughly for every six persons in the labour force one is unemployed. The unemployment rate was higher among women (17.5 percent) than among men (16.1 percent) and higher among young people (21.0) than among adults (13.3 percent). It was also higher in the urban areas (18.1 percent) than in the rural areas (16.2 percent)<sup>39</sup>.



#### Figure 4: Summary of Rwanda's labour force indicators

Source: NISR, Labour force survey, 2017

Employment in Rwanda is divided into formal and informal employment. Formal employment includes all workers in the public sector and registered civil society organisations (CSOs), and all private sector institutions, that meet their employees' statutory requirements including remission of pay as you earn taxes (PAYE) and social security contributions. No more than 9 percent of Rwanda's labour force is in formal employment. The government employs 2.9 percent in the public sector, these include workers in ministries, parastatal and districts. 0.3 percent are in CSOs which include local and international NGOs, foreign missions and international organisations. Only 5.8 percent are in the formal private sector. Formal employment is what qualifies as stable and remunerative in the Rwandan context. The majority of the workers in Rwanda fall in the informal employment category that accounts for at least 91 percent of the private sector employment. 80 percent of off-farm employment is in the informal economy and 17 percent

of the total labour-force works mostly in micro and small and medium enterprises (MSME)<sup>40</sup>. Majority of the jobs in the MSMEs and smallholder agriculture involves work at low productivity levels and earnings, and, therefore tend to offer vulnerable and unsustainable jobs.

The structure of employment in Rwanda is rapidly changing. Between 2011 and 2014 the percentage of the labour force employed in agriculture dropped from 72.5 percent to 67.6 percent. While the proportions employed in services increased from 21.1 percent to 23.8 percent and from 6.4 percent to 8.6 percent in industry. In this same period new business establishments increased by 34.5 percent with the highest employment being realised in the micro (50 percent) and large (27 percent) enterprises.

Rwanda's workforce is growing at a rate faster than ever before. It is estimated 125,000 new workers enter the labour market annually. The EDPRS II targeted to create 200,000 off farm jobs per year, however, this target has not been achieved as the EICV4 estimated that only 146,000 jobs are created per annum, a 62 percent increment from the 90,000 average recorded between 2006 - 2011<sup>41</sup>. Despite this significant increment, employment and productivity in Rwanda is still hampered by various challenges including high levels of underemployment in rural areas, insufficient creation of non-farm jobs and uncompetitive skilled labour for firms, especially in urban areas.

To address these challenges the GoR through various agencies such as the National Employment Programme (NEP) has increased focus on private sector development to address employment creation. NEP emphasises the transition to reliance on the private sector as the primary source of the additional jobs needed in the labour market. However, in order to realise this ambition the NEP also identifies low skills and productivity levels as a major constraint to employment promotion that needs to be addressed as a priority. Subsequently calling for, appropriate labour market interventions by Government in collaboration with the private sector to improve the efficiency of the functioning of labour market with respect to matching skills with jobs.

The education sector has been confronted in the recent years to ensure they address the challenge of producing graduates with skills and knowledge that do not match the labour markets' needs. This has resulted in steps by the GoR to overhaul the education system from primary to higher education. In 2015 the GoR introduced a competence curriculum in primary and secondary education, to align education methods and content to future employment needs of the nation and global economy. Additionally, tertiary education continues to expand with the country now having 17 public and 14 private universities and enrollment has increased by over 50,000 students. The most significant transformation in the education sector has been in the area of Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET). With the prioritisation of economic transformation and transition to more productive sectors such as manufacturing, ICT, mining, tourism and hospitality, construction and mining vocational training has been prioritised. TVET that has seen tremendous improvements in the last 5 years resulting in an increase of Vocational Training Centres (VTCs) across the country from less than 63 in 2010 to over 392 in 2016<sup>42</sup> and enrollment from 67,919 to 116,292 students between 2011 to 2016.

Employment promotion initiatives have been prominent in the Rwandan labour market planning and development landscape at national and local levels for the last decade with a multitude of stakeholders including, public and private sector organisations, donor agencies and NGOs. Most of the interventions are broadly classified into three themes based on their primary objectives - Entrepreneurship and Business development, Skills development and Labour market policy interventions<sup>43</sup>.

Entrepreneurship and Business development initiatives have targeted mainly young people and women, providing them with training to instil a culture of entrepreneurship, enhance financial literacy skills and assistance with business plan development and eventually facilitation in securing funding. The main actors in these initiatives are MINEACOM, MIFOTRA, RDB, Private Sector Federation (PSF) and Business Development Fund (BDF). The prominent interventions in this area have been the *Hanga Umurimo* 

Programme, Integrated Craft Production Centres (ICPCs)–*Udukiriro* and Business development Centres (BDCs). This has contributed to remarkable growth of MSMEs in Rwanda, reflected in revenue earnings were the largest share of PAYE paying enterprises was micro-sized businesses (48.3 percent) in 2015<sup>44</sup>.

Skills development initiatives have targeted both the unemployed and the employed through new skills and reconversion, short and long training programmes. The interventions here focus on mainly equipping people with skills on high demand in the local and regional markets that have not been adequately provided in the existing education system. Skills development is addressing both technical and soft skills through both training and more non-conventional techniques such as mentorship, internships, apprenticeships and exchange programmes<sup>45</sup>. Main actors in this area include; Workforce development authority (WDA), RDB, Capacity Development and Employment Services Board (CESB), PSF, Ministry of ICT (MINITEC). Notable programmes here include; Masaka Business Incubation Centre, KLab and YEGO centres.

Labour market policy interventions are addressing concerns in domestic, regional and global labour markets that constrain or facilitate creation and expansion of employment opportunities, decent work and workers rights, especially with regard to social protection. This area focuses on strengthening the body of knowledge of varying labour market conditions as a means to formulate appropriate labour market policies that strike a balance between labour market's flexibility and regulation. However, emphasis and priority has been on issues that can contribute to design and implementation of the employment creation agenda. Key actors in this area are Ministry of Public Service (MIFOTRA), PSF, GIZ, International labour Organisation (ILO), NISR, Ministry of East African Community, Trade and Industry (MINEACOM), and Ministry of foreign affairs (MINAFET). Key interventions in this area include; the Labour Market Information System (LMIS), Labour Intensive Public Works Programmes and the Kigali Employment Service Centre.

Ratification of the EAC common market protocol in 2010, created a regional mechanism for free movement of people, skills exchange, and information exchange on jobs and economic opportunities for all member states' citizens. Therefore, the mission of job creation is becoming regional rather than national. Dynamic labour markets are offering unprecedented choice and rewards for individuals with the skills and ready to take advantage of them.

Despite this progress in employment, various challenges still exist in the sector that hamper job creation and the overall decent work agenda. Some of the key challenges include; the youth population growing faster than the job creation rate, gender disparities in society including low levels of higher education enrollment and completion among females hindering women's engagement in more professional and productive employment, high shortage of employable skills, employment is significantly precarious and under-employment prevalent, the informal sector is rapidly growing while social security coverage in the sector remains low (only 6 percent of total working population covered)<sup>46</sup> and there is limited attention being paid to access to employment by special interest groups such as PWDs.

Overall there is more focus on the quantity of jobs being created on the Rwandan market but limited attention is paid to the quality of jobs. Subsequently, the decent work agenda has not been adequately mainstreamed in employment in Rwanda, for example occupational health and safety has not yet been given the required consideration, remuneration remains low (average monthly income is 55,934 RWF)<sup>39</sup>, workers unions are weak and child labour is still existent (9.3 percent)<sup>47</sup>.

#### 2.2.8 AGRICULTURE

Agriculture is the backbone of Rwanda's society and economy, with more than 80 percent of the population dependent on agriculture as a source of food and income, the sector employs 45.9 percent of the country's labour force and contributes 30 percent to the GDP. This makes the sector key to both food security and poverty reduction. Although the sector's contribution to GDP (-49.6 percent) and proportions of populations it employs (-33.7 percent) has dropped over the last 10 years, the sector remains central to the

structural transformation of Rwanda's economy by continually contributing to economic growth, exports, job creation and labour productivity.

The agriculture sector generates the main source of income for 69.7 percent of the population – particularly for women, who constitute 66 percent of the agricultural work force<sup>48</sup>. Further more, the poverty line in Rwanda is defined by access to the daily basket of foods that allow each person to consume 2,500 kcal per day. Hence, food prices have direct impact on the cost of living and food poverty line. At the 2014 consumer market prices, the cost of the poverty line was RWF 105,083 per person<sup>48</sup>. Fluctuations in agricultural commodity markets affect the consumer prices, and thereby food security and general living conditions of the poor. Therefore agricultural productivity growth combined with cheaper imported food commodities is crucial for socio-economic performance.

Despite the reduction in overall contribution to GDP, the agriculture sector has more than doubled since 2000 with an average annual growth rate of 5.3 percent. Food crops remain the dominant sub-sector in agriculture making up 58 percent of the sectors contribution to GDP, followed by Forestry (21 percent), Livestock (12 percent), traditional export crops (7 percent), and Fishery (1 percent)<sup>49</sup>. The exponential growth in the food crops sub-sector was mainly realised after the introduction of the Crop intensification program (CIP) in 2008. However, the immediate growth spurt was realised in 2008 – 2012 (6.6 percent per year) but the recent 2012 – 2016 experienced slight declines in growth rates (4.7 percent per year)<sup>49</sup>. Export crops have grown at 3.8 percent per year over the decade but with high volatility from year to year due to global price variations in especially tea, and coffee. Livestock growth averaged 5.2 percent per year and is currently the best performing sub-sector, growing at 8.3 percent per year since 2012.

The highest export crops growth rate was realised in the 2000 – 2004 period (12.9 percent) but drastically declined between 2004 and 2012 hitting a low of -1.4 percent. However, this trend has since recovered to an annual growth rate of 2.3 percent (2012 – 2016) making up 52 percent of Rwanda's total goods exports in 2016, equivalent to USD \$252 million<sup>50</sup>. Formal agriculture exports made up 65 percent of this total GDP contribution and continue to be dominated by coffee (35 percent), tea (39 percent) and agroprocessed exports (18 percent), predominantly milled products<sup>50</sup>. Other agro-exports included livestock, horticultural products and flowers are a new export. The GoR has increased emphasis and support to promote non-traditional exports, especially horticultural products, through mainly the National Agriculture Export promotions board (NAEB), MINEACOM and Rwanda Development Bank (BRD) by providing facilitation with initiatives such as the Export Growth Facility (EGF) which is a guarantee fund that aims to address export finance gaps in agriculture, particularly horticulture and agro-processing. However, progress in the agriculture exports sub-sector is still hampered by supply constraints among producers who continually fail to meet the high-volume of demand and required quality standards.

Given Rwanda's limited land size and fast growing population, land productivity is a critical factor in the country's sustainable development. Therefore, agricultural output per unit size of land needs to be optimal while ensuring commercial competiveness, food security in terms of both volume and nutrition and land resources need to be well managed as food security at house-hold level has not yet been achieved, with 20 percent of households still food insecure<sup>51</sup>. Balancing all these parameters is what development of the sector grapples with. The total cultivate land in 2016 was 1,371,602 ha with bananas (23 percent) as the main crop, followed by cassava (22 percent), beans (18 percent), maize (9 percent), sorghum (5 percent), sweet potatoes (5 percent), Irish potato, (4 percent) paddy rice (1.4 percent), soybeans (1.6 percent), wheat (0.4 percent) and others (10.6 percent)<sup>52</sup>.

In September 2007 (season 2008A), the ministry of agriculture and animal resources (MINAGRI) introduced the CIP to increase agricultural productivity, specifically food crops, under the second plan for strategic transformation of agriculture (PSTA II). In this land use consolidation model farmers in given areas are required to grow any of the six priority food crops (Maize, Rice, Wheat, Irish potato, Cassava, and

Beans) in a synchronized fashion while keeping their land rights intact. Although consolidation is voluntary, it is a prerequisite for availing subsidized inputs under the CIP<sup>53</sup>. The land use model is based on Rwanda's eleven agricultural zones<sup>III</sup> in which the different suitable crops are demarcated for cultivation. Subsequently, total production quantity for CIP priority crops grew by more than 150 percent between 2007 and 2013 in CIP supported plots, and yields of all the targeted commodities improved<sup>54</sup>. However, additional gains have been harder to achieve and there has been no clear trend in yield performance. A few crops are currently performing above their 2013 level (paddy rice and climbing beans), most priority crops have yields at or below the 2013 level<sup>55</sup> as shown in the figure below.

The fluctuation in crop productivity has been greatly attributed to high levels of climate variability characterised by large variations in rainfall frequency and quantities, periodic floods especially in the north and west and droughts mostly in the East. Rwanda has faced major droughts in the last 4 years. Also hilly terrain aggravates erosion rates and majority of cultivated land is solely reliant on rain-fed production.



Figure 5: Yields development for selected crops 2013A - 2017A (2013A = 100)

Livestock production has become increasingly important in Rwanda's agriculture sector with the fastest growth (8.3 percent) realised in 2012 - 2016, contributing 4 percent and 34 percent to Rwanda's formal and informal agricultural exports respectively in 2016 and 4.6 percent to national GDP<sup>50</sup>. Recognising this potential, the GoR has invested substantially in livestock productivity, specifically local cattle breeds' that now make up 43 percent of the national cattle herd (1.39 million cattle). The Girinka programme is the greatest contributor to this national achievement. However, the contribution of local breeds to total milk production remains low at only 9 percent, but all cattle breeds still account for 46 percent of dressed meat. Numbers and importance of other livestock have substantially increased and are now contributing more to the meat sources, mainly for local consumption. Today 21 percent of dressed meat comes from pigs and the rest from other livestock, especially chicken. As of 2017, the national herd consists 2.94 million goats, 1.8 million pigs and about 7 million chicken. Together these currently produce about 94,200 Metric Tons (MT) of meat, 747,000 MT of milk, and 2,430,000 eggs and 6,800,000 MT of organic fertilizer per year. Also improved breeds of livestock have increased in proportion to 19 percent and 16 percent for chicken and cattle respectively<sup>56</sup>. The growth in livestock production is attributed not only to concerted GoR efforts such as development of master plan for livestock production but also the increasing domestic demand and opportunities for export of live animals and animal products.

Despite the tremendous growth and progress in the livestock sub-sector various challenges still hinder full achievement of the sector's potential. The Girinka programme requires participating farmers to avail highly nutritive grasses and legumes for their dairy cattle to ensure productivity and multiplication, however, in an

III 1. Impala, 2. Imbo, 3. Congo-Nile watershed divide, 4. Central Plateau, 5. Mayaga & Peripheral Bugesera, 6. Central plateau,

<sup>7.</sup> Lake Kivu borders, 8. Eastern Plateau, 9. Birunga, 10. Burebuka Highlands, 11, Eastern Savannah

environment already constrained by perpetual land scarcity, increasing livestock production pauses direct competition on crop production. Therefore, poor households targeted by this programme face difficulty in meeting the feeding and management requirements of received livestock. Livestock production is still carried out on relatively small and subsistence levels with very little (5 percent) specialised commercial production of especially dairy livestock<sup>57</sup>. There is little livestock value addition going on with most generated in dairy cow milk (45 percent) and beef (25 percent) production<sup>58</sup>. Inadequate animal health services and genetics combined with limited availability of quality feeds and poor (traditional) management practices are among key bottlenecks to growth of the livestock sector in Rwanda. The fisheries sector also remains underdeveloped with the sub-sector exploited for less than 10 percent of its estimated potential and yet close to 8 percent of the country area is covered by water. Limited development of fisheries is partly attributed to the lack of central fisheries management agency and limited private sector investment in the area. However, with three new fish feed factories currently under establishment in Rwanda, the sub-sector expects to realise considerable growth in the near future.

In light of the various challenges and achievements, the GoR and partners are developing and implementing various policies and strategies to not only address gaps in the agriculture sector but also sustain the gains. Firstly, agricultural infrastructure remains a key factor affecting the entire value chain from production through processing to the market. The road network is a vital foundation of agricultural development. A national feeder roads policy and strategy has been developed, with a Feeder Roads Implementation Framework with clear institutional responsibilities for different stakeholders, promoting labour-based technology in feeder roads development and outlining mechanisms for funding feeder roads development and maintenance, in a gender- responsive and climate resilient manner.

Rain-fed crop production highly susceptible to climate variability remains a key hindrance, hence considerable national investment in irrigation infrastructure. Rwanda has 589,711 ha of irrigation potential out of which 47 percent is on marshlands and 63 percent is on hillsides<sup>59</sup>. Irrigated hillside and marshland is 5,948 ha and 35,161 ha respectively, covering a total of 41,109 ha against a target of 34, 196 ha. In addition 103,918 ha and 913,212 ha of radical and progressive terraces respectively have been established<sup>17</sup> to combat erosion and enhance soil and water conservation. Most of this has been achieved under Rwanda's Integrated Water Resource Management (IWRM) policy and projects such as Small-Scale Irrigation Technology Project. However, not more than 7 percent of the arable irrigable land has been covered, hence the need for more investment in small and large–scale irrigation systems.

Agriculture support services in Rwanda are defined by research and technology transfer services, supply of agro-inputs, extension services and agriculture financial services. Research and development (R&D) in agriculture is essential in developing innovations such as management practices, production of resilient breeds and varieties and other demand-driven solutions to the sector's challenges. However, there has been limited investment in this area with only 0.7 percent of the concluding PSTA III expenditures going to R&D<sup>60</sup>. This expenditure is way below the targeted 7 percent and puts the sector's progress at risk.

Seeds and fertilisers importation and distribution has been gradually privatised between 2012 and 2016, this is a marked shift from the previous years where it was predominantly publicly procured. In addition, to further enhance the use of quality seed and inorganic fertilizers, under the CIP, prices for fertilisers are subsidised between 50 - 85 percent and are available to CIP-eligible crops, but has also been prudently applied to other crops. This subsidy scheme inherently discourages agro-dealers from selling compounds specific to non-CIP crops. Although there are plans to decentralise procurement and distribution of seeds and fertilizers to districts, currently the government arranges the international procurement of fertilisers while Rwanda Agricultural Board (RAB) contracts and coordinates suppliers. Also, since the shift from free improved seed to subsidised seeds in 2015, where farmers meet part of the seed costs, there has been a reduction of number of farmers using improved seed distributed through GoR channels. The reluctance to use improved distributed seed is not only attributed to the cost but also the dependence on imported seed

not necessary acclimatized to local climatic conditions and worsened by limited private sector investment in seed production, multiplication and distribution. Overall the PSTA III targeted to have 70 percent of agriculture land cultivated with improved seed by end 2018, but only about 12 percent was reached by mid-2016, however, inorganic fertilizer distributed was at 31 kg/ha/year as of 2015 on track to the 45kg/ha target<sup>17</sup>.

Agriculture extension services have adapted and customised the farmer field school approach (FFS) to local conditions, promoted as the *Twigire Mubinzi* extension model (and *Twigire Mworozi* for livestock). In this model farmer promoters are linked to FFS and are trained by FFS facilitators for increased outreach and to complement extension workers. Farmer promoters' tasks include demonstration and linkages to input dealers and farmer mobilization. FFS facilitators are responsible for the farmer learning process, specifically understanding of production methods and practices through observation and analysis in the FFS plots. District and zone agricultural officers provide technical support. As of 2017 over 9,355 demonstration plots and 8,382 FFS plots have been established and about 1,300,000 farmers were mobilized through *Twigire Mubinzi*. The system also has 2,531 facilitators, 44 master trainers 14,837 farmer promoters and 1,219 Community Animal Health Workers (CAHWs)<sup>17</sup>. The challenges of this model are that, extension is not necessarily customized to the different farmer typologies and targeting of farmers needs be improved to ensure inclusion all categories of farmers, especially the vulnerable and illiterate.

Despite the progress in financial inclusion cited in Rwanda, only 7 percent<sup>31</sup> of credit has gone toward agriculture. Transaction costs are high, collateral requirements often higher than loan-size and interest rates are as high as 21 percent<sup>61</sup>. Commercial banks have limited outreach to rural areas and MFIs lack the necessary loan capital and capacity for agribusiness lending. Where finance is available, it is often restricted to short-term working capital. Considerations of alternative or substitute collateral like insurance, guarantee, warehouse finance, leasing, input credit finance etc. that would reduce the lenders' risk are often lacking. Value chain financing in the agro-food sector is at very low levels, given high degree of fragmentation and weak structures and organisation resulting in difficulties to ensure better value chain integration, unevenness of information amongst value chain actors and lack of trust between actors. Though agricultural insurance has been available in the market since 2012 there is very low uptake, yet agricultural risks are high, including exposure to weather and price shocks.

#### 2.3 ECONOMIC CLUSTER: PRIORITIES AND ANALYSIS OF UNDAP PROGRAMMING PRINCIPLES

The CCA classifies the described sectors as the economic cluster in this analysis. Against each of the sectors described in the preceding sections of this report, the CCA has identified key priorities in each sector based on gaps identified in the context analysis as well as priorities emanating from consultations with sector working group leaders and respective sector strategic plans under development. These priorities are summarised in the tables below and provide targeted starting points for the One UN in Rwanda's UNDAP planning processes.

A brief analysis of the current statuses of the different sectors is also provided against the four UNDAP programming principles; Leave no one behind, Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment, Sustainability and resilience and Accountability. For each of these programming principles the CCA provides not only gaps in the context and implementation status of each sector but also highlights positive progress or lessons that provide opportunity for lesson learning, replication across sectors and clusters as well as scaling up where applicable, however emphasis is majorly placed on where gaps exist around the programming principles. Also using the concluded Rapid Integrated Assessment (RIA) of Rwanda national policy frameworks alignment with the sustainable development goals, SDGs and SDG targets under respective sectors and sub-sectors are presented in the table below.

Table 2: Economic Clusters	priorities and	l programming	principles
----------------------------	----------------	---------------	------------

PrioritiesSDGs and UNDAP Programming PrincipleBy 2030, reduce at least by half the proportion of men, v and children of all ages living in poverty in all its dimen according to national definitions1.Private Sector development1.Private Sector development2End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutriti promote sustainable agriculture3By 2030, substantially increase the number of youth and who have relevant skills, including technical and vocation for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic g full and productive employment and decent work for11Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilit sustainable12Sustainable production and consumption for sustainable development13Eteave no one behind• Deepen doing businessLeave no one behind• Increase focus on a targeted approach to investment promotion with focus primarily on investment promotion with focus primar	women isions on and I adults al skills, p growth, r all ent and
<ul> <li>Private Sector development</li> <li>Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, reside sustainable</li> <li>Sustainable production and consumption</li> <li>Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize th partnership for sustainable development</li> <li>Leave no one behind</li> <li>Rightly founded ambitious plans focusing more on foreign investment and not enough concerted effort opromoting local private sector.</li> <li>Human rights, gender equality and women's</li> </ul>	l adults al skills, p growth, r all ent and
<ul> <li>1. Private Sector development</li> <li>a.4.4 who have relevant skills, including technical and vocation for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship full and productive employment and decent work for sustainable</li> <li>b. Deepen doing business reforms and competitiveness interventions to address cost of doing business</li> <li>Increase focus on a targeted approach to investment promotion with focus primarily on</li> <li>I. Deepen doing with focus primarily on</li> </ul>	al skills, 5 growth, r all ent and
<ul> <li>Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic g full and productive employment and decent work for</li> <li>Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilie sustainable</li> <li>Sustainable production and consumption</li> <li>Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize th partnership for sustainable development</li> <li>Deepen doing business reforms and competitiveness interventions to address cost of doing business</li> <li>Increase focus on a targeted approach to investment promotion with focus primarily on</li> <li>Rightly founded ambitious plans focusing more on foreign investment and not enough concerted effort of promoting local private sector.</li> <li>Human rights, gender equality and women's</li> </ul>	r all ent and
<ul> <li>In sustainable</li> <li>Sustainable production and consumption</li> <li>Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize th partnership for sustainable development</li> <li>Deepen doing business reforms and competitiveness interventions to address cost of doing business</li> <li>Increase focus on a targeted approach to investment promotion with focus primarily on</li> <li>Increase focus on a targeted approach to investment promotion with focus primarily on</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Deepen doing business reforms and competitiveness interventions to address cost of doing business</li> <li>Increase focus on a targeted approach to investment promotion with focus primarily on</li> <li>Increase focus on a targeted approach to investment promotion with focus primarily on</li> </ul>	ıe global
<ul> <li>Deepen doing business reforms and competitiveness interventions to address cost of doing business</li> <li>Increase focus on a targeted approach to investment promotion with focus primarily on</li> <li>Increase focus on a targeted approach to investment promotion with focus primarily on</li> </ul>	ne global
<ul> <li>competitiveness interventions to address cost of doing business</li> <li>Increase focus on a targeted approach to investment promotion with focus primarily on</li> <li>Rightly founded ambitious plans focusing more on foreign investment and not enough concerted effort or promoting local private sector. <i>Human rights, gender equality and women's</i></li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>of doing business</li> <li>Increase focus on a targeted approach to investment promotion with focus primarily on</li> <li>foreign investment and not enough concerted effort or promoting local private sector.</li> <li>Human rights, gender equality and women's</li> </ul>	
• Increase focus on a targeted approach to investment promotion with focus primarily on <i>Human rights, gender equality and women's</i>	
investment promotion with focus primarily on Human rights, gender equality and women's	on
import replacement followed by export orientationempowerment• Limited indication of any strategic focus on proactiv	
• Increase access to finance and enhance engagement of women in more productive private set	
liquidity mainly through building partnerships interventions	0001
between the financial sector and local MSMEs Sustainability and resilience	
• Develop and implement a strategy for trade in • Suitable governance and regulatory frameworks for t	
services private sector, but excessive reliance on public sector investment	
Accountability	
• Other than the national establishments survey there	is
limited disaggregated data on private sectors progress/performance.	
8         Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic g	growth,
full and productive employment and decent work for	r all
9 Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sust industrialization and foster innovation	amable
2. Regional and International Trade       11       Industrianzation and toster inflovation         11       Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilies	ent and
17 Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize th	ie global
partnership for sustainable development	0
• Engage in non-traditional commodities value <i>Leave no one behind</i>	
<ul> <li>chains exploitation for local and global integration e.g. incentives for value chain</li> <li>EDPRS II outcomes mention in addition to intentio investors, strengthening of SMEs but not specificity of the second secon</li></ul>	
integration e.g. incentives for value chain actors investors, strengthening of SMEs but not specificity of particular target groups. Also need to create a clear lin	
• Enhance technical support and access to between intentional trade and the local producer and	
finance for women engaged in informal cross- processor.	
border trade. Human rights, gender equality and women's	
• Increase focus of regional trade on increasing	
exports to the west as the demand and market	
size for manufactured and re-exported goods	
size for manufactured and re-exported goods and services is higher in the region than the End Services is higher in the region than the	
<ul> <li>size for manufactured and re-exported goods and services is higher in the region than the East that is closer to the Coast</li> <li>Support transport infrastructure projects aimed</li> <li>Limited focus or attention given to women's empowerment in regional or international trade</li> <li>Sustainability and resilience</li> <li>Suitable governance and regulatory frameworks for the coast</li> </ul>	he
size for manufactured and re-exported goods and services is higher in the region than the East that is closer to the Coast • Limited focus or attention given to women's empowerment in regional or international trade <i>Sustainability and resilience</i>	

Priorities	SDGs and UNDAP Programming Principles
	• Disaggregated export data readily availed by the central bank
3. Infrastructure, Urbanization & Transport	<ul> <li>6 Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all</li> <li>7 Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all</li> <li>10 Reduce inequality within and among countries</li> <li>11 Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable</li> <li>12 Sustainable production and consumption</li> <li>13 Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable</li> <li>17 Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development</li> </ul>
<ul> <li>Institutional capacity strengthening for effective coordination, planning and implementation of infrastructure and urbanization projects</li> <li>Increase investment in more innovative affordable housing creation not based on traditional building materials within well- serviced, compact, green human settlement areas.</li> <li>Support implementation of the Rwanda Smart City Master Plan by providing guidance for future specific local Smart City Master plans</li> <li>As a signatory to the UNESCO 2005 Convention for the protection and promotion of the diversity of cultural expressions, Rwanda has made a commitment to developing the creative industries in Rwanda in a sustainable development framework</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Leave no one behind</li> <li>Need to devise mechanisms and advocate for reduction of the economic and social-infrastructure divide between rural and urban dwellers.</li> <li>Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment</li> <li>Revision of laws that protect women's access to land and property increased ownership of property by women but there is limited evidence of how special groups like female-headed households are affected changes such as urbanisation, affordable housing schemes and associated expropriation.</li> <li>Sustainability and resilience</li> <li>Gaps exist in integration of environment sector priorities in infrastructure development, need to go beyond their role in only Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA).</li> <li>Accountability</li> <li>Need to strengthen affordable housing studies, data availability and communication to reflect inclusive participation of citizens in the planning and implementation to ensure compliance to the master plans</li> </ul>
4. Information and communication technology	10       Reduce inequality within and among countries         11       Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable         12       Sustainable production and consumption         13       Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable
<ul> <li>Support efforts to bridge the digital divide between the digitally literate and illiterate by increasing interventions to address digital illiteracy especially in rural areas.</li> <li>Develop support projects to promote innovation and develop the ICT business and industry sub-sectors especially among the youth. For example through financing and creation of platforms to showcase and market ICT locally developed ICT solutions</li> <li>Support implementation of the SMART city master plan to enhance synergy across sectors and increase equitable resource utilisation e.g. SMART cities contributing to Green villages.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Leave no one behind</li> <li>As ICT becomes increasingly important to the Rwandan society and economy the digital divide widens most especially between the urban and rural areas by virtue of connectivity, affordability and literacy.</li> <li>Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment</li> <li>Women in ICT has been promoted through initiatives such as 'Miss Geek", but female representation in the ICT sector still remains low compared to male counterparts.</li> <li>Sustainability and resilience</li> <li>Development of the ICT sector e.g. SMART cities required heavy investment and yet returns are long-term, hence ICT development is still considerably reliant on public investment that is already constrained with other investment priorities.</li> </ul>

Priorities	SDGs and UNDAP Programming Principles
	<ul> <li>Accountability</li> <li>There is substantial data on the ICT sector, through for example RURA monitoring reports, however most of it is on a national level with limited disaggregation e.g. mobile</li> </ul>
5. Industrialization	penetration by gender or vulnerability is not adequate         8       Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all         9       Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation         12       Sustainable production and consumption         17       Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development
<ul> <li>Promoting competitive value chains made in Rwanda focusing on specific niche products for example in agro-processing.</li> <li>Support innovation in industry to find means to lower costs of production without focusing on traditional means of production and to enhance local industry regional and global competitiveness. e.g. incentives for innovation, global standards certification for products</li> <li>Enhance focus and support to light manufacturing i.e. small consumer goods, so as to gradually grow MSMEs venturing into industry</li> <li>Support integration of green growth and climate change resilience initiatives in industrialisation</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Leave no one behind</li> <li>There is no evidence of the industrialisation sub-sector's focus on utilisation of an "industry development for inclusive growth approach" addressing MSMEs and low-level skilled citizens.</li> <li>Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment</li> <li>Women remain in less productive manufacturing activities such as handicrafts making. There is no evidence of industrialisation taking into account in detail issues of gender or human rights approaches in their line of work.</li> <li>Sustainability and resilience</li> <li>Industry is highly dependent on imported inputs, including raw materials and expertise, and growth is hindered by barriers such as limited supply of energy and skilled labour, this results in below optimum output and risks continuity of operations</li> <li>Accountability</li> <li>Industrial sector skills assessments and manufacturing sector studies have been conducted but there isn't</li> </ul>
6. Financial Sector	<ul> <li>sufficient disaggregated data and the studies are ad hoc.</li> <li>1.2 By 2030, reduce at least by half the proportion of men, women and children of all ages living in poverty in all its dimensions according to national definitions</li> <li>17.1 Strengthen domestic resource mobilization, including through international support to developing countries, to improve domestic capacity for tax and other revenue collection</li> </ul>
<ul> <li>Supporting financial sector players to develop and deliver customer centric products to enhance formal inclusion and rural finance, such as attracting informal savings groups to link with FSPs, development of leasing products for MSMEs, value chain finance products and promotion of adequate informal sector pension savings products and asset building opportunities.</li> <li>Support to completion of the establishment of the U-SACCO structure as a means to increase access to finance in rural areas.</li> <li>Support initiatives to enable, especially vulnerable groups, to increase their income levels in order to be able to join the country drive to increase national savings.</li> <li>Strengthen efforts to increase financial literacy especially in rural areas among vulnerable groups, youth and women.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Leave no one behind</li> <li>About 11 percent of adults in Rwanda (around 0.7 million individuals) do not use any financial products or services i.e. they are financially excluded. Traditionally vulnerable groups such as the poor, those residing in remote rural areas, women, and the youth are more likely to be financially excluded.</li> <li>Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment</li> <li>Financial inclusion should be seen as a basic human right, not a privilege, and therefore financial literacy and increasing access to customer centric FSP should remain at the core of the UN work in this sector</li> <li>Sustainability and resilience</li> <li>Rwanda's banking sector is predominantly run by foreign banks, thus the need for developing local financial service</li> </ul>

Priorities	SDGs and UNDAP Programming Principles			
	providers to enhance resilience and vulnerability to external shocks			
	Accountability			
	• The 4 year FinScope study provides a comprehensive			
	picture of financial inclusion in Rwanda and is being			
	increasingly disaggregated in every edition, hence			
	improving quality and usefulness of data generated <b>1.3</b> Implement nationally appropriate social protection systems and			
7. Decent work for all	<ul> <li>measures for all, including floors, and by 2030 achieve substantial coverage of the poor and the vulnerable</li> <li>By 2030, ensure that all men and women, in particular the poor and the vulnerable, have equal rights to economic resources, as well as access to basic services, ownership and control over land</li> </ul>			
	<ul> <li>and other forms of property, inheritance, natural resources, appropriate new technology and finance</li> <li>End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and</li> </ul>			
	<ul> <li>End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture</li> <li>Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote</li> </ul>			
	lifelong learning opportunities for all			
	<ul> <li>4.4 By 2030, substantially increase the number of youth and adults who have relevant skills, including technical and vocational skills, for employment, decent jobs and entrepreneurship</li> <li>5 Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls</li> </ul>			
	8 Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all			
	<ul> <li>Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation</li> <li>Reduce inequality within and among countries</li> </ul>			
	11 Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and			
	sustainable           12         Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns			
	17 Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global			
Prioritise creation of off farm jobs targeting	partnership for sustainable development Leave no one behind			
both male and female from rural as well as	• Data available is not sufficiently disaggregated to establish			
urban areas.	exactly which particular groups in society are partly or			
• Strategies to increase the link between the education system and the labour market, and	absolutely excluded from employment opportunity e.g. the status of PWDs in accessing employment?			
increase partnership with the private sector and i	• Skills development and entrepreneurship opportunities not accessible to all and do not entirely match labour market			
• Develop strategies to exploit employment opportunities in the culture sector and notably	needs			
the potential offered by the cultural and creative industries.	• Capacity building in the cultural and creative industries through venues such as schools is lacking			
• Promote quality jobs by supporting relevant	Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment			
national institutions and private sector employers to recognise and implement all	• Limited evidence of concerted efforts to increase			
mandatory and elective decent work agenda e.g. occupational safety and health, fiduciary compliance, inclusive accessibility and other workers rights-	engagement of women in productive work in especially the formal private sector			
	Sustainability and resilience			
	• Unbalanced focus between job creation (Start-ups) and sustenance of created or existing jobs, raising concerns of sustainable decent work.			
	<i>Accountability</i> Newly launched Labour Force Survey creating opportunity for evidence based decision making in the employment sector through availing detailed employment sector status statistics.			
8. Agriculture	2 End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture			

Priorities	SDGs and UNDAP Programming Principles			
	9         Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation           10         Reduce inequality within and among countries			
	12 Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns			
Prioritize positioning the UN strategically	Leave no one behind			
<ul> <li>Prioritize positioning the UN strategically within the New Food and Nutrition Security Secretariat located in MINALOC with key focus on achieving SDG 2 results but stressing focus on dietary issues to address malnutrition and its far reaching impact in Rwanda.</li> <li>Focus on supporting development and adoption of innovative Climate- resilient agriculture with technologies and practices that enable small-holder farmers build on agroecological knowledge to counter apparent risks and ensure sustainable agricultural growth</li> <li>Increase private sector engagement in agriculture through analysis and development of more strategies to exploit the value chains of priority crops and livestock and support efforts to mitigate risks in agriculture such as insurance and enabling access to finance in agriculture.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Rwanda's vulnerability analysis mapping indicates that 20 percent of the Rwanda population is not food secure especially the vulnerable in rural areas.</li> <li>77 percent of rural population is youth of working age and yet there is no concerted effort on how to productively engage youth in agriculture development.</li> <li><i>Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment</i></li> <li>Women in agriculture form the largest proportion of the productive population with more than 25 percent of rural households headed by women. However there isn't any targeted support to increase the productivity by women in agriculture. Empirical evidence have shown that there is a significant gender gap in agriculture productivity between plots managed by men and those managed by women<sup>62</sup></li> <li><i>Sustainability and resilience</i></li> <li>Most strategies seem to focus more on the availability of food and not so much on the equitable access, utilization and sustainability of production. All EDPRS II outcome targets for agriculture productivity focus on the inputs to the sector and not sustainable outcomes.</li> </ul>			
	Tools such as the "comprehensive food security and vulnerability analysis" provide evidence of the status of food security in Rwanda.			

#### 2.4 HUMAN DEVELOPMENT INDEX

Rwanda's Human Development Index value has increased by 103.9 percent from 0.244 to 0.498 between 1990 and 2015. In addition, the country's life expectancy at birth has increased by 31.3 years, mean years of schooling increased by 2.0 years and expected years of schooling increased by 5.1 years. Rwanda's Gross National Income (GNI) per capita has also increased by 90.9 percent between 1990 and 2015<sup>4</sup>.

Rwanda's 2015 HDI of 0.498 is above the 0.497 average for countries in the low human development group but below the 0.523 average for countries in Sub-Saharan Africa. Globally, the country ranks 159th out of 188 countries and 27th in Africa. When Rwanda's HDI value is discounted for inequality, the HDI falls to 0.339 due to inequality in the distribution of HDI dimension indices (life expectancy at birth, education and income).

The Gender Development Index (GDI) is calculated for 160 countries in the 2015 Human Development Report. The female HDI value for Rwanda is 0.491 in contrast with 0.495 for males, resulting in a GDI value of 0.992, which places the country into Group 1. Subsequently, Rwanda has a Gender Inequality Index (GII) 0.383, ranking it 84<sup>th</sup> out of 159 countries globally. In Rwanda, women hold 57.5 percent of parliamentary seats, and 10.5 percent of adult women have reached at least a secondary level of education compared to 16.4 percent of their male counterparts. For every 100,000 live births, 290 women die from pregnancy related causes; and the adolescent birth rate is 26.3 births per 1,000 women of ages 15-19. Female participation in the labour market is 86.4 percent compared to 83.2 for men<sup>4</sup>.

#### 2.4.1 DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE

Rapid population growth, youthful age structure, and rapidly growing urban population characterize Rwanda's demographic profile. Population more than doubled from 4.8 million people in 1978 to 10.5 million in 2012 and is projected to have grown to 11.3 million in 2015 and to reach 16.3 million by 2032<sup>63</sup>. The rapid population growth is a consequence of high and slowly declining fertility rate amidst steadily declining death rates. The average number of births per woman decreased from 5.8 in 2000 to 4.2 in 2015<sup>64</sup>. This was mainly driven by an increase in the percentage of women using modern contraception from 10.3 percent to 47.5 percent. If Rwanda's birth rates decline more rapidly, the age structure will change from the current one dominated by dependent children to one dominated initially by youth and then later by working age adults. This transformation in the age structure is what enables accelerated economic growth through the mechanism of the demographic dividend – the temporary economic benefit that can arise from a significant increase in the ratio of working-age adults relative to young dependents that results from fertility decline<sup>65</sup>.

The rapid rate at which the Rwandan population is growing and the consequent high child dependency burden are among the main challenges curtailing Rwanda's socioeconomic progress and attainment of Vision 2020. Rwanda's population is heavily youthful with 40.1 percent being under age 15, 20 percent between 15 and 24 and 68.7 percent below age 30 in 2015. This translates to a total dependency burden of 76 per 100 people of working age in 2015. The high dependency burden poses a challenge to economic growth, due to the high costs to the nation and households of essential needs for children, including education and health services. It also impedes the ability of the nation and households to save – an important factor that would increase investments and provide an impetus to accelerated economic growth. High fertility rate is also associated with low levels of female education and limited participation of women in the formal labour market.

The African Union (AU) has highlighted the importance of the demographic dividend framework and its potential contribution towards the realisation of the socioeconomic transformation goals articulated in the AU's Agenda 2063 and different national development visions. The AU's roadmap for harnessing the demographic dividend calls on all African member states to domesticate the demographic agenda and

maximise their chances of harnessing the demographic dividend by prioritising investments in education and skills development, health, job creation and good governance<sup>66</sup>.

		Sex		Total Population
	Male (precent)	Female (precent)	Total	
All Rwanda	47.8	52.2	100.0	11,424,000
0-4	7.0	6.9	13.9	1,587,000
5-9	7.2	7.3	14.6	1,662,000
10-14	6.5	7.0	13.5	1,538,000
5-19	5.2	5.3	10.5	1,198,000
20-24	4.5	4.9	9.5	1,080,000
25-29	3.7	4.2	8.0	910,000
30-34	3.5	3.9	7.4	842,000
35-39	2.2	2.7	4.9	557,000
40-44	1.8	2.1	3.9	446,000
45-49	1.4	1.8	3.1	357,000
50-54	1.5	1.7	3.2	362,000
55-59	1.2	1.4	2.6	297,000
60-64	0.8	1.0	1.8	204,000
65+	1.3	2.1	3.4	384,000

Table 3: Population structure by sex and five-year age group

Source: NISR EICV4

#### 2.4.2 POVERTY, INEQUALITY AND VULNERABILITIES

The 2012 census shows that annual population growth for Rwanda has decreased from 3.2 percent in 2002 to 2.6 percent in 2012, though it remains among the highest in Africa. Over almost the same period, the population has increased from 8.1 million in 2012 to 11.5 million in 2016 while the population density increased from 321 persons per square kilometre to 421 persons per square kilometre. This bulge continues to pose huge economic and environmental constrains on the country.

A high growth rate combined with stabilizing population growth has contributed to poverty reduction. From 2005/06, the poverty headcount ratio declined from 56.7 percent to 39.1 percent in 2013/14. A reduction of 17.6 percent in poverty level over a period of nine years is very encouraging. Poverty declined more in rural areas than urban areas in 2011-2014. However, the highest poverty rate stands at 62 percent in rural areas, as compared to an average of 16.3 percent in urban areas. The contributing factors are a combination of improved agricultural incomes, off-farm job creation, reduction in household sizes, and public and private transfers<sup>67</sup>. Although all provinces experienced reductions in poverty from 2011-14, there was significant variation in the level of poverty reduction between different districts and in all provinces. In Rwanda's poorest district, Nyamasheke, 62 percent of people live below the poverty line. The poverty rates are much higher (76.6 percent) among those who rely on farm wage labour compared to those who rely on non-farm wages (22.8 percent) and those who are self-employed (24.2 percent) that have experienced greater cuts in poverty rates<sup>68</sup>.



Source: NISR

#### Figure 6: District variations in poverty and extreme poverty rates

Income equality improved in the 2011-2014 period with the Gini Coefficient falling from 0.490 to 0.448. However, poverty rates in the Southern Province are almost 13 percent higher than other provinces while the poverty rate in Kigali, the capital city, is much lower (16.8 percent) than the national average<sup>69</sup>.

The multidimensional poverty index (MPI) that identifies multiple deprivations in the same households in education, health and living standards indicate that 53.9 percent of Rwanda's population is multidimensionally poor, equivalent to a 16.9 percent decline between 2015 and 2016 HDRs. Meanwhile an additional 25.0 percent live near multidimensional poverty, an increase from 17.9 percent reported in the 2015 HDR. The breadth of deprivation (intensity) in Rwanda, which is the average of deprivation scores experienced by people in multidimensional poverty, is 47.0 percent. The MPI, which is the share of the population that is multi-dimensionally poor, adjusted by the intensity of the deprivations, is 0.253<sup>4</sup>.

Income poverty, measured by the percentage of the population living below Purchasing Power Parity US \$1.90 per day, and multidimensional poverty shows that income poverty is inconclusive. The multidimensional poverty headcount of 6.5 percentage points higher than income poverty. Implying that individuals living below the income poverty line may have access to non-income resources while some of those above may still suffer deprivations in education, health and other living conditions. 20.5 percent live in severe multidimensional poverty. The contributions of deprivations in each dimension to overall poverty complete a comprehensive picture of people living in multidimensional poverty in Rwanda<sup>4</sup>.

#### 2.4.3 SOCIAL PROTECTION

Social protection in the Rwandan context is defined as "a set of public and private initiatives that provide income or consumption transfers to the poor, protect the vulnerable against livelihood risks and enhance the social status and rights of the marginalized with the overall objective of reducing the social and economic vulnerability of poor, vulnerable and marginalised groups"<sup>70</sup>. As such, social protection in Rwanda has two dimensions; systems of regular and predicable cash transfers that provide income support to citizens living in poverty and vulnerable to falling into poverty and mechanisms of ensuring access to basic public services

### Case One: Social services provided by local governments

- i.Rehabilitation services for PwDs and vulnerable children;
- ii.Services that provide protection from domestic violence and abuse;
- iii.A range of proximity advisory services serving key vulnerable groups
- iv.Services that ensure that orphans remain in a family/community setting;
- v.Public communication and advocacy campaigns on the rights of vulnerable groups

such as health and education by addressing mainly financial barriers. These dimensions of social protection are administered through three core schemes including; Non-contributory Direct Income Support (DIS) schemes, Mandatory 'contributory' social insurance schemes managed by RSSB, Private social security schemes regulated by government. In addition to these core social protection schemes, different social care services are provided (see box 1) by local governments to specific groups of citizens including people with disabilities (PwDs), vulnerable children, youth and women.

The social protection sector also links social protection beneficiaries to a wider range of complementary programmes and services including, but not limited to: agricultural asset transfers; seed and fertilizer subsidy schemes; financial services; skills training; business development services; and agricultural extension services as well as agriculture insurance. Both social protection sector agencies and other government and non-government institutions that are part or not part of the Social Protection Sector Working Group (SPSWG) offer the complementary services. Also, targeted programmes such as the "one cup of milk per child" and school feeding that address nutrition in children and access to education are considered part of the boarder social protection sector in Rwanda.

The ministry of local government (MINALOC) is the overall policy lead and chair of the SPSWG that coordinates actors in social protection and oversees policy and strategy development and implementation in the sector. Local Administrative Entities Development Agency (LODA), The Genocide Survivors Support and Assistance Fund (FARG) and The Rwanda Demobilization and Reintegration Commission (RDRC), are the three public institutions with the primary responsibility of delivering the core social protection programmes and are overseen by MINALOC. LODA manages the Vision 2020 Umurenge Programme (VUP), Ubudehe programme (including the Ubudehe household classification mechanism and community projects) and Minimum Package for Graduation (MPG) initiatives.

VUP was a flagship programme of EDPRS I launched in 2008 and comprises three components: Direct Support (DS) which gives cash transfers to extremely poor households without labour capacity; Public Works (PW) which provides temporary community work opportunities for extremely poor households with labour capacity; Expanded Public works which provides multi-year, year-round, flexible (working hours). PW also provides accessible and appropriate employment opportunities to moderately labour-constrained households.

FARG is a parastatal that supports needy genocide survivors. Core resources of the fund emanate from 6 percent of the GoR's annual budget and other sources. The funds are spent on the fundamental social protection direct support programme, as well as on programmes of education, health, shelter and support to income generating projects. RDRC provides support to eligible disabled ex-combatants in the form of
subsistence allowance (direct support), along with other benefits such as housing support, income generating activities and medical insurance.

Several interventions have contributed to graduation from extreme poverty, but social protection programmes targeting the extremely poor are identified as one of the most significant contributing factors to this result. Between 2010 and 2014 extreme poverty in Rwanda dropped by 7.8 percent from 24.1 percent to 16.3 percent, which is on track to the EDPRS II target of less than 10 percent by 2018<sup>17</sup>. As of 2017 the VUP direct support programme is operational in all 416 sectors in 30 districts of Rwanda and has supported 85,889 households (58,192 female heads and 27,707 male heads) with 172,709 people. The VUP, RDRC and FARG DS schemes collectively cover approximately 80,000 extremely poor older people, 23,000 PwDs and a small number of extremely poor child-headed households. In 2016/17 115,000 households benefited form temporary public works. In addition, the Girinka asset transfer programme (one cow per family) had covered 6 percent of the target households by 2014, the VUP case worker mechanisms has been established in 30 sectors and MPG piloted in 30 sectors, milk Support has been delivered to 10,000 malnourished children per year and Fortified Blended Food distributed to 99,000 children. Health insurance coverage is relatively high nationally at 72.2 percent with 79 percent of VUP programme beneficiaries covered by the community-based health insurance (CBHI)<sup>71</sup>, "Mutuelle".

Despite the commendable progress and achievements realised through the various social protection support programmes in Rwanda, various challenges still exist which impeded the sector from achieving all its intended objectives within specified timelines. Although there is consensus that the Ubudehe categorisation process is relatively transparent, there are concerns about the overall quality of the VUP targeting, including inclusion of households from higher categories. There are also inefficiencies in the timeliness of payments to beneficiaries of the public works component, with reports indicating that more than half did not received payments in 2014 on time while direct support transfers are frequently delayed by more than a month, leaving over 30 percent beneficiaries with no funds to meet basic needs. Awareness of the Appeals and Complaints Process for the VUP is also a challenge with less than 2 percent of households aware of the process<sup>71</sup>. Coverage of the VUP social protection programme remains inadequate. As of March 2017, only 1,866 households in 22 Districts participated in extended Public works against the revised annual target of 3,000 households in 30 sectors. Whereas the full coverage of the households without labour capacity was achieved, the coverage of the public works remains a challenge with a number of eligible beneficiaries in Ubudehe 1 lacking access to cash for work. Also less than 52 percent of households in Ubudehe 1 are covered by direct income support schemes. Out of the 9.2 percent of households headed by PwDs targeted by the VUP only 5 percent have benefited from public works. Despite the presence of premium subsidies targeted using Ubudehe classification, CBHI coverage has dropped to 58 percent among the poorest quintile72, meanwhile the financial sustainability of Rwanda's CBHI also remains in some doubt. There are also indicators of limited progress in harmonisation of social protection agenda even among the key programmes, VUP, FARG and RDRC, this has been mainly attributed to difficulty in designing and delivering targeted packages to specific households, however, this will hopefully be addressed by the ongoing households profiling exercise.

The most significant challenge of the on going social protection support programme is "the graduation challenge", the ability of the social protection to support target beneficiaries to graduate from extreme poverty and sustain their new income level to points where they are able to resist poverty shocks and disasters that undermine their graduation. However, the MPG aims to address this challenge by building target beneficiaries potential for income generation and self reliance through provision of a holistic support package consisting of the existing benefits for defined period and services such as advisory services and access to grants and linkages with income generation opportunities.

#### 2.4.4 HEALTH

Rwanda's health sector consists of three institutional levels including; the central, intermediary and peripheral. The central level comprises of the Ministry of Health (MoH), Rwanda Biomedical Center (RBC) and national referral and teaching hospitals. The central level organizes and coordinates the intermediary and peripheral levels of the health system and provides them with administrative, technical and logistical support. MoH is mainly concerned with policy and strategy formulation, monitoring and evaluation, capacity building and resource mobilisation. RBC's mandate is to provide quality affordable and sustainable health care services through innovative and evidence based interventions and practices. Rwanda has five National Referral and Teaching Hospitals<sup>IV</sup> that provide tertiary care to the population. The intermediary level of Rwanda's health services sector consists of three district referral hospitals and four provincial hospitals that have been upgraded to lessen the demand from services at the national referral hospitals. The peripheral level of the health services sector is part of the decentralisation structure of the GoR headed by the District Health Unit (DHU) responsible for coordinating provision of health services, planning, monitoring and supervision of health facilities that include the district hospitals, 499 health centres and health posts. In addition to administration, logistics management and supervision of community health workers (CHWs), district hospitals only provide MOH approved healthcare packages, including inpatient/outpatient services, surgery, laboratory, gynaecology-obstetrics and radiology services. Health centers provide preventive services, primary health care, in-patient care, referrals, and basic maternity services. Health posts provide basic health services such as immunization, family planning, growth monitoring and antenatal care. At the village level, CHWs provide prevention, promotion and some curative health services.

The GoR has continued to demonstrate its commitment to provision of quality healthcare to its citizens through for example attainment of the Abuja declaration of allocating not less that 15 percent of the state's annual budget the health sector<sup>73</sup>. In addition, coverage of health insurance stands at 90 percent of the population with 81 percent covered under the CBHI. Along with other innovative practices such a performance based financing (PBF), Rwanda's health system has been able to enhance its efficiencies that have resulted in achievement of most of the sectors targets over the Health Sector Strategic Plan (HSSP III) timeframe. Under the EDPRS II, the health sector had six key targets of which four have been achieved or are on track, one is on watch and one is lagging behind. Between 2012 and 2016 progress was realised in child (0-5) mortality rate that dropped from 76 to 50 deaths per 1000 births, Sero-positivity for HIV among Pregnant Women attending Ante-natal Clinics dropped from 1.5 to 0.6 percent, births taking place in health facilities increased from 63 percent to 91 percent and maternal mortality rate decreased from 476 to 210 deaths per 100,000 births. Limited progress has been realised in the infant mortality rate that stands at 32 against a target of 22 deaths per 1,000 births and use of contraceptives by women (15 - 49 year) that is at 31 percent against a target of 72 percent<sup>74</sup>. Subsequently, over the past 20 years Rwandans' life expectancy has increased from 51 to 64.5 years (62.5 for males and 66.2 for females) and fertility rate reduced from 4.6 in 2010 to 4.2 in 2015.

The good performance of Rwanda's health sector is greatly attributed to various components of the country's health system that have enabled the sector reach most of the millennium development goals (MDGs) and achieve the HSSP III outcomes. Some of the key attributes of Rwanda's health system that have enabled these achievements include; expansion of medical education and establishment of a mandatory continuous professional development program for doctors. Restructuring of the health sector working group (HSWG) and thematic working groups (TWGs) as well as establishment of DHUs that have all contributed to improving policy dialogue and effective coordination of partners and interventions in the health sector. Quality control of pharmaceutical products, storage capacity, availability of essential commodities and rational use of medicines have greatly improved and a pharmacovigilance system has been

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>IV</sup> King Faisal Hospital, Rwanda Military Hospital, Kigali University Hospital (CHUK), Butare University Hospital (CHUB) and Ndera Hospital 31

established. Health care packages have been defined, accreditation standards developed, disseminated and implemented and quality assurance teams assigned for all medical facilities. The sector also has a health management information system (HMIS) that gathers all routine medical data and an open electronic medical records system functional in 62 percent of health centres and district hospitals<sup>75</sup>. A national health research agenda is operational and all health research is authorised by the MoH.

Despite a robust and functional health system, achievements and progress realised in the sector are still bogged by various challenges that undermine the results and present risks of resurgence of disease as was observed with malaria in 2016, where malaria incidence increased from 26/1,000 in 2010 to 308/1,000 in 2016, slide positivity rate increased from 15 percent in 2010 to 37 percent in 2016 and Malaria proportional morbidity from 4 percent to 16.6 percent<sup>74</sup>. Some persistent issues in the sector include; high staff turnover and undefined career path for health professionals, insufficient coordination and synergy of council secretariats hampers activities of medical professional councils, DHUs lack sufficient resources and capacity to ensure effective coordination and monitoring of decentralised health services, limited engagement of the private in the health sector, weak stock management and poor quantification and forecasting of needs contributing to stock-outs and inadequate transportation of commodities. Although the CBHI has increased the proportion of citizens with access to affordable health care, sustainability of the system remains in limbo with insufficient contributions coupled with fluctuations in membership adversely affecting the increasing cost of health care. Worse still, many interventions in the health sector are largely financed externally. Despite the vast network of health facilities, efforts need to address further expansion of the health infrastructure to sectors without HCs, IT infrastructure in health facilities, provision of specialized services at secondary and tertiary levels, emergency and pre-hospital services and investment in quality service delivery. Also issues remain in HMIS data quality and use at all levels, improving reporting rate from private health facilities, linking and ensuring interoperability of all information systems as well as strengthening the health research system. In recent years there has been a gradual shift from mainly infectious diseases in the younger age-groups towards increasing numbers of non-communicable diseases often in older age groups which require more costly tertiary care facilities not readily available in the country.

### 2.4.4.1 MATERNAL, REPRODUCTIVE AND CHILD HEALTH

Rwanda's fertility pattern is characterised by a high early (women 15 - 19 years) fertility rate of 45 births per 1,000 women followed by a rapid increase to higher levels among women age 20 - 29 equivalent to 179 to 213 births per 1,000. Fertility is still high at age 30-34 (186 per 1,000) and 35-39 (134 per 1,000) before declining among women ages 45 - 49 years (12 per 1,000 births). By the end of her childbearing years, a Rwandan woman has had an average of 4.2 births. Even though the current total fertility rate is high, it has declined overtime from 6.1 in 2005 and 4.6 in 2010. There are significantly lower fertility rates between women in urban areas (3.6) compared to women in rural areas (4.3) and highest (4.6) in Western and Eastern regions of Rwanda<sup>76</sup>. This means that, if current fertility levels were to remain constant, by the end of her childbearing years a woman living in a rural area would have an average of 0.7 children more than a woman living in an urban area, implying more rapid population growth rates in rural areas.

Regarding family planning, although almost all women and men in Rwanda within the reproductive ages 15 – 49 acknowledge awareness of different family planning methods, only 31 percent of all women (53 percent currently married women and 36 percent sexually active unmarried women) use contraceptive methods. Level of current use of contraceptives is one of the indicators most frequently used to assess the success of family planning program activities and one of the determinants of fertility. Use of any contraceptive method increases with increasing education, from 48 percent among women with no education to 55 percent among women with a secondary education or higher. Use of any contraception increases with increasing wealth as well, from 48 percent among women in the lowest wealth quintile to 57 percent among those in the highest quintile. Meanwhile, contraceptive use is higher among married women in urban (57 percent) areas

compared to rural areas (53 percent). Over 90 percent of contraceptives are supplied by the public health sector and 4.4 percent from private health facilities<sup>76</sup>.

Infant mortality in Rwanda declined from 50 to 32 deaths per 1,000 live births between 2010 and 2015. In the same period under-5 mortality declined from 76 to 50 deaths per 1,000 live births. The decreases in infant and under-5 mortality are likely to reduce due to the implementation of integrated management of childhood illnesses in all health facilities and in community health services and the introduction of new vaccines among others. Neonatal and post-neonatal mortality rates are 20 and 13 deaths per 1,000 live births, respectively and perinatal mortality rate is 29 deaths per 1,000 pregnancies. Childhood mortality is higher in rural areas (44 deaths per 1,000 live births) than in urban areas (32 deaths per 1,000 live births). Differentials in mortality by province, particularly under-5 mortality, are also substantial. The city of Kigali has the lowest rates of neonatal mortality (12 deaths per 1,000 live births) and under-5 mortality (42 deaths per 1,000 live births). The highest neonatal mortality rates are found in West and South (25 deaths per 1,000 live births), while the highest infant mortality rates are found in East and West, 51 deaths and 41 deaths per 1000 live births, respectively. The East province has the highest under-5 mortality rate (86 deaths per 1,000 live births). Infant mortality rates are lower among households in the highest wealth quintile than the lowest (40 deaths and 80 deaths per 1000 live births). Childhood mortality in Rwanda varies considerably by the socioeconomic characteristics of households and mothers, for instance mortality rates are highest among less educated mothers and the poorest households. The survival of infants and children depends in part on the demographic and biological characteristics of their mothers. Typically, the probability of dying in infancy is much greater among children born to mothers who are too young (under age 18) or too old (over age 34), children born after a short birth interval (less than 24 months after the preceding birth), and children born to mothers of high parity (more than three children). The risk is augmented when a child is born to a mother who has a combination of these risk characteristics. At least 25.9 percent of all births in Rwanda between 2010 and 2015 fall within these single high-risk categories<sup>77</sup> and are contributing factors to the realised infant mortality rates.

	Births between 2010 and 201	
Risk category: Single high-risk category	Percentage of births (precent)	Risk ratio
Mother's age $< 18$	1.90	2.01
Mother's age > 34	2.00	0.39
Birth interval < 24 months	6.30	0.94
Birth order $> 3$	15.70	1.11
Total	25.90	1.08

Table 4: High-Risk fertility behaviour

Source: NISR, RDHS 2014-15

Pre and postnatal care remain essential parts of maternal health to reduce risks and complications during pregnancy, delivery and postpartum periods. Between 2010 and 2015, 99 percent of women with live births received at least one antenatal care from a skilled health provider, while 44 percent of them attended four or more of the recommended antenatal care visits during their pregnancy, an increase from 35 percent before 2010. In the same period 91 percent of live births were delivered in a health facility and were all assisted by a skilled health provider<sup>76</sup>. These achievements are partly due to the GoR's commitment to support maternal and neonatal Programs through provision of new infrastructure for delivery and neonatal services, use of mobile phone for monitoring of mothers and new born by CHWs through the RapidSMS system and continuous capacity building for providers through the Human Resource for Health (HRH) program<sup>78</sup>.

Neonatal tetanus is a major cause of death among newborns in developing countries, however, 18 percent of pregnant women were not vaccinated against tetanus in the 2010-2015 period. Majority of these are

mothers below the age of 20 years (32 percent), implying age of mother as an important factor in tetanus coverage. Home deliveries are also still common practice especially in rural areas (9 percent), and especially among mothers that have not received antenatal care (46 percent), less educated (16 percent) and lower quintiles (14 percent)<sup>76</sup>.

A significant proportion of maternal and newborn deaths in the neonatal period take place within the 48 hours following delivery. For this reason, safe motherhood programs have recently placed special emphasis on the importance of postnatal check-ups, recommending that all women have a postnatal visit within two to seven days following the delivery. Following delivery, 43 percent of the women who gave birth in the two years preceding the 2015 Rwanda Demographic and health Survey (RDHS) received a postnatal care check-up in the first two days after delivery while only 19 percent of the newborns in the same period received a postnatal check-up. 55 percent of women did not have a postnatal check-up. Medical consultations by pregnant mothers is higher in urban (11 percent), among the higher educated (15 percent) and richest quintile (13 percent) compared to rural (3 percent), uneducated (4 percent) and lowest (2.9 percent) quintiles. This is mainly attributed to the concentration of doctors in urban areas. Also at least 59 percent of mothers identify access to health care services as the main limiting factor for participation in all recommended pre and postnatal care activities. Limited access to health care by pregnant women is mainly described by limited affordability (49 percent) and long distance (22 percent). Delays in seeking care and quality of care at health facilities contribute to the numbers of maternal mortalities observed, for example the frequent late attendance of the first visit presents a difficulty in attaining the required 4 antenatal care visits. Also many health facilities still lack basic and emergency obstetric and neonatal care capacity including shortage of skilled staff especially midwives with a low ratio of 1 to 66,749 population<sup>74</sup>.

Only 6 percent of newborns in the 2010-2015 period were of low birth weight (less than 2.5 Kgs) with majority born in rural areas (6.9 percent) by mothers with no education (7 percent) and among the lowest wealth quintile (8.1 percent)<sup>76</sup>. This indicates higher chances of infant and child mortality among more vulnerable households. In addition to traditional vaccines (BCG, OPV, DPT and measles) that have been used since the beginning of vaccination program in Rwanda, six new vaccines have been introduced in routine immunization. Hepatitis B and Haemophilus Influenza type B vaccines in combination with DPT were introduced in 2002, pneumococcal vaccine was introduced in 2009, rotavirus vaccine was introduced in 2012 and combined measles and rubella vaccine introduced in 2013. Rwanda Vaccination program generally follows the World Health Organization recommended vaccines for routine immunization, and all required vaccines now are given in routine immunization<sup>79</sup>. In Rwanda, a child is considered fully immunized when he/she has received all recommended vaccines by age 12 months and has their immunisation card indicating all vaccines received. 93 percent of children (12 - 23 months) received full immunisation and less than 1 percent had not received any vaccinations by the time of the 2015 RDHS. Vaccination coverage is the same in rural and urban areas in Rwanda. Prevalence of common childhood diseases among those under-5 years remains considerably moderate with 6 percent having symptoms of acute respiratory infections, 19 percent had a fever and 12 percent had diarrhoea, all in the two weeks before the 2015 RDHS.

## 2.4.4.2 CHILD AND ADULT NUTRITION

Nutritional status is the result of complex interactions between food consumption and the overall status of health and care practices. Nutrition continues to be a public health concern in Rwanda. However, there is strong commitment from the government and development partners to address the challenges in nutrition. Despite progress realised in addressing malnutrition including reduction in prevalence of stunting from 44 to 38 percent and wasting from 3 percent to 2 percent among children under-5 years between 2010 and 2015, prevalence remains among the highest in the world, ranking Rwanda 110 out of 132 countries<sup>80</sup>. To address the malnutrition challenges, the GoR has set up multisectoral initiatives and interventions including establishment of a National Nutrition and Food Program Coordination Secretariat to eradicate malnutrition

at MINALOC. The secretariat will provide technical support and coordinate the social cluster in central government, districts, development partners and civil society organisations, all working together in implementing nutrition programs<sup>81</sup>.

Lower body mass index (BMI) along with anaemia and other micronutrient deficiencies, is a risk factor for increased maternal and infant mortality, obstructed labour, post-partum haemorrhage, low birth weight, and production of lower quality breast milk. Prevalence of maternal anaemia contributing to poor health as well as low birth weight and birth defects is 19.2 percent. While 24.8 percent of women in lowest wealth quintile have any anaemia, this falls incrementally to 6.6 percent and 6.1 percent in the 4th and highest quintiles. Incidence of acute anaemia is extremely low across all quintiles. Inversely, women from higher quintiles are slightly more likely to be overweight, which is a risk factor for non-communicable diseases such as diabetes. Clear correlations are evident across all wealth quintiles, with the proportion of women shorter than 145 cm and with low BMI increasing incrementally alongside declining household income levels. 5.5 percent of women in the lowest wealth quintile are shorter than 145 cm, and 10.5 percent are considered thin and have a BMI below 18.5. These figures then decrease respectively to 1.5 percent and 5 percent in in the highest wealth quintiles. Inversely, 36.4 percent of women in the highest wealth quintile are either overweight or obese but this falls to 10.7 percent in the lowest wealth quintiles. Micronutrient intake is another indicator used to assess women's nutritional status. Here there is very little variation across the lowest and highest wealth quintiles with 49 percent and 48.2 percent having received at least one postpartum dose of Vitamin A. Approximately half of all women across all wealth quintiles also selfadministered de-worming tablets during their most recent pregnancy.



Figure 7: Nutrition status of children in Rwanda

Source: UNICEF, Situation analysis of children in Rwanda, 2017

If children are not adequately nourished they become increasingly at risk of poor physiological development, micronutrient deficiency, greater vulnerability to respiratory infections, diarrhoea and malaria in early childhood, an overall higher incidence of ill health throughout childhood and, ultimately poorer educational outcomes and life opportunities<sup>82</sup>. RDHS data indicate that childhood malnutrition decreased significantly between 2005 and 2015 with a reduction in the percentage of children that are stunted, wasted and underweight (18 percent in 2005 to 11 percent in 2010 and 9 percent in 20115), but also that stunting 35 remains a major concern. These improvements may be attributable to the National Plan to Eliminate Malnutrition, which, since 2009, has included active nutrition screening of children by CHWs. Children determined to be at risk of malnourishment are referred to a health facility for appropriate treatment using therapeutic milks, ready-to-use therapeutic food for severe cases, and a corn-soy blend for moderate cases. Other sustainable approaches have been initiated and include infant and young child feeding, community-based nutrition programs, behavior change communication (including mass media), and home food fortification (using micronutrient powders). The graphs below illustrate progress in stunting reduction, but also how stunting tends to most adversely impact on boy children, children from rural locations and/or on children from households from lower consumption quintiles.

Typically, the potential impact of Rwanda's higher agricultural performance on food security and nutrition is assumed to be largely positive. Participation in land consolidation as promoted by CIP positively affected consumption growth of roots and tubers between 2010 and 2013. Conversely, it negatively affected the growth in consumption of meat, fish, and fruits. Land consolidation did not have a significant impact on caloric intakes or the Diet Diversity Score, a core nutrition indicator. Further, it negatively impacted the growth in intakes of vitamin B12, which is mostly drawn from animal sources. The greater proportion of land allocated to CIP priority crops and poor market access and functioning are believed to be major explanatory factors for these impacts<sup>83</sup>. These results call for an evaluation of CIP activities in view of national food security and nutrition objectives and would argue in favour of a more flexible approach to providing support to priority crops and land consolidation schemes.

# 2.4.4.3 FOOD SECURITY

While stunting reduced at a steady pace, food Security is facing great challenges in the face of dynamic population growth as well as socio-environmental dynamics and climatic change. Important issues throughout its four pillars of access, availability, stability, and utilisation are affecting food security:

Access to food is still strongly constrained by notably high prices, unequal distribution (including through importations) and some lack of diversity of affordable food at certain periods of time. A deeper understanding of the food system and its functioning is necessary to tackle the above problems. In particular, the understanding of food balance needs, food deficits, the trade-offs between local production and importation, food price dynamics based on production, importation, local availability and distribution of food would help inform related decision-making to improve access to food for all Rwandans at all times.

For **Availability**, apart from continued intensification efforts, the production of diversified foods is still needed at the household level (including of staple crops and nutrition rich foods such as vegetables, fruits and animal products) and, in particular, if we consider the high levels of auto-consumption. Also, the coordination between production and importation should be improved based on food system needs.

**Stability** remains an important constraint. Resilience and risk mitigation strategies for food production systems need to continue to be developed, particularly at the household level. Further efforts for year-round production (including counter-season production) would be welcomed.

**Utilisation** is affected by food consumption patterns linked to knowledge, attitudes and practices and gender empowerment. Further coordination of knowledge/attitude and gender-related activities need to be prioritised. Finally, efforts to curb food contamination at all levels are needed, in particular, safe handling, safe storage (to curb aflatoxin) and controlled use of pesticides and wastewater.

Despite strong agricultural productivity growth, Rwandan households are increasingly dependent on markets to source their food for consumption. Currently 70 percent of Households are accessing food through markets. Absolute number of undernourished people increased from 4 to 4.8 million<sup>84</sup>, addressing food insecurity and malnutrition in Rwandan situations cannot be "business as usual". It requires food and nutrition security-sensitive safety nets that align actions for short-term seasonal food assistance, and long-

term resilience strategy for vulnerable households. Shock-responsive safety nets are also required in situation of natural disasters and/or sudden economic shocks. This is also linked to their livelihoods; which is a crosscutting sector, though majority are still employed in agriculture sector. Livelihoods as ways of earning income and food are reflected in the strength of the private sector, innovation, education and resource base. The role of ministry of trade and industry, as well as, local government social protection will be key to maintain the ability of households to achieved food security.

Ensuring households' food security all year round, require multi-sectoral policies and strategies, as well as the interventions of several ministries and national institutions and local governments. This should be viewed in light of always looking at the final outcome, contributed to by individual sectors (agricultural production, health, economic growth and innovation, infrastructure, industry and trade, water and hygiene, social protection, education, gender, climate and environment, peace, justice and strong institutions).

## 2.4.4.4 HIV/AIDS

According to the recent findings from the 2015 RDHS, HIV prevalence in Rwanda has remained stable at 3 percent during the last ten years, 3.6 percent of women and 2.2 percent of men are HIV positive. In general, HIV prevalence rises with age. Among women, the HIV prevalence increases from 1 percent among 15-19 year to a peak of 8 percent among 40-44 year olds and down to 6 percent among 45-49 years. Among men, the prevalence increases by less than 1 percent at age 15-19 to 4 percent among 40-44 years and reaches a peak of 9 percent at age 45-49. Though the overall prevalence of HIV was maintained, the comparison of HIV prevalence results, by sex and age groups, in 2010 and 2015, reveals that HIV epidemic in Rwanda is aging, as the highest prevalence shifts over time to older age groups. However, young people (15 - 24 years) constituting 9 percent of the people living with HIV (PLHIV) comprise 28 percent of the new infections with 71 percent of these being adolescent girls and young women<sup>85</sup>. The rate of mother to child transmission of 1.8 percent by 18 months, is a clear indication that the PMTCT Programme is on track towards achieving the target to reduce MTCT rate to less than 2 percent by 2015.

Despite this progress in the fight against HIV/AID prevalence remains high and on the rise among key populations in Rwanda. The Rwanda HIV/AIDS National Strategic plan (NSP) 2013-2018 identified key populations as female sex workers (FSW), men who have sex with men (MSM), and sero-discordant couples (SDC). The HIV prevalence among FSW is 45.8 percent nationally down from 51 percent in 2010 but has risen among FSW in Kigali city to 57.2 percent since 2010<sup>86</sup>. HIV prevalence among MSM in is 4 percent<sup>87</sup> and 3.1 percent among pregnant women attending Antenatal Care<sup>88</sup>.

HIV prevalence is slightly higher among respondents who are employed (3 percent) than among those who are not employed (2 percent) and three times higher in urban (6 percent) than rural areas (2 percent). By sex, 8 percent of women and 5 percent of men in urban areas are infected with HIV, as compared with 3 percent of women and 2 percent of men in rural areas. Overall, HIV prevalence in Rwanda is higher among respondents with no education (4 percent) than among those with a primary education (3 percent) and a secondary education or higher (2 percent). 5 percent of women with no education, 4 percent of women with a primary education, and 3 percent of women with a higher education live with HIV. The pattern differs among men, with HIV prevalence being 2 percent at all levels of education.

The health sector has been active in reacting to the HIV/AIDS epidemic especially through timely adoption of recommended response actions. One of the key changes in the national HIV response over the past 3 years has been an evolution in national guidance on when to start anti-retroviral treatment (ART). The 2016 WHO consolidated guidelines on the use of antiretroviral drugs for treating and preventing HIV infection recommends treating all individuals who are HIV positive as soon as possible following infection<sup>89</sup>. Subsequently, MOH revised the national guidelines in line with this policy and the "Treat All" approach was effected in July 2016. This policy change indicates that all HIV positive people should start ART as soon as they test positive, including those currently in pre-ART. Subsequently, Rwanda is on track towards

90-90-90 target by 2020, where by of the known 210,000 HIV positive people, 86 percent have been diagnosed and know their status, 85 percent are on ART and 82 percent have their viral load supressed to less than 40 copies per ml. However, there are notable age and sex disparities in ART coverage with lower participation of men (76 percent) compared to women (82 percent). Other important changes to the HIV programme since 2013 include increased focus of prevention, care and treatment and impact mitigation programmes on key populations as the main drivers of the epidemic (focus on population) as well as the increased use of subnational data to target interventions in certain areas such as high-prevalence regions and hotspots (focus on location). These changes are in line with UNAIDS 2016-2021 Fast Track strategy recommendations for more efficient and effective programming by focusing on the areas where the HIV epidemic is highly concentrated, and identify the places where services are lacking or not reaching the people in need of prevention services, testing, treatment, care and support. The HIV programme has also focused increasingly on reaching those PLHIV that do not know their status with HIV counseling and testing (HCT) services as well as monitoring the viral load of PLHIV on treatment to achieve viral load suppression. In addition, other important changes to the HIV programme since 2013 include: innovation in male circumcision (prepex), HIV testing technology (finger prick) among others.

Despite Rwanda's impressive progress in responding to HIV, current challenges include, increasing new infections among specific groups such as young females (15 - 24) and high prevalence among FSW and MSM. In light of reduced fiscal support to HIV prevention programs and the health sector as a whole the national response anticipates facing major financial constrains in achieving sustained success in responding to the demands implied by new international targets.

## 2.4.5 WATER AND SANITATION

The GoR recognizes the importance of water supply and sanitation especially in their role in preventive health care and socio-economic development. Under the EDPRS II, focus was mainly placed on water supply under the premise that ready access to water reduces time spent in searching for water and may improve education outcomes especially among girls who bare more of the cost of distant water sources as well as reduce the time and walking distance for women in search of water and increase time for quality child care<sup>90</sup>. Through access to clean water, GoR strategies presuppose that population hygiene and sanitation would be addressed and in turn reduce incidence and prevalence of diarrhea, intestinal parasites and environmental enteropathy which have complex and reciprocal links to child malnutrition<sup>91</sup>.

Subsequently most of the water and sanitation targets set during the last five years have been achieved or are on track with coverage of improved water supply and sanitation in Rwanda estimated at 85 per cent and 83 per cent, respectively, in  $2014^{92}$ . Urban households using improved water sources increased from 86.4 percent in 2012 to 90 percent in 2016 while in rural households the proportion increased from 72.4 percent to 83.7 percent. Also, households with access to improved sanitation facilities increased from 83 percent to 93.5 percent in urban areas and from 73 percent to 81.3 percent in the same period<sup>92</sup>. Recognizing these achievements the GoR aims to reach 100 percent coverage of improved water supply and sanitation during the 2018 - 2024 period. To achieve this target, substantial investments are required to fund the existing infrastructure, extension of new infrastructure as well as in ensuring sustainability, innovation, technical capacity and community participation are realized as these remain as critical gaps.

As shown in the table below use of improved water sources is high but access remains limited especially in rural areas where less than half the population has to travel more than half a kilometer to access safe water. In addition hygiene practices, such as hand washing remains extremely low for various reasons including availability of water and basically knowledge and awareness of the importance of basic hygiene.

Table 5: Status of water and sanitation indicators

Water and sanitation information	Rural	Urban	National
Households using improved source of water	84%	90%	84.8%

Households using improved sanitation facilities	81%	94%	83%
Households with access to safe water (within 200 m distance in urban and	47%	61%	-
within 500 m distance in rural			
Households with access to improved unshared sanitation facility	67%	47%	64%
Households where a hand washing place is observed <sup>76</sup>	10%	20%	11%
Households take some measure for rain water harvesting		17%	

Source: NISR, EICV4 2013/14

With over 83 percent of Rwanda's population located in rural areas, access to safe water in rural areas is a priority. The national water supply implementation strategy indicates that majority of households in rural areas depend on protected spring (48 percent), piped water at public stand pipes (32.3 percent), wells and unprotected springs (8.9 percent). Only 1.7 percent has piped water into their dwellings. More than 10,029 piped water systems and approximately 20,000 improved water points serve the rural population<sup>93</sup>. Only 36 percent of primary schools and 58 percent of health centers have access to tap water. The introduction of delegated management of rural water supply schemes in 2004 initially contributed significantly to increase of access to safe water. However, progress has significantly stalled in recent years with more than 50 percent of the private sector operated schemes failing to be run by professional operators. Most of the operators include small enterprises, individuals, cooperatives, associations and faith based organizations (FBOs). Typically, private operators are in charge of day-to-day operation including maintenance and fee collection, while districts are in charge of system extensions and major repairs. The delimitation between both responsibilities and the conditions for tariff adjustments have not been systematically defined. Payment is based on consumption and the private operator's remuneration depends on revenue collected. Districts keep a variable percentage of the fee and contract duration is typically between two and five years. However, an evaluation of this rural water supply model identified several weaknesses in the system including limited technical capacity and inefficient management of the water supply operations by both private operators and districts. In addition to technical challenges, there are various constraints in narrowing the gap between households with access to piped water and the un-served areas mainly including the long-distances to be covered by pipes and Rwanda's hilly terrain that will require considerable financial investment in pumping to ensure equitable access to clean piped water. However, the hilly terrain and built environment provide vast opportunity for collection of storm water runoff in Rwanda, but there is little evidence to suggest major consideration of this source.

Water and Sanitation Corporation (WASAC) is currently the sole urban water supplier and as of 2015 had 161,154 connections with 54 percent of these located in Kigali City. The urban water production capacity is 184,000 m<sup>3</sup>/day but the system is mired by technical and operational inefficiencies and limited capacity to meet demand. Current supply to Kigali is 90,000 m<sup>3</sup>/day against demand of over 120,000 m<sup>3</sup>/day <sup>94</sup>.

Although sanitation has improved in the last decade especially with eradiation of open defecation, only two thirds of available improved sanitary facilities comply with international standard definitions<sup>95</sup>. Very few households have installed flash toilets, mainly attributed to limited access to piped water to dwellings. Also Rwanda has no collective (water-borne) sanitation systems for agglomerated urban areas, except a few small sewerage systems for about 1,000 household's altogether, only in Kigali. Major hotels, hospitals, commercial buildings and some industries have installed their own sewerage (pre-) treatment systems. No integrated solid waste management approach has been implemented but planning processes for conventional sewerage and treatment systems for 3 districts of Kigali city is ongoing.

Hygiene and sanitation implementation in rural areas is mainly on individual household and/or institutional levels, e.g. schools. However, community health clubs have been introduced in districts and 98 percent of all 14,767 villages in Rwanda, but sanitation has not been a key focus for these platforms. A joint monitoring programme by UNICEF and WHO in 2017 indicated improved sanitation coverage at 62 percent nationally (rural: 57 per cent, urban: 64 per cent)<sup>96</sup>, while the EICV4 puts access to sanitation facilities at 84 percent and the 2015 RDHS at 72 percent. Overall, there are inconsistencies in the data available on levels of

sanitation and hygiene in Rwanda, which is partly attributed to the challenges in assessing quality of private facilities such as pit latrines used by the vast majority and hygiene practices.

In order to address issues in the sector and meet ambitious national targets, major institutional reforms have been implemented including separation of energy and water and sanitation operations resulting in the creations of the parastatal – WASAC and recent development of standalone policies for water supply and sanitation services to ensure adequate prioritization and target of especially sanitation related interventions. The Ministry of Infrastructure (MININFRA), the lead Ministry for water and sanitation sector in Rwanda, with technical and financial support from UNICEF, led formulation of these policies and strategies in 2016. The new policies include the national water supply policy, national sanitation policy, which incorporates hygiene, national water supply policies was delayed by mainly the lack of quality data to establish mainly baselines for the water and sanitation strategies, however, this is now being addressed at MININFRA by development of a sector MIS.

### 2.4.6 EDUCATION

Rwanda's formal education system has four main levels; pre-primary, primary, secondary and tertiary with Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) streamed at both primary and higher education levels. The system also has a non-formal education component, Adult Based Education (ABE). It is only the primary (6 years) and lower secondary (3 years), Nine Years Basic Education (9YBE), that is compulsory for all children from ages 7 to 15 years. Continuation to upper secondary (3 years) is determined by individuals' performance in national examination. The upper secondary level of education offers three different options; students can opt for continuing in general secondary schools, technical secondary school (TSS) or teacher training colleges (TTC) to train as primary teachers. Higher education is currently 4 years but is in the process of being reduced to 3 years to harmonise it with the EAC region.

As the lead of the education sector, the ministry of education (MINEDUC) heads policy formulation, planning, coordination, regulation, monitoring and evaluation of the entire education sector. The ministry works closely with semi-autonomous agencies including; Rwanda Education Board (REB) that provides national oversight for coordinating and implementing education activities at pre-primary, primary and secondary level; WDA that coordinates TVET provision and provides strategic oversight of the TVET sector; and Higher Education Council (HEC) responsible for monitoring and evaluating quality and standards of higher education institutions (HEIs) including all matters related to accreditation, enhancement of teaching and research. In addition to these, there are two independent advisory boards to MINEDUC; the National Science and Technology Commission, responsible for development, promotion and coordination of the country's Science, Technology and Innovation and Rwandan National Commission for UNESCO, responsible for coordinating UNESCO's related activities in Rwanda.

Under the Local Government Act (2013) District Administrations have responsibility for the delivery of education services. The extent to which MINEDUC, REB and WDA have influence at the district level is very much determined by the level of interest and priority afforded to education by the District Executives. District Development Plans (DDPs) determine district priorities and where resources are allocated. District Education Officers (DEOs) are employed by MINALOC and managed by their District Administrations. DEOs are actively involved in the planning, delivery and monitoring of education in their Districts. Below the DEOs are sector education officers (SEOs) responsible for overseeing delivery of education services and running of schools in basic education and TVET.

Although the GoR has prime responsibility for the education sector, external and national partners play a key role in providing both technical and financial support. CSOs, FBOs, NGOs, through the Rwanda Education NGO Coordination Platform (RENCP) and other development partners comprise a large part of the education sector-working group (ESWG) that plays a critical role in engagement and participation in

policy formulation, implementation and monitoring of strategies for educational development. The private sector has only of recent increased its involvement in the education sector with most investment realised in higher education, TVET and less in primary and secondary education.

Guided by the Education Sector strategic Plan (ESSP), now entering its fourth cycle, Rwanda has invested significant resources towards improving the quality and coverage of all levels of education, as well as towards implementing policies that aim to achieve universal and equitable access to basic education for all Rwandan children which have contributed to achievement of national targets, international commitments to Education for All (EFA) and MDGs. The provision of universal, compulsory and free nine years' basic education for children aged seven to fifteen years has had a significant impact on increasing access, and this is now being expanded to twelve years. The curriculum has undergone a major reform, with a new competence-based curriculum being phased in from January 2016.

### 2.4.6.1 EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION

It has been government policy to provide strong early childhood education (ECE) since 2011. The ESSP III 2011-2018, expressed the intent to promote ECE identifying the lack of good ECE in Rwanda as a root cause of shortcomings in the primary education system, and the gaps in enrolment coverage and lower rates of progression in particular. It also emphasized the need to target any rollout of ECE provision on the poorest communities and locations. The EDPRS II presented ECE as a means to ensure children are ready to start school on time and are able to develop basic skills that provide a foundation for learning at primary school and beyond and as a highly cost-effective approach to prevent inequalities later in life and to support future learning<sup>97</sup>. Subsequently, access to pre-primary education has increased from two public pre-primary schools in 2011 to 1,474 in 2016 and Gross Enrolment Rate (GER) in pre-primary increased from 12.9 percent in 2012 to 23.7 percent in 2016 and net enrolment rate (NER) from 14.2 percent in 17.5 percent in the same period <sup>98</sup>, all below the education sectors target of 28 percent by 2018.

Notable progress was realised in early childhood development (ECD) in Rwanda with 63 percent of children (3 - 6 years) developmentally on track in the domains of learning, literacy numeracy, physical and social-emotional development<sup>76</sup>. However, these percentages are much lower in lower wealth quintiles. Regarding literacy and numeracy, children aged 3 to 6 are developmentally on track at 5.5 percent in the lowest wealth quintile and 18.2 percent in the highest wealth quintile. While in relation to mothers' education, 2.5 percent of children with mothers who have no education are developmentally on track compared 18.8 percent with mothers who have secondary or higher education. Pre-primary education is only one aspect of ECD that requires interventions that also address maternal and child nutrition and health, the quality of parental care, child protection among others. However, efforts to improve access to early childhood education have been a major contributor to national achievements in ECD. Following adoption of Rwanda's first ECD policy in 2011, implementation of policy actions was hampered by various challenges that resulted, among others, in the relocation of implementation of the policy from MINEDUC to the ministry of gender and family promotions (MIGEPROF) to enhance a more coordinated and holistic integrated approach in addressing the needs of children between the ages of 0 - 6 years, including school readiness. Following this move, ECD has realised various achievements including elaboration of an updated policy, development of national standards and guidelines for ECD through support of UNICEF and development of an essential package of services for ECD in Rwanda. Also in 2016, for the first time GoR made provision in the annual budget to pay pre-primary teachers' salary and to give schools pre-primary capitation grants. This is likely to act as incentives for pre-primary teachers to remain in their positions and enhance sustainability.

Despite the progress realised in early childhood education since 2011, sector targets have not been met and net enrollment of 17.5 percent is still low. Firstly, the low NER despite a higher GER is indication that children outside the intended age group (3 - 6 years) continue to enrol in pre-primary education and

therefore will already be over or under-age on transfer to primary school, hence the need to expand access to the one-year school readiness programme prior to entering primary school, targeting the appropriate age group. Also the government is still not reaching its targets for inclusion of children with disabilities in preprimary. Although REB has implemented its national programme of training pre-primary teachers in ECE and implementation of the new competence-based school there are strong indications that the quality of pre-primary provision is barely improving, as there has been little implementation by teachers as a result of the training. This lack of implementation is attributed to several barriers to improving the quality of teaching and learning at pre-primary level. These include shortage of skilled ECE teachers, a lack of alignment between national education programmes and plans at the district, school and community levels, non-existence of a system of frequent and localised professional development for pre-primary teachers to follow-up on national training programmes, lack of support for pre-primary teachers from school and community leaders and parents, lack of solutions to the problem of enabling a material-rich environment for play-based learning in very resource-poor schools and lack of a knowledge and evidence-based of how to effectively implement the ambitious play-based, competence-enhancing pre-primary school curriculum in the Rwanda context. Also enrollment of children with disabilities in pre-primary schools remains very low at only 1 percent against an estimated 10 percent of children in the pre-primary age group having a disability in Rwanda<sup>99</sup>, low enrollment is attributed to inadequate awareness of parents with children with disabilities and limited availability of inclusive environments in existing pre-schools.

#### 2.4.6.2 PRIMARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION

Net enrolment rate in primary education has increased slightly from 96.5 percent in 2012 to 97.7 Percent in 2016, so has the Gross enrollment rate from 123.2 percent to 139.6 percent in the same period. There is not much difference between the NER for boys (97.3 percent) and girls (98.0 percent). Enrollment of children with disabilities in primary schools stands at 7.5 percent, which is close to the national target of 10 percent. However, major focus is still placed mainly on physical disabilities and limited attention made to any other disabilities that might affect learning. The emerging issues regarding student enrollment include the 16.4 percent increment in GER between 2012 and 2016, which is explained by those, enrolled in primary school being either over age or under age. Entry of over age children into primary one is a frequent occurrence contributing to the high GER. However, the main contributor to the GER is the high repetition rate in primary schools that has increased from 12.5 percent to 18 percent over the last four years. Also the primary school completion rate has considerably dropped from 72.7 percent in 2012 to 65.2 percent (59.3 percent boys and 71.1 percent for girls) in 2016, indicating a high drop out rate as shown in the table below. The ESSP target set the student teacher ratio target at 48:1 by 2017/18, however, this has not been met as the ratio by 2016 was 62:1, which is affecting the quality of primary education especially reducing student teacher interaction. The extent of limited delivery of quality education is evidenced by the low competencies in literacy and numeracy among primary school going children in Rwanda, especially in public schools. In 2014, only 45.3 percent (72.9 percent in private, 41.6 percent public) of primary two students achieved the grade level competency in literacy and only 32.9 percent (46.7 percent in private, 31.2 percent public) achieved the grade level competency in numeracy. Meanwhile, in primary five only 44.1 percent (85.6 percent in private, 44.1 percent public) achieved the grade level competency in literacy and only 38.3 percent (75.5 percent in private, 36.3 percent public) achieved the grade level competency in numeracy<sup>100</sup>. Overall, less than half of the students in public schools, especially in rural areas, achieve the required literacy and numeracy competency levels to move on to the next grade in the Rwanda education system.

Class	2015		2016	Loss	Percent
Primary One	639,656	Primary Two	541,555	-98,101	-15
Primary Two	532,842	Primary Three	463,477	-69,365	-13
Primary Three	432,429	Primary Four	394,689	-37,740	-9
Primary Four	365,879	Primary Five	341,410	-24,469	-7

Table 6: Primary school transition rates (2015 - 2016)

Primary Five	311,261	Primary Six	198,420	-112,841	-36
Primary Six	177,638	Senior one <sup>V</sup>	130,511	-47,127	-27

Source: MINEDUC, Education Statistical Yearbook, 2016

GER for secondary schools in Rwanda has only slightly decreased in the last four years from 38 percent (37 percent males, 40 percent females) to 37.2 percent (35.8 percent males, 38.5 percent females). On the other hand, in the same period, NER has increased from 28 percent (26 percent males, 30 percent females) to 32.9 percent (31.2 percent males, 34.6 percent females). However, the transition rate between the final year of primary and the first year of secondary is still low (63 percent). This is due to high repetition and dropout rates in primary as well as increasing numbers of overage children in primary. These statistics indicate that close to 60 percent of children of secondary school going age in Rwanda are not enrolled in secondary. Worse still, the transition in secondary from one class to the next is also considerable low with each year losing between 4 and 20 percent of its enrolled students through repetition and drop out with the most significant losses occurring between upper and lower secondary as shown in the table below. The numbers of students with disabilities is 1 percent of those enrolled in secondary education in 2016, this is far below the proportions initially in primary schools. This indicates a high dropout rate of children with disabilities between primary and secondary that needs to be monitored.

Table 7. Secondary		1011 1 <b>u</b> tes (2010	2010)		
Class	2015		2016	Loss (Repetition/drop out)	Percent (
Senior One	130,511	Senior Two	118,794	-11,717	-9
Senior Two	115,775	Senior Three	92,921	-22,854	-20
Senior Three	90,156	Senior Four	72,707	-17,449	-19
Senior Four	71,238	Senior Five	67,139	-4,099	-6
Senior Five	69,700	Senior Six	67,110	-2,590	-4
Senior Six	66,556				

Table 7: Secondary school transition rates (2015 – 2016)

Source: MINEDUC, Education Statistical Yearbook, 2016

The secondary school student teacher ratio decreased from 34:1 to 28:1 in the last four years but remains higher than targeted and only 69.2 percent of the teachers in secondary are qualified teachers. This again is affecting the quality of secondary education. To address some of the challenges in the quality of education in Rwanda, the GoR introduced the competence-based curriculum in 2015 across all levels of the Rwandan education system to meet the characteristics of diverse school populations and to respond to the needs of learners, society and the labour market. The curriculum uses a holistic, learner-centred approach that requires major changes in teaching methodology and use of a wider range of assessment techniques. This has implications for teacher training and the necessary provision of support and guidance provided to schools to ensure the effective and efficient implementation. The application of activity-based learning and the need to ensure all levels of ability are participating and achieving, means teachers will need to be prepared to differentiate and work collaboratively to become more inclusive. Inclusive issues will therefore need to be integrated across all activities, and especially into all training to enable this process of change.

The issues highlighted in primary and secondary education including but not limited to low numeracy and literacy competencies among majority of primary school children, high repetition and drop out rates at all levels and low transition from primary to secondary can be attributed to quality aspects in primary and secondary education in Rwanda. Some of the key challenges stem from the lack of sufficient skilled and qualified teachers at both levels, teachers have a poor command of the English language, which is the compulsory language of instruction from primary four onwards, limited technical and financial capacity to disseminate and implement the new competence-based curriculum effectively. Also, most schools lack basic infrastructure such as classroom blocks resulting in high student teacher rations, only 46 percent of secondary schools and 31.6 percent of primary schools have access to electricity and the student computer ratio stands at 13:1 in primary schools and 27:1 in secondary <sup>98</sup>, all implying challenges in rolling out of ICT

V Indicates the primary to secondary transition rate

in education, a key component of the new curriculum and pedagogy, for example the GoR's partnership with Microsoft to offer digital solutions to the delivery of education. Also, through decentralisation, district authorities have been given greater levels of accountability and decision-making in management of schools, however, most of these entities lack the required expertise and capacity to handle these new and evolving responsibilities to ensure required quality education is reached.

## 2.4.6.3 TVET AND HIGHER EDUCATION

Prioritisation of economic transformation and transition to more productive sectors such as manufacturing, ICT, tourism and hospitality, construction and mining has increased the recognition of the importance of technical and vocational education and training in Rwanda in the last six years. The 2015 TVET and Workplace learning policies have enhanced concentration of the education systems' focus on demand-driven and labour market oriented systems of training with programmes intended at producing skills required in the employment sector. Subsequently, between 2010 and 2016 the number of VTCs has increased from 63 to 392 and student enrolment from 67,919 to 116,292 students <sup>42</sup>. However, the proportion of female enrollment has dropped slightly from 46 to 42 percent between 2012 and 2016 and enrollment of students with disabilities remains low at 1.56 percent, owing to mainly the limited inclusive environment and teaching practices in TVET facilities <sup>100</sup>.

Despite the high investment in Rwanda's education sector, especially in improving the quality of training, the mismatch between skills provided and needs of employers, especially in the private sector have not yet been fully addressed. However, commendable efforts continue to be made such as establishment of the World Bank Supported Regional-African Centres of excellence in the areas of Energy for Sustainable Development, Internet of Things, Teaching and Learning Mathematics and Science, and Data Science, that aim to provide specialised training centres that will address some of the key issues, especially in more technical fields. The TVET system has been given a recent impetus with strong financial support from the German and Swiss development agencies. However, challenges remain, a significant number of trainers need to have their own skills and experience upgraded in order to ensure that their students develop the demanded skills-sets. Sector policy, career guidance, curriculum, pedagogical, and language of learning practices in TVET institutions need more industry engagement to enhance relevance and practicality and there is need for a shift in the attitude towards vocational training and associated jobs.

There were 45 tertiary institutions in Rwanda as of 2016 (10 public and 35 private) including Higher Education Institutions (HEIs), schools of nursing, colleges and technical institutions, with the establishment of four private tertiary institutions and the merger of seven public colleges/schools into the University of Rwanda (UR). In 2016, the Rwandan tertiary institutions counted 90,903 students with the majority enrolled in private institutions, 51,595 (51. 8 percent females) and 39,208 (30 percent males) in public institutions. Enrollment of PWDs in tertiary education in Rwanda stands at 0.48 percent, overall from primary through to higher education the proportions of PWDs are observed to reduce <sup>98</sup>. Net enrolment in higher education is calculated to be 1 percent, which is well below the Sub-Saharan Africa average of 6 percent<sup>101</sup>. Further more, student enrollment is highest for bachelor degree programmes (77 percent) and lowest for masters (5 percent) and PhDs (0.4 percent). Regarding fields of study, only 28 percent of students in higher education are enrolled in Science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) fields with females making up only 29.1 percent. Enrolment of students to universities (graduate and post-graduate levels) has been affected by socio-economic conditions/poverty, as well as the quality of primary and secondary education<sup>102</sup>.

As of 2016 there were 3,281 academic staff (21.1 percent women) employed in Rwanda's HEIs with 86.5 percent of Rwandan nationality and 13.5 percent foreign. The number of female academic staff in HEIs is very low and considerably reduces higher up the academic credentials and rank. Considering the University of Rwanda that employs almost half (42 percent) of the HEI academic staff in Rwanda, out of its total

1,378 academic staff (24 percent females), 286 (21 percent) hold PhDs and 769 (56 percent) hold Masters. Meanwhile, 2 percent are professors, 22 percent are lecturers and 41 percent are assistant lecturers. The proportion of women drops higher up the career ladder, see figure below<sup>103</sup>.



### Figure 8: UR Academic Staff Profile

The quality of higher education in Rwanda is yet to meet satisfactory global standards with the country ranking 24<sup>th</sup> out of 53 African states in terms of its national research outputs (publications)<sup>104</sup> and its highest-ranking HEI, the UR is at 3,557 globally<sup>105</sup>. Also in 2016 the HEC undertook an assessment of the quality of provision by HEIs in Rwanda that resulted in the permanent closure of at least three universities. Out of a composite sore of 1,000, the average score across all 28 HEIs assessed was 343, some scoring as low as 171. Some of the critical gaps in higher education include for example in STEM, an increasingly important field, having lowest enrollment hence a smaller than needed critical mass. Low output in STEM is attributed to various reasons for example, higher education in the STEM fields is expensive and with the current budget cuts to the public university that is the main provider of STEM courses, delivery is being compromised as there is already a shortage of adequately qualified teachers and lecturers and of laboratory equipment and materials in HEIs, as well as all other levels of education.

### 2.5 SOCIAL CLUSTER: PRIORITIES AND ANALYSIS OF UNDAP PROGRAMMING PRINCIPLES

The CCA classifies the described sectors as the social cluster in this analysis. Against each of the sectors described in the preceding sections of this report, the CCA has identified key priorities in each sector based on gaps identified in the context analysis as well as priorities emanating from consultations with sector working group leaders and respective sector strategic plans under development. These priorities are summarised in the table below and provide targeted starting points for the UNDAP planning processes.

A brief analysis of the current statuses of the different sectors is also provided against the four UNDAP programming principles; Leave no one behind, Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment, Sustainability and resilience and Accountability. For each of these programming principles the CCA provides not only gaps in the context and implementation status of each sector but also highlights positive progress or lessons that provide opportunity for lesson learning, replication across sectors and clusters as well as scaling up where applicable, however, emphasis is majorly placed on where gaps exist around the programming principles. Also using the concluded Rapid Integrated Assessment of Rwanda national policy frameworks alignment with the sustainable development goals, SDGs and SDG targets under respective sectors are presented in the table below.

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles
	<i>1</i> End poverty in all its forms everywhere

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles
8. Social Protection	2 End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and
	2         promote sustainable agriculture           5         Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls
	6 Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and
	sanitation for all
	7 Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all
	8 Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all
	9 Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation
	10         Reduce inequality within and among countries           11         Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and
	sustamable
	12         Sustainable production and consumption           13         Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts
	Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems,
	15 sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss
	17 Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development
	18
	17. Strengthen domestic resource mobilization, including through international support to developing countries, to improve domestic
	1 international support to developing countries, to improve domestic capacity for tax and other revenue collection
• Support implementation of a social protection	Leave no one behind
management information system for the	• Rural poverty (43.6 percent) is almost three times as high as
National Social Protection Program, and	urban poverty (15.2 percent) and remains higher than the
support linking MIS systems supporting	national average
complementary services, while further	Human rights, gender equality and women's
strengthening the VUP MEIS. Focus on	empowerment
improving targeting and monitoring through	• VUP is addressing some gender equality challenges through
support to tools development, including	• VOP is addressing some gender equality challenges through the scale up of expanded public works as a gender sensitive
household profiling.	and inclusive SP measure, including the provision of child-care
• Strengthen support to current SP measures, in particular links with complementary and basic	participants. Resources for further scale up are still required.
services. Focus on expanded public works as a	Sustainability and resilience
child, gender and nutrition sensitive measure	• Sustainability and resilience stand to be addressed with the
and the graduation package to enhance	new "minimum package for graduation" but it is a resource
livelihoods and increase food security. Focus	intensive approach necessitating adequate financial support.
on further strengthening referral and case	
management of VUP beneficiaries.	Accountability
• At policy and programme delivery level	• The VUP MIS if implemented correctly will address many of
• At policy and programme delivery level strengthens policy coherence and	the challenges and issues surrounding accountability of the
harmonization for the delivery of core and	programme. In addition, an SMS-Based appeals system for the VUP provides opportunity for transparency and accountability
complementary SP programmes, including	vor provides opportunity for transparency and accountability
services for children.	
	<i>1.2</i> By 2030, reduce at least by half the proportion of men, women and
	1.2 By 2050, reduce at least by hair the proportion of men, women and children of all ages living in poverty in all its dimensions according to national definitions
	2 End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and
	<ul> <li>promote sustainable agriculture</li> <li>Bensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages</li> </ul>
	4 Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong
9. Health	learning opportunities for all
	6 Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all
	10         Reduce inequality within and among countries
	11 Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and
	17 Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global
	partnership for sustainable development
• Strengthen inter-sectorial collaboration and	Leave no one behind
coordination to develop and implement joint	

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles
<ul> <li>strategies to address gaps in social determinants of health – Access to clean water, sanitation and hygiene practices.</li> <li>Scale up capacity building, screening, diagnostics and management of non-</li> </ul>	• Most indicators are only disaggregated to sector level, age and gender but not to finer levels such as vulnerable groups and other equity dimensions required to devise more targeted health solutions. For some demographics like young adolescents there is lack of data.
communicable diseases including nutrition and mental health	Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment
• Conduct health financial sustainability analyses to develop more comprehensive resource mobilization and financial sustainability policies and plans for the health sector.	• Special interest groups such as refugees and migrants are not wholly addressed in health sector strategies and policies. Provides an opportunity for the UN to support the GoR to domesticate the humanitarian-development nexus SDG targets in the health sector
	Sustainability and resilience
	• Existing health systems are strong but fragile and face high risks of resurgence of come diseases under control now if not strengthened. Also over reliance on external financing for health puts the sector at risk.
	Accountability
	• Demographic health survey provides data useful in accountability and progress of the health sectors, though further disaggregation is needed to support more targeted interventions
	<b>1.3</b> Implement nationally appropriate social protection systems and measures for all, including floors, and by 2030 achieve substantial coverage of the poor and the vulnerable
10. Maternal, Reproductive and Child health	<ul> <li>2 End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture</li> <li>3 Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages</li> <li>4 Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all</li> <li>6 Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and</li> </ul>
Distinguistics of interacted Descendenting	sanitation for all Leave no one behind
• Prioritization of integrated Reproductive, Maternal, Neonatal, Child, Adolescent Health (RMNCAH) high impact interventions across the continuum of care with a focus on	<ul> <li>Infant and maternal mortality remain highest in rural areas and among most lowest wealth quintiles, young mothers and uneducated groups.</li> </ul>
improving quality of services, and advocating for uptake of Family Planning to reap the demographic dividend.	Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment
	• Access to health services is an observed human right in Rwanda, however access to quality services especially in rural areas remains a challenge contributing to low participation by women in programmes such as antenatal care and subsequent higher infant and maternal mortality
	Sustainability and resilience
	• Many maternal health projects are heavily externally financed presenting risks in continuity of gains in absence of funding
	Accountability
	• RDHS and different project reports provide detailed statistics on maternal, child and reproductive health, sufficient to inform sectoral decision-making.
	2 End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and
11. Child and Adult Nutrition /Food	promote sustainable agriculture
Security	5         Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls           10         Reduce inequality within and among countries
	12 Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles
• Evaluate nutrition sensitive interventions and	Leave no one behind
scale up based on evidence, and strengthen multi-sector coordination of nutrition interventions especially through support to the East and Nutrition Security Security	• Child and mother malnutrition is most prevalent in lowest wealth quintiles and rural areas among households heavily depend on own subsistence agricultural production.
<ul><li>the Food and Nutrition Security Secretariat.</li><li>Provide support to the ECD centres and</li></ul>	Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment
school feeding programmes to address nutrition among children of school going aged	• Several projects have been implemented to support child nutrition but not much effort has been laid on addressing malnutrition among women or the wider population.
• Engage in dialogue on the impact of the crop intensification programme on national nutrition and support food integration of	Sustainability and resilience
programmes such as "one cup of milk" per child and food fortification projects	• Many nutrition projects are heavily externally financed presenting risks in continuity of gains in absence of funding, also until recently there was limited integration and coordination of projects addressing malnutrition.
	Accountability
	• RDHS and different project reports provide detailed statistics on child malnutrition, sufficient for sectoral decision-making.
	2 End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture
12. HIV/AIDS	3 Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages
	4 Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all
• Increase focus on evidence informed	Leave no one behind
programming to reduce new HIV infections in general population, focusing mainly on; youth and adolescents; key populations: female sex workers and MSM and their potential sexual partners with HIV prevention	• HIV prevalence is highest among female sex workers and men having sex with men and yet this is a demographic that is overlooked in the Rwandan context of development planning hence leaving them prone to stigma and other negative socio- economic consequences.
and treatment services; scaling up treat all strategy, increase access to ART for children and young adolescents living with HIV.	Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment
• Strengthen evidence generation and coordination of HIV response nationally and at district level with a particular attention to cities eg City of Kigali where HIV prevalence	• Female Sex Workers make up the demographic with the higher prevalence of HIV and yet the occupation is illegal in Rwanda. This reduces the ease of reaching out to them with treatment and awareness interventions.
is very high 6.3 percent compared to national wide prevalence of 3 percent	<ul><li>Sustainability and resilience</li><li>Many HIV/AID prevention and control projects are heavily</li></ul>
• Reinforce capacity of non health sectors to mainstream HIV in their specific plans and	externally financed presenting risks in continuity of gains in absence of funding
implement evidence informed programs to	Accountability
accelerate prevention of new HIV infections and increase access to treatment to all PLHIV	• RDHS and different project reports provide detailed disaggregated statistics on HIV/AIDS, sufficient for sectoral decision-making.
13. Water and Sanitation	<ul> <li>3 Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages</li> <li>6 Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all</li> <li>9 Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation</li> </ul>
15. water and Samtation	<ol> <li>Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable</li> <li>Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss</li> </ol>
• Advocate to increase WASH sector financing	Leave no one behind
that goes beyond access to safe water but also	• WASH has focused mainly on access to water with more
holistically addresses challenges in hygiene and	emphasis on urban settings leaving rural areas with limited access to both water and satisfactory sanitation and hygiene practices or facilities.

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles
<ul><li>sanitation including both awareness and access to facilities</li><li>Develop innovative models to sustainably</li></ul>	<ul> <li>Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment</li> <li>There is limited evidence of consideration of gender</li> </ul>
scale low cost solutions for WASH.	dimensions or human rights approaches in the WASH sector
• Further develop WASH through reinforcing capacity of government institutions and private operators, strengthen sector regulation, and establish a comprehensive sector management information system	<ul> <li>Sustainability and resilience</li> <li>Effective and efficient coordination and operations of the actors in the WASH sector has not yet been realised and poses threats to systematic scaling up and sustenance of both service delivery in the sector.</li> </ul>
• Support development and implementation of centralised liquid and solid waste, particularly sewage, disposal and treatment systems, especially for urban areas	<i>Accountability</i> • Quality of data available in the WASH sector is very poor and inconsistent across the different sources making planning across the country difficult.
14. Education	<ul> <li>By 2030, reduce at least by half the proportion of men, women and children of all ages living in poverty in all its dimensions according to national definitions</li> <li>Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all</li> <li>Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls</li> <li>Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development</li> </ul>
• Enhance inclusive and quality teaching and	Leave no one behind
learning outcomes at all levels of education by building teachers' capacity, including English, and soft skills and ensuring learning materials are available for all pupils, respectively.	• Need for more concerted efforts to ensure equitable access to all levels of education by all genders, PWDs, refugees and other minorities, as well as promoting lifelong learning, based on the national inclusive education policy.
<ul> <li>Support Integrating and modelling information and communication technologies into curricular design at all education levels and teacher development programmes.</li> <li>Ensure equitable access and opportunities at</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment</li> <li>Enhance focus on youth as peace building makers and on gender disparities in access to education especially at TVET and tertiary levels</li> </ul>
<ul> <li>all levels of education, regardless of age, gender, socioeconomic status, location, status or ability and promote lifelong learning.</li> <li>Integrate heritage education into national curriculum</li> </ul>	<i>Sustainability and resilience</i> • Implementation of competency-based curriculum, use of ICT and other innovations in education need proper analysis and planning (included costed plans) to be well addressed if quality goals are to be realized.
	Accountability • The education sector has an education information system (EMIS) generating detailed statistics for the sector but capacity to analyze and use the information to inform planning and implementation remains in question.
15. Early childhood education	<ol> <li>By 2030, reduce at least by half the proportion of men, women and children of all ages living in poverty in all its dimensions according to national definitions</li> <li>Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all</li> <li>Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls</li> <li>Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development</li> </ol>
• Strengthen continuous professional development and systematic application of recruitment standards and salaries to engage the most qualified professionals in ECE and to regulate the qualification framework for ECE practitioners.	<ul> <li>Leave no one behind</li> <li>Enrolment in rural areas remains very low mainly due to limited availability of ECD facilities and facilities are not yet inclusive.</li> <li>Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment</li> </ul>

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles	
<ul> <li>Establish pre-primary assessment tools and guidelines to build capacity of ECE caregivers in undertaking formative and summative assessment.</li> <li>Develop and apply Pre-Primary Standards to set a benchmark for guidance for ECE and pre-primary centres. The standards should include, but not be limited to: teaching and learning materials; caregiver and teacher standards; infrastructure and playground material; curriculum.</li> <li>Improve the material base of teaching and learning materials in pre-primary schools (ensuring consistency and availability of appropriate resources, in mother-tongue language).</li> <li>Promote parent and community engagement to raise awareness on the importance of ECE and strengthen ties between the school and community and promote learning in the home.</li> <li>Improve school management and build capacity of head teachers, directors' of study, SEOs, and DEOs, in their understanding of and support to pre-primary education.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Gender in the lower levels of education has been addressed and proportions of males and females almost the same.</li> <li>Sustainability and resilience</li> <li>Although the government will start paying ECE teachers which was a main threat to sustainability, remuneration is still very low and compromises the quality of service availed. Also there is dire lack of professionals in the sector which exacerbates the quality challenge and threatens sustenance of the endeavour.</li> <li>Accountability</li> <li>EDE statics are readily available through different sources, especially the education statistics yearbook. But more detail in disaggregation is required to ensure higher accountability and underlying issues are addressed.</li> </ul>	
16. Primary and Secondary education	<ol> <li>By 2030, reduce at least by half the proportion of men, women and children of all ages living in poverty in all its dimensions according to national definitions</li> <li>Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all</li> <li>Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls</li> <li>Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development</li> </ol>	
Develop and institute systematic support	Leave no one behind	
structure to identify and mitigate dropout and repetition.	• Learner outcomes (numeracy and literacy) are low especially among students in rural areas and public schools implying	
• Develop a system to utilise national-level statistics to inform school-level performance	lower quality of primary education in rural and public primary schools.	
and school-level programme development and improvement plans.	Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment	
• Strengthen support to Continuous teacher development and support to the rollout of the	• Gender in the lower levels of education has been addressed and proportions of males and females almost the same	
<ul><li> Promotion of STEM, at the earlier grades, especially for girls.</li></ul>	<ul><li>Sustainability and resilience</li><li>There are issues in governance of primary and secondary schools as local authorities with the mandate to manage these</li></ul>	
• Promote early grade reading and numeracy through capacity development of relevant infrastructure (books, libraries, and teaching	<ul><li>entities lack the resources and expertise to accord the schools with the required support.</li><li>High repetition and drop out rates are compromising the gains realised in increasing access to education</li></ul>	
and learning materials), engagement of parents and communities for reading at home.	<ul> <li>Accountability</li> <li>Primary and secondary education statistics are available and robust but there is a lack in integration to enable more effective planning as most of the statistics are gathered for mainly reporting purposes.</li> </ul>	

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles
17. TVET and Higher Education	1.2       By 2030, reduce at least by half the proportion of men, women and children of all ages living in poverty in all its dimensions according to national definitions         4       Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all         5       Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls         17       Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development
<ul> <li>Ensure education is relevant to contribute to national social and economic development based on the competency-based curriculum in basic education, and through quality and inclusive programming in TVET (skills for work and entrepreneurship opportunities) and at tertiary level</li> <li>Develop a structured and coordinated TVET staff development and retraining</li> <li>Support the alignment of the EAC harmonisation process for regional standards for ease of mobility and recognition of certification.</li> <li>Strengthen and enable employers' engagement in tertiary education in order to ensure market responsive training as well as structured and qualitative workplace exposure for students (workplace learning) during training.</li> <li>Develop and implement a financing mechanism for tertiary education skills development, in a coordinated manner with the involvement of relevant stakeholders from the private and public sector</li> <li>Improve tertiary education; teaching; learning; and research infrastructure and develop a robust quality assurance system at national and institutional level, including accreditation of postgraduate (master and PhD) programs.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Leave no one behind</li> <li>With the increasing cost of tertiary education, enrollment of lower wealth quintiles is reducing implying a demographic of the population will probably be left behind as the country pursues a knowledge-based society.</li> <li>Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment</li> <li>Gender disparities are prominent in TVET, STEM fields and generally higher education with males dominating these more productive fields.</li> <li>Sustainability and resilience</li> <li>Public higher education has faced substantial GoR financing budget cuts which are compromising the ability of the institutions to deliver quality higher education and subsequently increasing the cost of student enrollment in Rwanda.</li> <li>Accountability</li> <li>Higher education statistics are available and robust but there is a lack in integration to enable more effective planning.</li> </ul>

#### 2.6 STATE INSTITUTIONS AND POLITICAL SITUATION

The state institutions and political situation theme of the CCA provides a description of the political context and situation of Rwanda as well as progress and development challenges of the country context. Sectors or aspects covered in this section of the CCA include inclusive participation and democratic governance, public accountability and service delivery, as well as justice and rule of law. Under each of these broad areas the situation is described and circumstances surrounding inequality, discrimination and vulnerability among others are explained as part of the analysis of underlying issues for prioritisation.

#### 2.6.1 INCLUSIVE PARTICIPATION AND DEMOCRATIC GOVERNANCE

The GoR operates under the principle of decentralization whereby public powers are dispersed to local administrative entities, and the country has a multiparty system for power sharing between political organizations while state powers are held by the three branches of government (executive, legislative, judiciary). The GoR defines governance as "the exercise of political, economic and administrative authority to manage the nation's affairs and the complex mechanisms, processes, relationships and institutions as well as leadership behavior through which citizens' groups articulate their interests, exercise their rights and obligations and meditate their differences." MINALOC is charged with promoting a culture of good governance in the fight against poverty and with territorial administration in decentralized entities. The Rwanda Governance Board (RGB) is mandated to monitor good governance, service delivery and all home-grown solutions.

The highest level of citizen participation in decision-making spaces in Rwanda's governance is through election of the president of the republic and representatives in the national parliament. The Rwandan Patriotic Front (RPF) under President Paul Kagame has been the dominant political force in Rwanda since 1994, with Kagame winning the last presidential elections in August 2017, following a referendum in 2015 that resulted in constitutional amendments that allowed for him to compete for a third term. The Rwandan legislative system with two chambers (deputies and senate) in parliament enhances the existence of various checks and balances between the executive and legislative branches. The Chamber of Deputies is made up of 80 members of which 53 (two thirds) are elected directly through a closed list proportional representation system featuring both registered political party representatives and independent candidates. In addition, 24 seats are reserved for women, two per province, through indirect elections, the national youth council and association for the disabled select two and one respectively. The Senate is comprised of 26 senators, 12 representing provinces that are elected by an assembly of district executive committees. 8 members are appointed by the president, the forum of political organizations designates 4 and 2 are reserved for university lecturers elected by academic staff of public and private universities. Reservation of seats for special groups such as women, youth, PWDs and other political parties in both chambers of parliament ensures minority representation.<sup>106</sup> However, overall the system with a mixture of direct elections, indirect and special elections, and direct appointments of some members is quite complex and its consequences not easy to unravel.

A mid-term review of Vision 2020 implementation revealed that Rwanda has done well in terms of technocratic governance, i.e., that which is linked to public management and focused on cultivating a capable state that stimulates economic growth and development<sup>107</sup>. The World Bank 2016 Ease of Doing Business Report ranked Rwanda 2<sup>nd</sup> after Mauritius in Africa and 56 out of 190 countries globally. In terms of good governance, the 2016 Mo Ibrahim Index ranked Rwanda 5<sup>th</sup> in Africa<sup>108</sup>, meanwhile against the 2010 World Bank governance indicators, Rwanda was among the top 30 percent of best-performing countries in terms of control of corruption, and outperformed 50 percent of countries in terms of governance flectiveness (i.e., competence of public service delivery and state bureaucracy)<sup>109</sup>. The 2016 Rwanda Governance Scorecard (RGS) also reaffirms this progress in good governance with overall scoring

on control of corruption, transparency and accountability increasing from 79.04 percent in 2014 to 86.56 percent in 2016.

In the lead up to the 2017 general elections, Rwanda made considerable progress in the area of political rights and civil liberties moving from a national rating of 77.05 percent in 2014 to 81.8 percent in 2016, with noticeable progress made in promoting the rights to media freedom scoring 75.2 percent in 2014 and 85.8 percent in 2016<sup>110</sup>. The above progress comes as a result of a combination of various efforts including the 2013 media reforms and the resulting revision of the institutional framework including the change from state regulation to media self-regulation and dedicating attention to media capacity development by revising the mandate of the Media High Council (MHC) which became a public organisation dedicated to media capacity development. Mechanisms have also been put in place to ensure promotion and protection of civil and political rights including the legislative reforms with review of the penal code, passing of the access to information law, laws regulating International NGOs, National NGOs, Religious based organizations among others. Even though overall quality of democracy improved to 83.1 percent from 81 percent in 2012 RGS, overall score of vibrancy of non-state actors in engaging in political decisions and policy processes remains low at 67.3 percent. Further still, political parties were only represented at national level, and availability of operational political parties' bureaus at district level dropped to 27 percent. There is also low participation of civil society organisations (CSOs) in governance processes, where only 72.3 percent of CSOs influence public policy, while CSOs holding state and private corporations accountable is at 48 percent and political parties' registration and operation at 74.9 percent<sup>111</sup>. In the area of gender empowerment, women participation in decision-making at central and local government levels is at 73.30 percent and 62.20 percent respectively and 87.1 percent of the citizen expressed satisfaction with gender parity in leadership<sup>110</sup>. These statistics reveal gaps in areas of political participation through political parties at lower levels and weaknesses in CSOs' engagement with the GoR on pertinent political issues. These continue to contribute to Rwanda's low scores globally that indicate political rights and civil liberties remain unchanged at 6 and 5 respectively in 2012 and both at 6 in 2015  $(1 = highest, 7 = lowest)^{112}$ .

The decentralization policy is presented as a means of ensuring participation at the grassroots level, whereby local communities are empowered in the decision-making process <sup>113</sup>. The village (Umudugudu) is Rwanda's smallest politico-administrative entity, with close ties to citizens. It is where problems, priorities, and needs are identified. Village leaders (umudugudu chiefs) are volunteers elected through direct and universal suffrage by village residents' aged 18 and over. Technical and key political issues are addressed at the cell level. The Cell Council mobilizes cell residents and identifies, discusses, and prioritizes problems within the cell. Headed by a democratically elected mayor and government appointed executive secretary, the district is an entity working with administrative and financial autonomy with the intent to promote democracy and socio- economic development activities. The District Council is elected at the sector level with each Sector represented by one councillor; three councillors who are members of the Bureau of the National Youth Council at district level; and the coordinator of the National Council of Women at district level, with at least 30 percent of women councillors<sup>114</sup>. Local level governance structures are remarkably accessible in Rwanda. The Village leaders usually know what is going on in their communities and are reachable via mobile phone, they take requests seriously and address them swiftly, maintaining a sense of order and often evoking a genuine sense of pride in helping citizens resolve problems. On a whole range of issues, local level authorities are present and accessible when it comes to services and the logistics of enabling more peaceful and comfortable communities. Though citizens generally feel that local level representation is accessible to them, there are issues with the electoral system itself. Village and cell elections are conducted in public forums where candidates self-nominate or are nominated by constituents. Voters are asked to stand in line behind their candidate of choice. National Electoral commission (NEC) volunteers then tally the people in each line. The system has been praised for its cost-effectiveness, but there are obvious concerns about the lack of private voting, which compromise the quality of electoral processes at local levels. Also despite clear guidelines on decentralisation and citizen participation especially with regard

to for example development planning and budgeting practice suggests the chain of accountability goes upwards towards higher authorities and not downwards towards the population with many suggesting decentralized authorities place more focus on reaching targets specified in public performance contracts (Imihigo) rather than strengthening mechanism aimed at enhancing citizen participation in developmental planning and decision-making processes<sup>115</sup>. This argument is backed by the low levels of citizen satisfaction in their participation in decision-making (59 percent) with much lower satisfaction ratings with regard to citizen participation in performance contracts planning (27.3 percent) and preparation of district budgets and plans (7.4 percent)<sup>110</sup>.

#### 2.6.2 PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY AND SERVICE DELIVERY

Enshrined in the first pillar of Vision 2020, accountable governance is recognised as the backbone of an inclusive and responsive government that promotes citizens welfare. Subsequently, the GoR has put in place various institutions and mechanisms that aim to ensure public accountability and transparency is embedded in Rwandan culture and society. At the helm of public accountability in Rwanda is the parliament that oversees executive action in accordance with procedure as determined by the constitution. The Prime Minister's report (2014) indicates significant progress with over 80 percent of Parliamentary recommendations implemented and there is evidence of increased direct engagement between select committees of the parliament with citizens. Development partners, specifically UNDP, has been active in supporting different parliamentary committees in their oversight role especially in its public outreach for citizens input into draft legislation and capacity building of legislators including induction training for new parliamentarians and training in legal drafting, policy and budget analysis as well as gender mainstreaming in budgeting and analysis. However, monitoring implementation of recommendations from parliamentary committees still requires some improvements. Also the parliament often encounters financial constraints in especially conducting its citizen outreach activities that are key components of their oversight role<sup>116</sup>. This is reflected in the low citizen satisfaction in the performance of the legislature in its role of oversight of government actions (58.64 percent)<sup>110</sup>.

Increased citizen participation in governance platforms at the local level has promoted increased government transparency and accountability, thereby impacting service delivery to citizens. One of such important forums at local levels is the "citizens day" conducted in all district offices every Wednesday morning were local authorities dialogue, debate and promote informed and effective decision making with citizens. These forums aim to promote joint planning and accountability at decentralised levels, while ensuring effective and efficient service delivery. Additionally, Joint Action Development Forums (JADFs) that comprise of all actors at decentralised levels from the private sector, civil society and any other organisations with physical presence in the districts actively participate at district level in planning, monitoring and evaluating all development related activities in their respective districts. This platform has contributed substantially to accountability at decentralised levels.

Meanwhile at national level, National dialogue councils (*Umushyikirano*) are held as annual events overseen by the President of the Republic of Rwanda and attended by all members of central and local government, diplomatic community and other invited dignitaries. This home grown solution is a leading example of participatory and inclusive governance that serves as a forum for Rwandans to hold their leaders and government accountable. All participants are held accountable for their performance and are directly questioned by the president and citizens through online and offline platforms about any issues related to their performance commitments. Subsequently, the 2016 RGS results reveal the best improver of all governance indicators in the control of corruption, transparency and accountability that increased by 7.52 percent to 86.6 percent in 2016.

Globally the media/press has been referred to as the "fourth estate" as a connotation for its role in holding the state accountable through ensuring transparency. However, in Rwanda the effectiveness of the press

has been shaped by historical events that have affected how the state relates with media. The press played an active role in the events preceding the 1994 Genocide against the Tutsi. In 1993, Radio Télévision Libres des Milles Collines (RTLM), began inciting anti-Tutsi hatred, claiming they represented a threat to Hutus. RTLM was launched by the then ruling party (National Republican Movement for Democracy and Development-MRND), who urged its nefarious transmissions. Despite warnings from the Minister of Information, RTLM continued to incite genocide and President Habyarimana remained supportive of the station by citing freedom of speech. Given this backdrop, during the formative years after 1994, the role of the media remained under strict control. The media laws of 1996, 2002, and 2009 severely punished or imprisoned offenders for defamation, incitement of genocide and public offences. The risks for media actors have since been cited as one of the main reasons for not investing in media<sup>117</sup>.

The media landscape has seen tremendous improvement with major reforms commencing in 2011 and continuing through 2013 with the revision of the media law that saw the introduction of different statutory bodies such as the Rwanda Media Commission (RMC) with the mandate to regulate the daily functioning of the media and conduct of journalists, this introduced media self- regulation to the Rwanda's media. That same year, the law on Media High Council (MHC) was passed and focused mainly on media practitioner capacity building, the Law on Access to Information was introduced as well as the laws transforming ORINFOR to the public service broadcaster Rwanda Broadcasting Agency (RBA) and a law on the Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Agency (RURA).

Despite reforms, there remains an aura of restricted communication and media expression. Self-censorship by the press is common in private and public media. Worse still, restrictive articles continue to exist in media laws and penal code. For instance, forced disclosure of sources under Article 13, seizure of documents in Article 10 both in the law regulating media, chapter V on press offences and defamation cases against journalists in the penal code and blocking of online media and websites, which goes against international standards. These factors continue to pose threats to press freedoms and freedom of speech in Rwanda. Rwandan media organizations are advocating for the decriminalization of press offences and stronger self-regulation in the context of an ongoing review of the penal code and media laws.

In recent years, the GoR has increased its recognition of the importance of effective and efficient service delivery, putting in place various mechanisms to ensure public services are available to citizens on time, at affordable costs and of required quality. Some key initiatives in this area have included the introduction of client service charters in the different public institutions. RDB is in the process of developing a consolidated national service delivery policy. Various service delivery campaigns have been launched nationally including "NAYOMBI" and "Nk'Uwikorera" to promote service delivery in both private and public sectors. The use of ICT has been a major catalyst in improving service delivery. In 2015, the GoR introduced an online platform, IREMBO, that is a one-stop portal for e-government services that currently hosts over 50 e-Services from more than 10 government institutions with more than 100,000 transactions per month. As a result of theses efforts, overall satisfaction of service delivery is at 72.93 percent, of which service delivery at the local government level ranks at 74.30 percent, social sector at 68.2 percent, and within the economic sector at 73.47 percent. Satisfaction with service delivery in social sector dropped from 72.79 percent in 2014 to 68.20 percent in 2016, this is mainly attributed to limited satisfaction with service delivery in the education and agriculture sectors.

#### 2.6.3 JUSTICE AND RULE OF LAW

The Justice, Reconciliation, Law and Order Sector (JRLOS) in Rwanda established by the ministerial order No123/03 of 13/10/2010 is a coordination structure that enables institutions to work together effectively towards common objectives, without compromising their operational, legal or constitutional independence. JRLOS objectives include high-level policy coordination, planning, communication and establishment of transparent clear and accountable mechanisms for oversight, direction, and implementation of the sector strategy<sup>118</sup>. The JRLOS comprises at least 18 members including among others, the Judiciary, Ministry of Justice (MINIJUST), Rwanda National Police (RNP), National Public Prosecution Authority of Rwanda (NPPA), and Rwanda Correctional Services (RCS). The JRLOS coordination secretariat is under the administrative authority of MINIJUST.

Globally, Rwanda is lauded as one of the safest countries in the world with the latest World Economic Forum (WEF) tourism report ranking Rwanda as the 9<sup>th</sup> safest country in the world<sup>119</sup>. The rankings consider "the costliness of common crime and violence as well as terrorism, and the extent to which police services can be relied upon to provide protection from crime." This safety status is reemphasized by the 2016 RGS that established Security and Safety as the best performing indicator with a score of 92.62 percent. Conversely, the Rule of law indicator in the 2016 RGS had an average performance with a score of 79.68 percent. This average performance is attributed to mainly sub-indicators including performance of the judiciary (75.05 percent) and access to justice (76.48 percent) with the most dissatisfaction attributed to case filing backlogs in primary courts <sup>110</sup>.

The RNP at the end of 2016 reported a 12 percent drop in the national crime rate from previous years with top crimes including assault, drug abuse, defilement, housebreak-ins, and threats without use of violence. These crimes constituted 73 percent of the total crimes registered. The majority of reported offenses are petty theft and mostly common in crowded public places of Kigali City<sup>120</sup>. However, these offenses are rarely detected making conviction difficult. Once perpetrators are caught, however, they are handed to the police for further investigation and prosecution. According to the NPPA, drug-trafficking is the most reported and convicted offense in Rwanda with 5,761 cases of drug abuse and trafficking received by prosecution authorities from January 2015 to March 2016<sup>121</sup>. RNP dealt with 17,000 cases in 2016 with nearly 24 percent related to cannabis and illicit alcohol. Most drug- trafficking offences focus on sellers rather than consumers in Rwanda with 64.8 percent of those apprehended being dealers. Most of the drug-related offenders are youth aged 18 to 35 who make up 71.9 percent of those apprehended offenders and at least 1.14 percent of arrested offenders are minors under 18 years <sup>121</sup>. A significant amount of intercepted drugs originate from neighboring countries, especially the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), Burundi, and Uganda and many of the local distributors are poor vulnerable youth<sup>122</sup>.

Regarding access to justice, every district in Rwanda has legal defenders referred to as Maisons d'Accès à la Justice, MAJ, (Access to Justice Bureau) who assist the population in legal matters. There are 3 for each district stationed to assist poor and vulnerable people at grassroots level. However, at the level of a district having only three people who can assist poor and vulnerable people is very low representation and MAJ are in general overwhelmed with a big number of people who need their support. Hence these defenders work closely and advise community mediators (Abunzi) at the local level. MAJ serves as the first point of orientation with legal aid service for Rwandans. Advocates provide legal and judicial aid to indigents and the needy by assisting, counselling, representing and pleading before all courts for poor community members upon proof with the certificate of indigence to the Rwanda Bar Association<sup>123</sup>. Currently, there is no public statistical data articulating the percentage of men and women among people working in MAJ. In addition to the MAJ, legal aid services are provided by state actors including; MINIJUST and University of Rwanda Legal Aid Clinic and non-state access to justice MINIJUST in collaboration with the law reform commission and parliamentarians are in the process of amending the law regulating the mediators

(Abunzi). The new law shall grant more powers to the mediators to handle cases of higher monetary value compared to the current law which authorize only cases with a value below 5 million Rwandan Francs, enabling litigants to access justice through alternative dispute resolution (ADR)<sup>124</sup>. Also, in 2016 the Integrated Electronic Case Management System (IECMS) was introduced to reduce delays and transaction costs of judicial case processing. The IECMS is operational in 83/83 (100 percent) Courts, 78/78 (100 percent) Offices in NPPA, 52/423 (12 percent) offices in RNP, 14/14 (100 percent) Prisons and RCS Head Office, 31 Offices MINIJUST (100 percent) (MAJs & Legal Services Department). These efforts resulted into an International Gold Trophy for e-filing system awarded to the Rwandan Judiciary in 2016 and has contributed to a reduction in court case backlog that is currently 27.52 percent<sup>125</sup>.

Perceptions and realities of the differences between rural and urban setting dwellers impact access to justice, however, Anecdotal evidence suggests that many citizens, especially in rural areas, do not have a clear understanding of the justice processes, some are not aware of their rights and entitlement and tend to perceive that justice is a privilege for the rich. Worse still, with a literacy rate of 68 percent<sup>126</sup>, ensuring access to equitable justice and utilization of services such as IECMS remains a challenge and increases the urban-rural divide. According to the RGS score for performance of the rule of law dropped from 81.68 percent to 79.68 percent. The previous high score was mainly attributed to the 2015 election of community mediators who handled most civil cases. However, the drop is attributed to the challenges in the new systems capacity to handle the increasing demand for justice at community levels and the need for further training and support of these alternative justice systems.

## 2.7 GOVERNANCE CLUSTER: PRIORITIES AND ANALYSIS OF UNDAP PROGRAMMING PRINCIPLES

The CCA classifies areas described under this section as the governance cluster in this analysis. Against each of the areas described in the preceding sections of this report, the CCA has identified key priorities in each area based on gaps identified in the context analysis as well as priorities emanating from consultations with sector working group leaders and respective sector strategic plans under development. These priorities are summarised in the table below and provide targeted starting points for the UNDAP planning processes.

A brief analysis of the current statuses of the different areas is also provided against the four UNDAP programming principles; Leave no one behind, Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment, Sustainability and resilience and Accountability. For each of these programming principles the CCA provides not only gaps in the context and implementation status of each sector but also highlights positive progress or lessons that provide opportunity for lesson learning, replication across sectors and clusters as well as scaling up where applicable, however, emphasis is majorly placed on where gaps exist around the programming principles. Also using the concluded Rapid Integrated Assessment of Rwanda national policy frameworks alignment with the sustainable development goals, SDGs and SDG targets under respective sectors and sub-sectors are presented in the table below.

Table 9: Governance Clusters pr	riorities and p	orogramming	principles
---------------------------------	-----------------	-------------	------------

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles
	5 Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls
18. Inclusive participation & democratic	11 Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and
	sustainable           17         Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global
governance	partnership for sustainable development
	16 Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective,
	accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels
• Continue targeted support to promoting	Leave no one behind
inclusive participation in accountable governance and citizen participation	• Governance interventions focus on generic categories of
	citizens; male, women, youth, with limited evidence of consideration of special groups e.g. PWDs, marginalised etc
• Build capacities of non-state actors mainly the	
civil society, the media and political parties to promote democratic governance.	Human rights, gender equality and women's
	empowerment
• Strengthen capacity within the media and its	• Gender equality is a key focus inclusive participation and
self-regulating bodies to enhance their role in increasing citizen participation in public policy.	governance interventions. However issues still exist around the quality of participation of women in leadership.
• Develop interventions to address the significant decline in the RGS indicator	Sustainability and resilience
"Investing in Human and Social Development", that	• Media struggling to sustain business models in a dynamic environment, e.g. evolution of social media
has dropped from 82.4 to 74.8 between 2011	Ŭ
and 2016. It is the only RGS indicator with a	Accountability
negative decline in the last 5 years.	Most governance-monitoring tools measure performance
	and progress as quantitative perception measures that do not provide a detailed picture of the governance situation. Need
	for more robust, reliable and hard data measures.
	5 Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls
	11 Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable
19. Public accountability and Service	17 Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global
delivery	partnership for sustainable development 16 Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable
	development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels
Develop inclusive and participatory	Leave no one behind
interventions to address service delivery,	• Digitization of services in a country with high illiteracy
especially in social sectors and economic and	levels (32 percent) could broaden the digital divide in terms
corporate governance indicators that have	of access to mainly social services.
been lagging behind, yet they are probably the ones that most bridge governance to	Human rights, gender equality and women's
development.	empowerment
• Continue to engage the GoR and the Media	• There is an imbalance between men and women in owning
sector in dialogue to enhance implementation	communication gadgets like cell phones and portable radio
of previously achieved policy reforms and fast	posts which limits women's access to information yet vital
track remaining changes in policy and regulatory instruments that continue to affect	for development
both local and global freedom of speech and	Sustainability and resilience
media freedoms performance indices	• Promotion of accountability and good service delivery interventions has been implemented mainly through
• Increased development partner support to	authoritative approaches as opposed to instilling the
good governance and accountability	necessary culture and norms. This presents risks to
mechanisms such as oversight committees in parliament.	sustenance in absence of accountable leadership at the helm.
	Accountability
	• Several governance-monitoring tools have been develop,
	but most of them measure performance and progress are
	quantitative perception measures that do not provide a

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles
20. Justice and rule of law	detailed picture of the governance situation. Need for more robust, reliable and hard data measures.         5       Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls         12       Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns         16       Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels         16.5       Substantially reduce corruption and bribery in all their forms         17       Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development
<ul> <li>to reduce on the burden of the justice sector (courts) as well as develop strategies to reduce on the current case backlog especially in primary courts.</li> <li>Digitization of the Gacaca archives to ensure preservation of evidence and information of value to the justice sector</li> <li>Provision of the IECMS in Kinyarwanda, capacity building for services providers and increasing citizen awareness of the system and its benefits.</li> <li>Support to the Rwanda Correctional Services (RCS) to comply and meet SMR standards</li> <li>Enhance support to implementation of the legal aid policy</li> <li>Institutional strengthening and support to functioning of the National Forensics Laboratory with a focus on enhancing efficiency of evidence processing especially in cases related to SGBV against children.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Leave no one behind</li> <li>The IECMS is yet to cover the whole country and the system is only run in English that limits use and threatens to leave some behind.</li> <li>Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment</li> <li>Cases forwarded to the local justice system (<i>Abunzi</i>) indicate under representation of women (36 percent), mainly attributed to societal stigmatization of women who stand up for especially their right to property, especially in rural areas.</li> <li>Legal aid for economically vulnerable populations victims of SGBV is still very much needed especially that the One UN Joint Programme (Up scaling the IOSCs) that was catering for legal aid and access to justice has ended and not renewed.</li> <li>Sustainability and resilience</li> <li>Financial resources to cover the operational costs of the JRLOS continue to be a major impediment to sustenance of the efficiency of the sector. However uses of home-grown solutions such as Abunzi to an appreciable extent to contribute to sustainability within the sector.</li> <li>An active SWG and governance tools capturing JRLOS performance with respect to citizen satisfaction are the main forms of accountability active in the sector.</li> </ul>

#### 2.8 HUMAN RIGHTS AND GENDER EQUALITY

The human rights and gender equality theme of the CCA provides a description of the human rights and gender context and situation of Rwanda as well as progress and development challenges in the country. Areas covered in this section of the CCA include the situation of human rights in Rwanda and how the country engages with human rights mechanisms and the status of gender equality in the country. Under each of these broad areas, the situation is described and circumstances surrounding inequality, discrimination and vulnerability among others are explained as part of the analysis of underlying issues for prioritisation.

### 2.8.1 HUMAN RIGHTS SITUATION

Human rights are protected in the constitution of the republic of Rwanda, in national laws and in international laws and treaties ratified by Rwanda. Rwanda has ratified almost all human rights conventions and treaties<sup>VI</sup> and voluntarily participates in the Universal Period Reviews (UPR) since 2011. Article 42 of the Constitution specifies that the promotion of human rights is a responsibility of the State but that an independent institution, National Commission for Human Rights (NCHR), particularly exercises this responsibility. The NCHR operates under the Law n° 19/2013 of 25 March 2013 determining the missions, organization and functioning of the NCHR. This Law also complies with the requirements of the Resolution No A/RES/48/134 of 20 December 1993 adopted by the United Nations General Assembly, establishing the Fundamental Principles of National Human Rights Institutions, determining the organization and functioning of National Institutions in charge of the promotion and protection of human rights. As part of its mandate, the NCHR monitors and reports on human rights situation in the country with respect to civil and political rights, economic, social and cultural rights.

Existing Rwandan laws protect the fundamental civil and political rights including the right to life, right to justice, the freedom of press, freedom of expression and of access to information, good governance and the right to vote and to be elected. Regarding the right to life no major infringements other than cases of homicide have been registered in Rwanda in the recent past. As elaborated in previous governance sections the right to justice remains a priority for the GoR as demonstrated by the various interventions such as legal aid services for the most vulnerable and IECMS that aims to fasten access to justice for all. Furthermore, in 2014 a justice for children policy was established to protect and provide legal assistance to children, subsequently, at least 528 children (440 boys 88 girls) have been represented before the Supreme Court and 1755 (1492 boys, 263 girls) in other courts <sup>125</sup>. However, despite the commendable progress in the justice sector, most (27 percent) of the human rights violation complaints received by the NCHR between 2013 and 2016 were all in the area of rights to justice<sup>127</sup>.

Freedom of press, expression and access to information are guaranteed by the state under article 38 of the contrition and provided for in article 19 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political rights ratified by Rwanda. Following the media reforms and digital migration, among others, access to information has substantially improved, however, as mentioned in previous sections, some legislation and practices such as blocking of online media continue to compromise the extent of freedom of expression in Rwanda.

In the Rwandan context, economic, social and cultural rights are identified through the right to property, the right to education, the right to health, the right to work and the right to a safe environment. Regarding the right to property, land is the most contentious property in Rwanda. Article 35 of the Constitution stipulates that private ownership of land and other rights related to land are granted by the State, the law determines modalities of concession, transfer and use of land. The progress in ensuring people's land rights are protected, with standing, complaints regarding land rights remain among the highest (30 percent)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>VI</sup> International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, Convention on Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, International Convention on Civil and Political Rights, International Convention on Economic, Social and Culture Rights, Convention on the Elimination of All Forms

of Discrimination against Women, African Charter on Human and People's Rights, Convention on the Rights of Child

received by the NCHR between 2013 and 2016<sup>127</sup>. However, most of these complaints arose following property rights awareness sensitisation programs conducted by different institutions indicating the continued limited awareness among Rwandans of their human rights, especially property rights among women in rural areas.

The right to education enshrined in various government policies has not been mired by any substantial violations except for the rising drop out rate especially in the transition from primary to secondary. Other than economic factors, part of the dropout rate reported as violation to children's right to education has been attributed to parents deliberately denying material support to children to attend school or children seeking employment for various reasons <sup>127</sup>.

The right to work is one of the most complex human rights in the Rwandan context given the country's limited economic resources, high population and its fast growth rates, hence ensuring access to work is not entirely achievable in the current context. Overall, workers rights are protected in labour laws however the structure of the employment sector (formal and informal) makes it difficult to ensure all workers rights are protected. This is worsened by the lack of strong workers unions to ensure workers rights are protected. This has resulted in continuous human rights violation complaints with regard to especially workplace related accidents, unpaid wages, no insurance or pensions among others.

Child rights through provided for under article 19 of the constitution and international conventions dating before 1990 have mainly come to the front of national agenda from 2011 with the amendment of the right and protection of the child law and establishment of the National Commission for Children (NCC). The commission is particularly responsible for monitoring the protection of child rights and to achieve this has established an Observatory of Child Rights (OCR) operating throughout the country. The most recent legal reforms in the framework of child rights promotion includes, adoption of the Integrated Child Rights Policy, enactment of law n°27/2016 of 08/07/2016 governing matrimonial regimes, donations and successions. Article 54 stipulates that legitimate children of the *de cujus* succeed in equal portions without any discrimination between male and female children and the Ministerial Order no 001/2016 of 08/01/2016 providing sanctions against parents who do not send their children to school and against other persons who employ children in work preventing them from going to or encouraging them to drop out of school<sup>128</sup>. Subsequently, of all human rights violation complaints submitted to NCHR in 2015/16, 448 (39 percent) were related to child rights violation and of these 428 (97 percent) were submitted by the OCR volunteers <sup>127</sup>. Most of the child right violations are in relation to school dropout, defilement, relatives taking over orphans' properties, worst forms of child labour and children not registered in civil status registries. Also, the 2016 13th National leadership retreat highlighted the urgency in addressing key issues including implementation of strategies aimed at child rights respect and avoidance of malnutrition, prevention of vagrancy, school dropout and child trafficking eradication. Despite this progress, some issues still remain including; comprehensive plans and programmes to address street children, orphans and other vulnerable children, limited human, technical and financial resources at NCC to fulfil its mandate, inadequate capacity to manage recovery and reintegration of child victims.

The rights of disabled persons aim to eliminate discrimination against PWDs and ensuring they have access to equal opportunities and all services as all other persons. Overall, the policies have been put in place to ensure inclusion of all PWDs in education and the workplace for example, but the implementation remains inadequate. Enrollment in all levels of Rwanda's education system indicates that not more than 2 percent of the PWDs in their respective age groups are enrolled in schools. This is mainly attributed to insufficiency of adapted schools, lack of expert teachers for CWDs and limited availability of teaching materials for this target group. Subsequently, in 2015/16 the NCHR processed only 7 complaints related to violation rights of PWDs, indication either continued exclusion from society or limited awareness of rights of disabled persons.

Overall, Rwanda has made commendable progress in observing human rights, especially in accordance with international norms and standards as demonstrated by the government's acceptance of the 67 UPR recommendations from the Human Rights council in 2011 and successful implementation of 63<sup>129</sup>. Also, national monitoring mechanisms indicate that respect for human rights improved from 78.6 percent to 85.6 percent while the Core International Human Rights Conventions score increased 83.2 percent to 97.7 percent between 2012 and 2016<sup>110</sup>.

## 2.8.2 GENDER EQUALITY

Following the 1994 Genocide against the Tutsis, Rwanda embarked on a recovery process that required participation of all citizens in all spheres of social and economic development. Cognisant of the fact that women constituted majority of the population (now 52.2 percent) and that the tragic event had left a large number of them as widows, the GoR laid strategies to ensure women's participation and contribution to national development was at par with that of men. This led to strong political will to mainstream gender into government programs, underpinned by institutional and policy frameworks that have been key to Rwanda's progress in addressing gender inequality. Subsequently, over the past two decades socio-economic outcomes have improved significantly and the country has emerged as a regional and global leader in advancing gender equality. The Mo Ibrahim Index 2016, with a score of 90.3 percent, ranks Rwanda number one in terms of absence of gender discrimination in Africa 108. Through the Global Gender Gap Report, the World Economic Forum ranks Rwanda number five in the world and again number one in Africa and through the sub-indicators, Rwanda is recognised as the first Country in the world in terms of labour force participation, wage equality, primary and secondary school enrolment and women representation in parliament<sup>130</sup>. The UN 2015 Gender development index ranks Rwanda 2nd globally with the lowest level of gender inequality, as measured by the GII in sub-Saharan Africa Error! Bookmark not defined. This global recognition and achievement resulted in the gender champion award to the President of Rwanda by the African Movement during the 2016 AU Summit.

Among key contributors to the advancement of gender equality in Rwanda, have been the constant engagements of women in economic empowerment opportunities, home-grown solutions to address gender inequality, an enabling legal framework and supporting institutions such as the dedicated national gender machinery comprised of MIGEPROF, Gender Monitoring Office (GMO), the National Women Council (NWC) and Rwanda Women Parliamentary Forum (FFRP). Also, provision of gender-disaggregated data through national tools such as the National Gender Statics Report has enhanced timely assessment and use of main indicators.

To strengthen its commitment to gender equality and empowerment of women, the GoR has committed itself to adherence and implementation of at least thirteen regional and international conventions and protocols on gender equality and women's empowerment<sup>VII</sup>.

Affirmative action measures have been put in place to ensure female representation in all levels of government and public administration. The Constitution of the Republic of Rwanda firstly reaffirms the country's adherence to the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women of 1 May 1980 (CEDAW). It then goes on to provide for quotas of a share of at least 30 percent for women in key decision making positions, i.e. 24 out of 80 deputies in parliament, 8 out of 26 senators. This has resulted in Rwanda having the highest percentage (64 percent) of women in parliament in the world, 38

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>VII</sup> The Universal Declaration of Human Rights; The Convention on Civil and Political Rights; The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW); The Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action; The Convention on Consent to Marriage, Minimum Age for Marriage and Registration of Marriages; The Convention on the Political Rights of Women; The Optional Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children supplementing the Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime, the UN Resolution 61/144 on Trafficking in Women and Girls; The Convention on Married Women's Nationality; The Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women; The UN Resolution 61/144 on the Intensification of Efforts to Eliminate all forms of Violence Against Women; The UN Resolution of Lininating Rape and other Forms of Sexual Violence in all their Manifestations including in Conflict and Related Situations; The Optional Protocol to the African Charter of Human and People's Rights to Women's Rights in Africa; The Kigali International Conference Declaration (KICD) on the role of security organs in endorse dy over 20 African countries

percent in the senate, 41 percent in the cabinet, 43 percent of Supreme Court judges, district advisory councils 43-52 percent<sup>131</sup>. However, gender balance in local government leadership has not yet been fully addressed as most positions from mayor (5/30) down to village chiefs continue to be dominated by men, raising concerns around effective implementation of all gender equality related programmes. Even though women's presence in political institutions such as parliament has increased, there is limited evidence to suggest that their ability to influence policy has significantly increased<sup>132</sup>. Different case studies indicated little emphasis among female representatives in parliament to engage in substantive policy issues. Most information gathered in these case studies tends to show that most parliamentarians have generally the same ideas and attitude that "reflects very much the political environment and culture in Rwanda where political diversity is limited"<sup>133</sup>. Similar observations and arguments suggest that there is a critical gap in the quality of overall participation and specifically women's participation in these platforms as there is limited evidence to suggest otherwise.

The GoR has instituted various legal reforms that continue to advance women's rights and contribute to them at the same level as men in both social and economic aspects of society. Some of the key legal reforms in the last EDPRS II period have included the 2016 law governing matrimonial regimes, donations granted or received within a family and successions were amended to ensure equal inheritance rights are protected. This complemented the 2013 amendment of the law governing land management that guarantees equal rights on land access, ownership and utilization to both men and women. These have contributed to increased ownership of land by women that increased to 26 percent compared to 18 percent of men, and 54 percent by both spouses. Also, in 2016, a law establishing and governing maternity leave benefits scheme was passed, a mother to take 3 months fully paid maternity leave, up to 1 hour out of official working hours for a period of 12 months to spend time with her child, and 4 days leave for fathers during the wife's maternity leave. Apart from protecting and advancing women's rights, these reforms indirectly contribute to women's economic empowerment through increasing access to collateral property. Subsequently, financial inclusion for women has increased from 68 percent in 2012 to 87 percent in 2016. However, the percentage of women using informal financial institutions such as village savings groups has more than doubled (39 percent) in the same period, leaving most women more reliant on informal sources of borrowing, mainly because of lower collateral requirements <sup>135</sup>. Women tend to shun formal financial institutions because of the costs involved in opening and maintain bank accounts <sup>11</sup>. The GoR Rwanda remains cognisant of the barriers limiting women's uptake of formal financial services and has instituted various programmes and strategies to address these gaps. Some of these include the Women Guarantee fund and the access to finance strategy for women and youth. Overall, despite the statutory reforms that have strengthened women's rights to land through marriage, inheritance, or on death of a spouse, their actual ownership and rights to the land are more symbolic in nature and less strictly enforced under customary law and practice134.

Rwanda is ranked 14<sup>th</sup> globally but 1<sup>st</sup> in labour force participation and wage equality for similar work. 46 percent of women are in the active labour force compared to 54 percent of men <sup>39</sup>. The informal sector employs at least 83 percent of the labour force, there is not much difference between men (53.7 percent) and women (46.7 percent) labour participation in the informal sector. However, within the non-agriculture informal sector the proportion of women drops to 34.2 percent and men increases to 65.8 percent. Unemployment rates among women (17.5 percent) are slightly higher than for men (16.1 percent). Gender pay gap that measures the relative difference between the male average hourly pay and the female average hourly pay for doing the same type of work shows that in Rwanda there is no gender pay gap in hourly earnings. However, if the monthly earnings is used, women are paid around 11% lower than the monthly working time of men is higher than the one of females. Gender gaps in wages and earnings remain significant, reflecting both direct and indirect discrimination. In the 2016 Global Gender Gap report, Rwanda ranks 1<sup>st</sup> for wage equality, but slips to 8<sup>th</sup> with respect to estimated earned income. This indicates

that women are underrepresented in the non-farm wage sector but overrepresented in independent agriculture. In particular, they are often involved in lower-valued subsistence agriculture, while men are more involved in cash crop production and marketing<sup>135</sup>. More still, only 38.6 percent of managerial positions (chief executives, senior officials, legislators) are occupied by women compared to 61.4 percent by men <sup>39</sup>, indicating continued existence of gender disparities in economic activity.

As Rwanda moves to a knowledge-based society and away from an agrarian economy, education, especially tertiary, is and will continue to be increasingly important for economic activity participation. Overall, enrollment of females across all levels of Rwanda's education system is increasing creating opportunity to address the imbalance of women in more gainful employment. However, analysis of trends in enrollment in education indicates that as one goes up the education levels the proportions of females considerably reduces. While female literacy levels are at 65 percent compared to 76 percent for men, primary and secondary education seems to have addressed enrollment of girls, the portion in TVET (42 percent) and higher education (43 percent) still continues to be lower than ideal <sup>98</sup>. The situation worsens with enrollment in STEM fields where female enrollment is 27 percent and males is 73 percent <sup>103</sup>. This needs to be checked and strategies to address female education in TVET and higher education devised so as to sustain the gains in women's economic empowerment in the long run.



#### Figure 9: Student enrollment and graduation 2016/17

Gender-based violence (GBV) is categorized into physical, emotional, economic, psychological, and sexual. Violence against Women and Girls (VAWG) continues to be a major problem in Rwanda<sup>136</sup>. This is in spite of the progress made towards gender equality in the political and economic spheres. Between 2006 and 2010 there were over 10,000 cases of violence reported of which 65 percent were sexual and GBV cases. It is estimated that the cases that are reported to the Police represent only 7 percent of all cases<sup>137</sup>. To address some of the associated challenges, Rwanda has numerous national and international laws that regulate GBV, including; the Constitution-2003, revised 2015, CEDAW, Convention on Rights of Child, Penal Code 2012, Art. 190, and the 2013 Code of Criminal Procedure law relating to GBV. The GoR has put in place various mechanisms to fight GBV from as early as 2001 when the Child Protection Law against Violence was passed and a National Committee on GBV created. The RNP established the Child and Family Protection Unit in 2002 to support the implementation of the Child Protection against Violence Law. In 2005, a Gender Desk was established at RNP to strengthen the capacity of the Police in its role in GBV prevention and to improve the response to survivors of GBV. In 2006, the GoR established a specialized unit to prosecute gender-based crimes at the national prosecution office. Prosecutors continue to be trained regularly to understand gender based crime dynamics. Research on child defilement has also been undertaken, including a survey on GBV with focus on defilement by NCHR in 2016. A toll-free hotline is open for reporting of GBV cases (3677) and the GBV unit also takes reports via phone (3935). Two safe houses have been secured to ensure the security of victims and witnesses of GBV and cooperation between the national prosecution office and Hamburg University in Germany for DNA analysis for gender crimes is underway.

The most significant intervention in the fight against GBV in Rwanda so far has been the introduction of Isange One Stop Center (IOSC) facility in 2009 at the Police Hospital in Kigali. RNP in partnership with UNFPA, UNICEF and UN Women established the first free of charge Pilot IOSC as a 24- hour services safe haven for victims and survivors of SGBV. It was set up to be free of stigma, offering medical care for sexual assault, counselling, legal services and forensic facilities. As a model centre, effort was made to ensure its adequate staffing with a full technical team of psychologists, a gynaecologist, general doctors, medical legal experts, a psychiatrist, a nurse and a Judicial Police officer. Six years down the road, there are at least 30 IOSCs, one in each district and the GBV reporting rate has increased to more than 50 percent with an average daily caseload of 3 to 5 cases that have been treated freely. Since inception of the first IOSC, over 8,000 cases have been registered<sup>138</sup>. IOSCs have also reduced the number of interviews for victims, decreasing the risk of tainting evidence and traumatisation. Despite this context, reported GBV cases still occur and have been increasing in the Rwandan prosecution system. Of sexual violence victims in 2016, 90 percent were women and remains more concentrated within minors. Among the women victims, girls aged 15-18 comprise 44 percent and 11-14 years account for 38 percent <sup>136</sup>. The caseload is a challenge due to a limited number of prosecutors, whose responsibilities span beyond just GBV cases. Other challenges are due to medical examinations to confirm GBV cases, where results often come late or are unclear, especially owing to the long distances victims have to travel to IOSCs. Additionally, the GMO reported that inadequate reporting mechanisms and a lack of systematic information sharing related hinder the ability to effectively address and prosecute GBV cases in Rwanda. They also reported that limited accountability mechanisms for NGOs working on GBV to deliver adequate services to victims and the engagement of CSOs in the provision of legal and psychosocial support to GBV victims are lacking<sup>139</sup>.

In 2003 the GoR initiated gender budgeting initiatives as a mechanism to comprehensively mainstream gender. However, this was not effectively adopted until 2008 within the framework of the EDPRS. Gender budgeting involves analysing budgets from a gender perspectives to create a deeper understanding of the extent gender is mainstreamed in resource allocations and subsequently reflects in policy and project implementation outcomes. Gender budgeting uses fiscal policy and administration to promote gender equality, girls and women's empowerment. Since its inception, gender budgeting has evolved from an accounting to a programming exercise. Through this process ministries, departments and agencies (MDAs) are required to ensure women's needs are integrated into their respective areas of responsibility. The process is overseen by GMO and MIGEPROF, but overall led by MINECOFIN. An organic Law on State Finances and Property, enacted in 2013, institutionalized gender budgeting as part of the government's budgeting framework, including accountability measures for gender-sensitive resource allocation across sectors, programs and projects through mandatory "Gender Budget Statements <sup>12</sup>.Overall gender budgeting in Rwanda has enabled targeted efforts to address almost all aspects of gender ensuring emphasis on their visibility in planning and execution processes. However, being a mandatory requirement with limited capacity building in the area of gender budgeting has compromised the quality of results, as there is limited capacity within government entities, especially in local government, to perform critical analysis budgets from a gender perspective. This remains a gap across most sectors, especially in the economic clusters.

As a result of the concerted efforts by the GoR and its partners, the realisation of almost unparalleled gender equality has contributed 0.5 percentage points to the growth differential observed in the country's GDP growth rate as compared to the EAC and sub-Saharan Africa average in the period 2004 to 2015. The greatest contributors to this have been the female legal equity and gender equality in opportunities and the labour market <sup>12</sup>. Therefore, to maintain this momentum there is need for more investment in women, especially in their economic empowerment in order to harness the potential gains from gender equality.
Recent studies have shown that eliminating gender inequality in labour force participation could add up to 11 percent of sub-Saharan Africa's GDP by 2025<sup>140</sup>. Thus certain silent issues such as socio-economic and cultural norms, such as women's disproportionate contribution to significant but largely undervalued care work e.g. household tasks, reproduction, and care of the family and community<sup>141</sup>, could impact the success of Rwanda's gender reforms should be addressed in next development assistance programing cycles.

# 2.9 HUMAN RIGHTS & GENDER CLUSTER: PRIORITIES AND ANALYSIS OF UNDAP PROGRAMMING PRINCIPLES

The CCA classifies areas described under this section as the human rights and gender cluster in this analysis. Against each of the areas described in the preceding sections of this report, the CCA has identified key priorities in each area based on gaps identified in the context analysis as well as priorities emanating from consultations with sector working group leaders and respective sector strategic plans under development. These priorities are summarised in the table below and provide targeted starting points for the UNDAP planning processes.

A brief analysis of the current statuses of the different areas is also provided against the four UNDAP programming principles; Leave no one behind, Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment, Sustainability and resilience and Accountability. For each of these programming principles the CCA provides not only gaps in the context and implementation status of each area but also highlights positive progress or lessons that provide opportunity for lesson learning, replication across sectors and clusters as well as scaling up where applicable, however, emphasis is majorly placed on where gaps exist around the programming principles. Also using the concluded Rapid Integrated Assessment of Rwanda national policy frameworks alignment with the sustainable development goals, SDGs and SDG targets under respective sectors are presented in the table below.

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles
	1 End poverty in all its forms everywhere
	5 Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls
21. Human rights	16 Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable
	development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels
• Support implementation of the National Human	Leave no one behind
Rights Action Plan (NHRAP) including but not limited to increasing awareness of the policy and supporting capacity building of institutions involved in implementation of the plan.	• No affirmative action has been undertake to target specifically "historically marginalized people" to enable them fully benefit from socio-economic an political integration
• Support the GoR to implement the 52nd UPR recommendations	Human rights, gender equality and women's
<ul> <li>Advocacy for and support to implementation of the ministerial orders for law No. 54/2011 of 14/12/2011 concerning children's rights as well as support to the NCC to have adequate human, technical and financial resources to fulfil its mandate at central and local government levels.</li> <li>Strengthen the Child Protection System through building capacities of the Social Workforce - community Child and Family volunteers known as <i>Inshuti z'Umuryango</i> / Friends of the family and</li> </ul>	<ul> <li><i>empowerment</i></li> <li>A gender audit has been conducted for the JRLOS and action steps have been included in the NHRAP and UPR recommendation 21 – 24</li> <li>Some recurrent issues that continue to be included in the lists of issues to the State Party formulated by the CEDAW Committee. A systematic review of those key issues and institutional commitment to address them should be a necessity.</li> </ul>
Social workers and Psychologists.	Sustainability and resilience
<ul> <li>Strengthen capacity of Isange One Stop Centres and transit centres to provide more multi-sectoral services, such as medical, psychological support,</li> </ul>	• General aura of limited comprehension of the concepts of human rights and how they relate to fundamental aspects of the economic and social sectors. This could threaten sustained of gains realized to date

Table 10: Human rights and Gender Clusters priorities and programming principles

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles	
social reintegration, short-term shelter, and police and legal assistance to child victims of trafficking and commercial sex work and adequately take into account the needs of children victims of sale, prostitution and pornography.	<ul> <li>Accountability</li> <li>The UPR provides an effective mechanism for identification of gaps in Rwanda's adherence to international standards of human rights, thus providing for accountability in HR.</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>22. Gender equality</li> <li>• Reorient focus from women participation in</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>1.2 By 2030, reduce at least by half the proportion of men, women and children of all ages living in poverty in all its dimensions according to national definitions</li> <li>1.4 By 2030, ensure that all men and women, in particular the poor and the vulnerable, have equal rights to economic resources, as well as access to basic services, ownership and control over land and other forms of property, inheritance, natural resources, appropriate new technology and financial services, including microfinance</li> <li>2 End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture</li> <li>4 Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all</li> <li>5 Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls</li> <li>5.5 Ensure women's full and effective participation and equal opportunities for leadership at all levels of decision making in political, economic and public life</li> <li>9 Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation</li> <li>10 Reduce inequality within and among countries</li> <li>16 Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels</li> </ul>	
leadership to economic empowerment of women, and women political participation at lower administrative levels.	• Rwanda has made commendable progress in ensuring gender equality however glaring challenges still exist between males and females especially shaped by cultural	
• Continue to build capacity in gender mainstreaming across all sectors	beliefs and traditional practices. Human rights, gender equality and women's	
• Strengthen National Women's council to fulfil their mandate.	empowerment	
• Strengthening preventions mechanisms of SGBV through increased awareness raising and campaigns while ensuring that they reach out to all he populations with no one left behind	• Large-scale economic empowerment of women in more productive formal sectors has not been sufficiently addressed.	
<ul> <li>Creation of income generation opportunities for women and girls through business and entrepreneurship facilitation regimes targeting sectors and geographic areas where women are dominant and especially the most vulnerable.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Sustainability and resilience</li> <li>Dependency on donor funding for generation of gender statistics at NISR threatens the sustainability of the country's ability to generate relevant sex-disaggregated data for planning and monitoring and evaluation.</li> </ul>	
• Launch the Violence Against Children and Youth Survey (VACYs) that captures national prevalence rates of physical, sexual and emotional violence and Develop a National Plan of Action to prevent and respond to VACYs	• Lack of adequate funding constrains the production of	
• Scale up IOSC zones covered by one health centre, also harness service delivery and strengthen human capital in all the IOSCs.		

## 2.10 CLIMATE AND ENVIRONMENT

The climate and environment theme of the CCA provides a description of the climate change and environmental conservation and natural resources management context and situation of Rwanda as well as progress and development challenges in the country. Areas covered in this section of the CCA include the

situation in environmental conservation, natural resources management, climate change resilience and renewable energy use and production. Under each of these broad areas the situation is described and circumstances surrounding inequality, discrimination and vulnerability among others are explained as part of the analysis of underlying issues for prioritisation.

## 2.10.1 NATURAL RESOURCES MANAGEMENT

Rwanda's environment and natural resources (ENR) sector consists of six sub-sectors including; I. Forests, II. Meteorology, III. Environmental Management, IV. Land, V. Mining, Petroleum & Gas and VI. Integrated Water Resource Management (IWRM). These six sub-sectors lie under the leadership of the Ministry of natural resources (MINIRENA), its implementing agencies include; Rwanda Environment and Climate Change Fund (FONERWA), an autonomous institution supporting green finance across key sectors, Rwanda Water and Forestry Authority (RWFA), Rwanda Land Management and Use Authority (RLMUA), Rwanda Mining, Gas and Petroleum Board (RMPGB), Rwanda Environmental Authority (REMA) and the Rwanda Meteorology Agency (RMA). The overall aim of these institutions is to ensure protection and conservation of the environment and optimal and rational utilization of natural resources for sustainable national development, thereby contributing to sustainable economic development by safeguarding the country's natural capital. This commitment by the GoR is reflected by the increase in the country's expenditure on environment and climate change that has increased from 0.4 to 2.5 present of the national budgets between 2004 and 2013<sup>142</sup>.

Given the small size of Rwanda, Land is one of the country's most important natural resources. The land sub-sector is very wide in scope as it covers all natural resources and forms the basis of most other sectors including Agriculture, Infrastructure, Geology, Environment and others. According to the land law 2013, Land in Rwanda is categorized into two: Individual land and Public land. Land in Rwanda is predominantly individual land. The sector is guided by the national land policy that seeks to establish and maintain a land tenure system that is secure for all Rwandans, land reforms that are necessary for good management and proper use of national land resources for harmonious and sustainable development that ensures protection of the environment<sup>143</sup>. In line with this policy the land sub-sector has realised various achievements in the EDPRS II period including; following completion of the countrywide land mapping and registration process, 8.6 million land titles have been printed and at least 84 percent of these have been collected by the rightful owners.

Despite the commendable progress in enhancing sustainable land resources management, the fact that 96 percent of rural households rely directly on predominantly subsistence agriculture for their livelihoods <sup>5</sup>, and practice farming on fragmented plots of 0.24 ha on average <sup>52</sup>, coupled with the rural household population projected to double by 2032<sup>63</sup>, present an imminent challenge for sustainable land resources management in Rwanda. Also, expanding urbanisation in the country presents risks of unplanned settlement and pollution which if not curbed could negatively affect the gains so far. Moreover, weak land use planning across competing interests and high levels of land degradation continues to occur, estimated to cost over 2 percent of GDP, reducing the country's capacity to feed 40,000 people per year <sup>142</sup> and resulting in sub-optimal utilisation of land resources. Although a national and Districts' land use master plans has been developed, they are not fully aligned. Also the existing public administration systems are not entirely equipped to rationalize, harmonize, monitor and enforce implementation of the master plans.

Rwanda's Forestry Policy and sub-sector strategy plan established in 2004, revised in 2011 and updated in 2017 aim to ensure sustainable forest management and the maintenance of a 30% forest coverage by establishing strong foundations for reliable domestic management and outsourced technologies in the forestry subsector<sup>144</sup>. Based on the previous sub-sector policies and plans, the forestry sub-sector has been able to increase forest cover to 29.8 percent by 2017<sup>145</sup>. However, this achievement continues to be threatened by the limited existence of alternative heat and lighting energy sources in Rwanda. Although

electricity grid connection more than tripled between 2009 and 2014, from 110,000 to 450,000 domestic connections, a considerable proportion of the population continues to remain off-grid, with one study estimating more than 40 percent of the population remaining un-served mainly because they have not paid the connection fees but have access to transmission lines<sup>146</sup>. Consequently, 99.3 percent of households in Rwanda utilise biomass energy for mainly cooking purposes<sup>5</sup>. The biomass is mainly acquired from tree cutting (57 percent) for use as fuel wood or charcoal (23 Percent)<sup>19</sup>. This continues to contribute to illegal cutting of forests, uneven distribution of tree resources and other negative effects on Rwanda's forest cover. More still, at least 40.7 percent of Rwandan houses are built using tree poles and unspecified proportions use timber in construction <sup>5</sup>. Thus, limited alternative energy sources together with the growing construction continue to outweigh the supply of forest tree products.

Rwanda's 2011 National Policy for water resource management along with the master plan adopted in 2015 aim to manage and develop water resources of Rwanda in an integrated and sustainable manner to secure and provide water of adequate quantity and quality for all social and economic needs of the present and future generations with the full participation of all stakeholders in decisions affecting water resources management<sup>147</sup>. The policy emphasizes the importance of a catchment-based approach to water resources management. Subsequently, several watershed projects have been implemented in the last seven years resulting into an estimated 10,000 ha of land well managed with terracing, afforestation, trenches and other methods 145. Moreover, the major trans-boundary basins under which Rwanda belongs to are the Congo and Nile basins. To advance cooperation on the shared water resources within the two basins, Rwanda has contributed to the establishment and continues to support the operationalization of the Nile Basin Initiative (NBI) and ABAKIR (Autorite du Basin du Lake Kivu and de la riviere Rusizi). However, increased competition for water resources in Rwanda amidst limited production capacity and weak coordination structures within the water supply and distribution sectors continues to undermine the progress so far in IWRM. More still, lack of a systematic solid and liquid waste management system in Rwanda not only continues to present pollution risks but also poses threats to public health. Meanwhile, the proportion of households using inorganic fertilizers has substantially increased from less than 25 percent to more than 35 percent in the last 10 years<sup>52</sup>. This also presents a water pollution risk in the medium to long term if sustainable alternates to increasing agricultural production are not identified and implemented.

The mining, petroleum and gas sub-sector has been undergoing a transition in Rwanda, recently culminating in the establishment of the Rwanda Mines, Petroleum and Gas Board by Law N 07/2017 to re-design the minerals sector to deliver higher-level results. The sub-sector aims to contribute up to 4% of Rwanda's GDP by 2050, including through value addition activities and gas sector developments from Liquified Petroleum Gas (LPG) in Lake Kivu. Realisation of this ambitious target will require substantial public and private investment in the concerned areas of this sub-sector. To further exploitation of minerals in Rwanda, geological surveys and exploration have been completed in three selected Potential Target Areas (PTAs) in Bugesera II, III and Rulindo II. The geo-surveys have recommended further and deeper exploration in thirteen Future Priority Areas on key minerals like Tin, Tungsten, Tantalum, Gold, Lithium, Rare Earth Elements, Nickel, Platinum Group Minerals and Base metal <sup>145</sup>. However, most of the mining in Rwanda continues to rely on artisanal and small-scale miners with limited capacity to utilise techniques and equipment that will reduce or avoid environmental degradation. Other challenges in the mining sector include; illegal mining and trading, limited knowledge of mining resources, inadequate assessment and management of environmental impacts and volatility of commodity prices that affect overall productivity of the mining sector.

#### 2.10.2 CLIMATE CHANGE RESILIENCE

Environmental management and conservation remain on top of Rwanda's sustainable development priorities. Environmental protection, conservation, promotion and overall management, including advisory to the government on all matters pertinent to the environment and climate change is the legal mandate of

REMA<sup>148</sup>. Under the guidance of this institution, Rwanda has realised substantial progress in the promotion of the green climate agenda and implementation of the Green Growth and Climate Resilience Strategy (GGCRS). Among the key achievements in the sub-sector Rwanda submitted its National Adaptation Programmes of Action (NAPAs) to United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) in 2006 and 2012 and developed its Intended Nationally Determined Contributions (INDCs) in 2015 confirming the country's commitment to reducing greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions, reinforced by its signing of the Kyoto Protocol in 2003. Several donors including the African Development Bank have committed several climate investment funds to support implementation of the GGCRS<sup>9</sup>.

Under the framework of the social protection programme, VUP, a green and climate resilient village model toolkit has been developed and piloted in three sites (Muyebe I, II and Rubaya) and three other sites (Kabyaza, Rusizi and Gashaki) are under construction and all thirty district development plans now each have a target to establish at least one "green village"<sup>149</sup>. As party to the Paris Agreement on Climate Change that commits the country to development of a pathway for low-emissions and climate resilience, Rwanda has implemented various projects to deliver on its climate change agenda commitments to reduce vulnerability to climate change through increased adaptive capacity. In line with this, 32 FONERWA Projects have been approved for funding including 10 Government projects, 7 Districts projects, 8 private sector projects, 4 NGOs projects and 3 joint NGOs-Districts projects, all worth RWF 32.7 bn.

Despite the impressive progress registered in innovation to promote climate change resilience, there is still limited awareness and understanding of environmental and climate change issues, especially among the productive sectors. This is worsened by the lack of a comprehensive framework for dealing with environmental and climate change issues in these sectors. Subsequently, there has not been much investment in climate-smart technologies from the private sector in Rwanda, ranging from industrial to hospitality sectors. More still, rural households, especially the most vulnerable and those that rely solely on subsistence agriculture continue to be worst affected by climate related impacts such as floods, landslides and droughts, indicating the need for scaling-up of the climate resilience projects implemented and underdevelopment in Rwanda.

Meteo Rwanda/RMA is guided by the 2010 meteorology policy and recently formulated strategic plan (2016-2019) to provide accurate and timely weather and climate information. The sub-sector also elaborated a Climate Data Policy in 2016 as a guide for good data management and treatment practices to be observed by producers and users of weather and climate data and Meteo Rwanda clients in general<sup>150</sup>. Also, meteorological data management has been improved for better planning & decision-making through the digitization of three synoptic stations and establishment of a new weather radar <sup>145</sup>. However, there are still gaps in the availability of modern meteorological infrastructure and local capacity to facilitate translation of weather and climate data into high-quality information products that can be tailored to user needs to for example, increase effectiveness of forecasting and early warning systems needed in areas like disaster planning and agriculture insurance based on weather indices.

Overall, all six sub-sectors are faced with a challenge of weak human capital in various technical and managerial aspects of the sector. There is limited skills and capacity in ENR sector monitoring and evaluation as well coordinating cross-sector mainstreaming and engaging private sector and civil society. Inadequate and unpredictable financing also mires the sector.

## 2.11 Environment and Climate cluster: Priorities and analysis of undap programming principles

The CCA classifies areas described under this section as the environment and climate cluster. Against each of the areas described in the preceding sections of this report, the CCA has identified key priorities in each area based on gaps identified in the context analysis as well as priorities emanating from consultations with

sector working group leaders and respective sector strategic plans under development. These priorities are summarised in the table below and provide targeted starting points for the UNDAP planning processes.

A brief analysis of the current statuses of the different areas is also provided against the four UNDAP programming principles; Leave no one behind, Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment, Sustainability and resilience and Accountability. For each of these programming principles, the CCA provides not only gaps in the context and implementation status of each area but also highlights positive progress or lessons that provide opportunity for lesson learning, replication across sectors and clusters as well as scaling up where applicable, however emphasis is majorly placed on where gaps exist around the programming principles. Also using the concluded Rapid Integrated Assessment of Rwanda national policy frameworks alignment with the sustainable development goals, SDGs and SDG targets under respective sectors and sub-sectors are presented in the table below.

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles
	2 End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture
	3 Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages
	4 Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all
	6 Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all
	7 Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all
23. Natural resources management	8 Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all
	9 Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable
	industrialization and foster innovation
	12 12. Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns
	13 Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts
	15 Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss
	16 Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development,
	provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels
• Increasing the amount of Government, donor	Leave no one behind
and private sector resources allocated to pro-	• The largest proportions of the population that solely depend
poor sustainable ENR programs such as	on agriculture are mainly those in lower socio-economic
Green Villages, sustainable agriculture and	categories, therefore ENR conservation solutions need to be
clean household energy.	mainly pro-poor if they are to leave no one behind.
• Technical and financial support (resource	• Shortage of alternative energy sources makes Rwanda rely
mobilization) to implementation of the	heavily of fuel importation with high access costs that
GGCRS	excludes the poor and limits their access to direct energy
ooono	services and complementary services such as quality health
• Enhance capacity strengthening to institutions	and education
responsible for management of land and natural resources use and allocation,	Human rights, gender equality and women's
prioritising synergies and collaboration with	empowerment
relevant regional and international agencies	• Poor women are particularly dependent on subsistence
with knowledge and experience in managing	agriculture, with low value addition in agriculture and forestry
natural resource use and management issues.	and low access to markets and credits risks leading to
• Establish an interdisciplinary programme at	
University of Rwanda and other polytechnics	overexploitation of fragile ecosystems and malnutrition.
	• Unsustainable use of natural resources and pollution tend to
private Universities focused on understanding	affect women more than men. Women often spend longer
and addressing climate change with a focus on	hours to collect firewood and water as resources decline and
action research innovation, sustainability and	are more exposed to indoor air pollution (respiratory
green economy	diseases), subsequently about 30 000 deaths annually are
• Build apparity of Universities / higher	attributed to poor water quality and hygiene (57%), indoor air
• Build capacity of Universities / higher	pollution (42%) and outdoor air pollution (1%).
education institutions to foster the	

Table 11: Climate and Environment Clusters priorities and programming principles

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles
development of green economy curriculum	Sustainability and resilience
<ul> <li>and competencies for youth employability as a pathway to transition to green economy and sustainable societies.</li> <li>Enhance Energy efficiency through improving the use of biomass, and promotion of affordable technologies to widen the poor's access to alternative forms of energy</li> <li>Capacity building to support institutional, legal and regulatory frameworks to enhance central and local government authorities capacity to successfully implement national energy policies and strategies.</li> <li>Support the production of sufficient data and strategic analysis to enhance decision-making process in the Energy sector.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Over 80% of Rwandans depend on land as their main source of livelihood through agriculture and yet arable land is limited, therefore increasing population pressure on limited land size present substantial risk to the sustenance of natural resource conservation practices being implemented if various alternative means of survival are not created. Worse still the heavy reliance on Rainfed agriculture reduces households resilience.</li> <li>Rwanda faces a triple challenge to meet the growing wood energy demand, to continue to feed its growing population from the same limited land surface/protect existing natural resources, and to provide modern energy access to the population as a whole. Meanwhile, extensive reliance on firewood is accelerating deforestation, contributing to soil erosion, loss of biodiversity, unsustainable agriculture and eventual climate change, all leading to a multidimensional poverty. In absence of alternative sustainable sources of energy, resilience of especially those solely reliant on fuel</li> </ul>
• Develop strategies to increase private sector investment in off-grid energy production	wood will continue in limbo.
• Support to research and development in renewable energy both in academic institutions and in the private sector.	<ul> <li>Accountability</li> <li>Limited capacity to generate data to monitor progress in the ENR sector that can be used to in strategic environmental assessment, planning and policy formulation.</li> <li>Limited availability of relevant energy data that can be used to sufficiently address gaps in the energy sector and hold different sector players accountable. e.g. where are losses the highest and what are the causes of the losses.</li> </ul>
24. Climate change resilience	2 End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and
24. Chimate change residence	<ul> <li>a promote sustainable agriculture</li> <li>3 Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages</li> <li>4 Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all</li> <li>6 Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all</li> <li>7 Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all</li> <li>8 Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all</li> <li>9 Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation</li> <li>12 Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns</li> <li>13 Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts</li> <li>15 Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss</li> <li>16 Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels</li> </ul>
• Increase cross-sectoral prioritisation of sustainable use of natural resources focusing mainly on transformation of the local economy away from its large dependence on natural resources with little value addition. This will require extensive support in formulation of policies and investments ranging from education, health, infrastructure and an enabling business environment that are gender sensitive and promote holistic skills and participation of the entire population.	<ul> <li>Leave no one behind</li> <li>Groups such as female-headed households, rain dependent farmers with less access to education, credit, off farm employment, basic services and infrastructure and alternative livelihoods remain highly vulnerable. It is important to keep these vulnerable groups among key targets of resilience and climate change interventions considering ways their capacities will be enhanced by interventions.</li> <li>Economic transformation focused on the service industry could reduce focus on the sustainable livelihoods of the</li> </ul>

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles
• Support to implementation of the robust monitoring and evaluation system being developed for the ENR sector. This will	majority of the population that rely entirely on land as a natural resource
include sizeable components of capacity building of local staff in relevant institutions and supply and installation of all the necessary equipment required to gather the data and generate the evidence required to monitor	<ul> <li>Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment</li> <li>There has not been sufficient focus or investment in creation</li> </ul>
climate change in Rwanda.	of improved opportunities for women and youth in productive and sustainable jobs in the green economy.
• Increase transparency on ENR issues and enhance scientific, media and CSOs capability to document and monitor climate change related issues and increase general population environmental awareness.	<ul> <li>Sustainability and resilience</li> <li>Other than ensuring execution of environmental impact assessments (EIAs), there is limited attention being given to</li> </ul>
• Identifying climate change vulnerability requires a clear conceptual framework. Understanding vulnerability and climate	creation and access to knowledge, technologies and infrastructure for sustainable land, water and forest resources.
resilience is fundamental to developing sustainable adaptation strategies. Therefore, within the context of vulnerability to climate change, the determinants of adaptive capacity must be addressed in order to examine the potential responses of a system to climate variability and change.	<ul> <li>Accountability</li> <li>Limited availability of environmental information and awareness by civil society and media required to hold the government accountable.</li> </ul>
• Promote green entrepreneurship through enhancing support to green innovations (technological or social) and development with special focus on sustainable management practises in agriculture, forestry and fisheries. Emphasis will be put on skills development, extension services and cash for work programme focused on mainly the poorest categories.	
• If water, energy and food security are to be simultaneously achieved, decision-makers, including those responsible for only a single sector, need to consider broader influences and cross-sectoral impacts. By broadening the perspective beyond water allocation, a nexus approach adds value to the IWRM approach in discussing the benefits of cooperation.	

#### 2.12PEACE-HUMANITARIAN-DEVELOPMENT NEXUS

The peace, humanitarian, development nexus theme of the CCA provides a description of mainly humanitarian context and situation of Rwanda as well as progress and development challenges in the country, with more focus on the divide between the humanitarian and development aspects, mainly covered in the preceding sections of this report. Areas covered in this section of the CCA include the situation in disaster risk management and response, the situation with refugees, migration and finally peace and security. Under each of these broad areas the situation is described and circumstances surrounding inequality, discrimination and vulnerability among others are explained as part of the analysis of underlying issues for prioritisation.

### 2.12.1 DISASTER RISK MANAGEMENT

Assessment of hazards and development of comprehensive disaster risk profiles for Rwanda only commenced in 2012 following the establishment of the ministry of disaster management and refugees affairs (MIDIMAR) in 2010. Prior to these strategic disaster response actions, Rwanda experienced and continues to experience growing number of disasters causing severe physical, social and economic damages and losses. The best known among these are listed in the table below. As seen below, the disasters have increased over the last 20 years mainly as a result of climate change in terms of frequency, intensity and persistence of extreme changes in heavy rainfalls, heat waves and drought among others. Frequency of rainfall deficits has reached 16 percent and in some cases annual rainfall has increased by up to 20 percent from the expected average <sup>9</sup>. These disasters have often resulted in landslides, crop losses, health risks, and damage to infrastructure, as well as increase in temperatures, this has resulted in proliferation of diseases, crop decline and reduced land availability that impacts food security and export earnings. Estimated annual losses from these disasters stands at a total of US \$60.72 million<sup>151</sup>.

Disaster	Year	No. Affected	Regions	Disaster	(Million
Drought	1994	1,000,000	South	Earthquake	1.68
Drought	1996	82,000	East	Floods	17.68
Drought	1999	894,545	East	Multi-hazards	30.36
Volcano	2002	300,000	North		
Earthquake	2008	Na	All		
Floods	2012	150,000	North, West		
Mass migration	2012	25,000	East		
Flood	2016	Na	North		
Drought	2016	Na	East		

Table 12: Disasters in Rwanda (1994 – 2016)

Source: MIDIMAR, National Disaster Risk Management Plan,

Prior to 2005, disaster risk management in Rwanda was more or less conducted on an adhoc basis. It is only after the country became signatory to the Hyogo framework for action 2005-2015 (HFA) that the GoR began to demonstrate its commitment to systematic disaster risk response (DRR) and has since used the HFA as a blue print for DRR in building the nation's and communities' resilience to disasters. The GoR has made important strides in the area of disaster risk management (DRM) policy and institutional frameworks. Rwanda's first national disaster management policy was adapted in 2012 as a guide for all DRM initiatives, activities, programs and projects in the country. The disaster management institutional framework established by the policy aims to ensure an integrated, coherent and coordinated approach among institutions and stakeholder involved in DRM in the country<sup>152</sup>. The National Disaster Management Executive Committee (NDMEC) is the highest DM decision-making body chaired by the Minister of MIDIMAR and composed of ministers from eight key ministries, the chief of defence staff and Inspector general of police. NDMEC makes decisions on national DM issues, especially during emergencies. The National Disaster management Technical Committee (NDMTC) made up of focal points from the line ministries that comprise the executive committee advises the NDMEC. Additionally, each district has a District Disaster Management Committee (DDMC) that works with the relevant stakeholders in each

district and reports to MIDIMAR on all matters related to DRM. The DDMC works closely with the Sector Disaster Management Committees (SDMC) that mobilizes communities for identification of risks and vulnerabilities as well implementation of contingency plans and programmes. To support all these committees, a National Platform for Disaster Risk Reduction (NPDRR), chaired by the Minister of MIDIMAR and co-chaired by the UN Resident coordinator, brings together all focal points in DRM and organisations (CSOs, NGOs, private sector, development partners) playing a significant role is Rwanda's DRM. This platform ensures an effective and efficient coordinated approach to DRM is maintained in the country. The DRM institutional framework is also complemented by a MIDIMAR/UN Joint Intervention Management Committee (JIMC), a joint coordination mechanism to facilitate the effective and efficient collaboration between MIDIMAR and the One UN in Rwanda. The JIMC made up of representatives at decision-making level of MIDIMAR and relevant agencies of the One UN in Rwanda also have an advisory role to the NDMEC.

Operationalisation of a robust DRM institutional and legal framework have led to the realisation of some key outputs including elaboration of a national disaster risk management plan 2013, Contingency Plans for heavy rains, floods and landslides, droughts, earthquakes, storms and acts of terrorism 2015 and district disaster management plans. Also, guidelines and checklists for mainstreaming DRR and DRM in key sector's strategies have been developed and the National Risk Atlas of Rwanda was published in 2015. These outputs have together improved the capacity for risk reduction and disaster management especially

in the public sector and enhanced the coordination mechanism for DRR and DRM in Rwanda. Subsequently, between 2013 and 2016, 177,112 people affected by natural disasters supported were with roofing materials, 23,939 households were assisted with food and non-food items and 1,529 households were supported to rehabilitate their homes. Also, the two MIDIMAR strategic response stores were fully equipped and now have the capacity to store up 15,000 household items to for approximately 75,000 persons<sup>153</sup>.

Notwithstanding these achievements

#### Case two: Disaster Response in Rwanda

Rwanda suffered series of El Nino related natural disasters in the first quarter of 2016 that adversely affected thousands of vulnerable groups, particularly the poor living on hazardous hillsides in mainly the northern region (Gakenke, Musanze districts). These disasters led to the loss of at least 49 lives. In response, the One UN shifted human and financial resources and secured Central Emergency Resource Funds (CERF) and the UN Trust Fund for Human Security (UNTFHS) funds to support a large scale One UN-GoR disaster recovery programme in the affected Districts. The programme involved among others, rehabilitation of community infrastructure and houses, and restoring hundreds of hectares of agricultural land to productive use. In addition, over 3,800 community members benefited from the joint disaster recovery efforts including from the One UN cash for work programme in the disaster affected areas.

in DRR and commendable progress in establishment of comprehensive DRM institutional and legal framework, Rwanda's disaster risk profile, documented by the National Risk Atlas indicates that Rwanda remains exposed and vulnerable to five major natural hazards including, droughts, floods, landslides, earthquakes and windstorms. The main assets at risk include; population, agriculture, health, education, buildings and transport infrastructure, shown in the table below. The risk atlas concludes that Rwanda has a very high exposure to all five hazards. Meanwhile, the physical vulnerability of the different assets vary across hazards with high vulnerability to drought and landslide and moderate vulnerability to earthquake and windstorms. The economic cost of the assets vulnerable to landslide and earthquake is estimated at RWF 100.3 Bn<sup>154</sup>.

	Hazards	Vulnerability	Most prone areas	Exposure and Vulnerability
1	Drought	High	Eastern: Kayonza, Gatsibo,	Agriculture: Season A & B; banana,
			Kirehe, Nyagatare, Rwamagana,	cassava and Irish potato; 219,700 MT, Rwf
			Ngoma, Bugesera	8.8 Bn
				<b>Population:</b> 186,200
2	Landslides	High	Western, Southern and Northern	Population: 1.6 million
			provinces: Congo-Nile Ridge:	Housing: 30,000; Rwf 9.2 Bn
			Nyamagabe, Ngororero,	Health facilities: 234 (40%); Rwf 2.7 Bn
			Rutsiro, Nyabihu, Kamonyi,	<b>Schools</b> : 1,478 (25%)
			Nyabihu, Burera, Ngororero and	Roads: 553 Kms paved (45%); 691 Kms
			Kigali City: Nyarugenge, Gasabo	unpaved (35%); 2,003 Kms (74%) district
			and Kicukiro districts	roads; Rwf 54.5 Bn
3	Floods	High	Catchment areas: Nyabarongo,	Population: 1.6 million
			Sebeya, Nyabisindu, Mukungwa	
			and Kagitumba	
4	Earthquakes	Moderate	Western province: Rubavu,	<b>Population:</b> 11 million (1.3 million poor)
			Rutsiro, Rusizi, Ngororero,	Housing: 100%; Rwf 10.3 Bn
			Nyabihu, Nyamagabe and	Health facilities: 52%; Rwf 11.3 Bn
			Nyamasheke, also Gatsibo and	<b>Schools</b> : 100%
			Nyagatare in Eastern	Roads: 1,211 Kms paved; 1,539 Kms
				unpaved; 3,899 Kms district roads
5	Windstorms	Moderate	Southwest through the extreme	<b>Population:</b> 2.8 million (1 million poor,
			Northwest up the East belt	0.4 million children and elderly)
				Housing: 0.5 million; Rwf 11.3 Bn
				Health facilities: 148 (24%)
		: .1.D:1.4.1. 2		Schools: 882

Table 13: Rwanda's disaster risk exposures and vulnerability

Source: MIDIMAR, National Risk Atlas, 2015

Despite the progress in enhancing national DRM capacity and elevation of disaster risk reduction to a national priority levels, various challenges still exist in the sector which continue to hinder progress and expose Rwanda's assets to natural disasters. Limited availability of historical, accurate, reliable and disaggregated data on different risks and hazards hinders detailed disaster risk assessment and planning, lack of necessary technical infrastructure, such as hydrometric stations and tools and methods for disaster risk assessment are not yet standardized. The sector also still has some critical capacity gaps such as seismologists, hence limited capacity to assess and plan for all risks associated with the hazards. The country also has no National Risk Observatory system (information system) in place to address dynamic risk mapping against the developed risk atlas. Also, the current risk atlas only presents Rwanda's risk profile up to the district level, hence a gap in profiles to the lowest administrative levels and does not cover all present risks such as volcanic activity, fires, mass movement of population, industrial and technological hazards and epidemics that would enable development of more comprehensive disaster risk management plans. Also, even if disaster preparedness is a crosscutting area in Rwanda, not all sector strategic plans and policies fully mainstream DRM in their policy actions

## 2.12.2 Refugees

Rwanda is located amid countries that are historically prone to cyclical conflicts, thus, in observance of the principle of non-refoulement and the country's commitments to the 1951 refugee convention, the 1967 additional protocol and the 1969 Organization of African Unity Refugee convention and enforcement of Law No. 13 ter/2014 of 21/05/2014 relating to refugees, the GoR maintains a policy to protect and advance the rights of refugees. As such, the country has received and hosted up to 170,458 refugees (161,656 refugees, 8,802 asylum seekers) between 1996 and 2017. For many years, the majority of refugees in Rwanda originated from the DRC, but this has changed since the aggravated conflict in Burundi in 2015.

As of August 2017, the refugee population in Rwanda consisted 86,786 (53.7 percent) Burundians and 74,368 (46 percent) Congolese. 50 percent are below the age of 17 years and 3 percent above 60 years. These refugees mainly come into Rwanda through five reception and/or transit centres (Kijote, Nyarushishi, Nyanza, Bugesera and Gatore) and are hosted in six refugee camps located in six districts while about 20 percent are located in urban areas (17 percent in Kigali)<sup>155</sup>.

	District	Camps, RCs, Urban areas	Refugee population	Main origin
1	Karongi	Kiziba refugee camp	17,194	DRC
2	Nyamagabe	Kigeme refugee camp	19,903	DRC
3	Gisagara	Mugombwa refugee camp	9,013	Burundi
4	Gicumbi	Gihembe refugee camp	12,378	DRC
5	Gatsibo	Nyabiheke refugee camp	14,368	DRC
6	Kirehe	Mahama refugee camp	54,867	Burundi
7	Kirehe	Gatore reception centre	130	Burundi
8	Nyamata	Bugesera reception centre	38	Burundi
9	Nyanza	Nyanza reception centre	58	Burundi
10	Huye	Huye town	3,361	Burundi
11	Kigali	Kigali city	30,346	All
	Total		161,656	

Table 14: Spatial distribution of refugees in Rwanda, August 2017

Source: UNHCR, Rwanda Monthly Fact sheet, August 2017

The GoR has made considerable contributions to the wellbeing of refugees the country hosts, ensuring their dignity and humanity are protected. Through the focal ministries, MIDIMAR and Ministry of foreign affairs and cooperation (MINAFET), other government MDAs have been engaged in supporting Rwanda's commitment to not only addressing the humanitarian concerns around refugees but also their integration into society. Some of the efforts thus far, have included provision of health insurance to refugees to enable them access affordable healthcare like citizens' issuance of identity cards (ID) and Convention Travel Documents (CTDs), with a target of 100 percent by end of 2017 and inclusion of at least 75 percent of refugees in the national curriculum through the establishment of schools near refugee camps with a target to have 100 percent in secondary and 50 percent in primary integrated in the national education system by end of 2018. Also, the GoR with partners in the refugee support sector, specifically UNHCR, has developed and is in the process of rolling out a joint MIDIMAR-UNHCR livelihood strategy that aims to facilitate refugees' self-resilience through support for sustainable livelihoods. The strategy intends to facilitate refugees obtain jobs, create jobs, access training and start income-generating activities, basically allowing refugees to not only work but also operate businesses legally in Rwanda. The purpose of this initiative is to graduate camp-based refugees out of assistance programs and increase formal access to work opportunities<sup>156</sup>. Refugees currently contribute approximately 1 percent (USD \$ 80 million) to the Rwandan GDP157.

Prior to this slowly reorienting focus to refugees' self-reliance, refugees in Rwanda have mostly been considered as a societal and economic burden, especially in hosting communities. Also within the refugee community, there is a perceived negative correlation between achieving self-reliance and chances of benefiting from refugee aid services<sup>158</sup>. Although Rwanda's law on refugees provides refugees with the right to work, to own property, to freedom of movement and to access documentation, policies and legislation have always created an "in-camp" settlement that cannot extend into agricultural and other economically productive activities. The "in-camp" settlement approach to the refugee situation has resulted in majority of refugees not being formally educated and due to the limited availability of arable land and the protracted nature of their stay, refugees' incomes remain very low. Also, as a result of congestion and long stays, the environment in and around refugee camps has experienced extensive removal of green cover and suffered severe environmental degradation <sup>158</sup>. Refugee-hosting districts are also more vulnerable to refugees' underlying poverty in relation to nationals. For example, the six districts that host all the refugee camps in

Rwanda make up half of the 15 poorest districts in Rwanda with between 41.5 and 62 percent of their populations in poverty (See: *Figure 4*). Furthermore, structural challenges continue to limit refugees from contributing productively to their host communities and overall national development. Some of these challenges include; insufficient access to finance for entrepreneurship, limited access to upper secondary, tertiary and vocational education and considerable lack of employable skills. Barriers in acquiring a refugee ID, for example the cost of Rwf 50,000, are one of the contributors to some of these challenges faced by refugees. Also, since November 2015, refugees in Rwanda are not able to obtain CTDs due to the shift to a new type of CTD and UNHCR has not been able to find the funding the new booklets<sup>158</sup>.

Even though the UN-GOR joint resilience strategy is a step to enhancing refugees' self-reliance through wage and self-employment among others, some issues still hinder progress in full integration of refugees into Rwanda society. For example Rwandan law of nationality allows that sustainable occupation in the country for five years allows for foreigners residing in Rwanda to seek naturalisation<sup>159</sup>. However, there is limited evidence to suggest that many of the refugees hosted in Rwanda, especially the protracted refugees from Congo, have benefited from this legislation. More still, Rwanda has not benefited sufficiently from the resettlement programmes for refugees that aim to resettle refugee families and individuals in third countries as only 2.5 percent of the refugee population in Rwanda is submitted for resettlement consideration each year. Nevertheless, Rwanda has developed a new group-processing proposal to the USA, which will focus on resettlement for 23,750 Congolese refugees and extend until 2021, constituting a total of 30 percent of the Congolese refugee population in Rwanda <sup>158</sup>.

Overall, regarding the refugee situation in Rwanda there is a gradual shift from a humanitarian approach to a more developmental focus with emphasis on sustainable livelihoods. This reorientation of focus has resulted in more attention and efforts around refugee camps to increase financial and technical support to refugees' livelihood's planning and self-resilience objectives in tandem with local economic development targets for host communities. The key drivers of this new approach to humanitarian and development work are all the One UN agencies in Rwanda. However, this bridging of the development-humanitarian gap, still remains a challenge especially in a context of reducing developmental aid injections and limited awareness or prioritisation of this need by local partners, for example, of all draft sector strategic plans reviewed, it is only the education and health sector with slight mentions of addressing refugees' needs, none of the productive sectors has taken consideration of this demographic in their priorities.

Existing camps face several challenges exacerbated by the lack of sufficient funding to address them. Only funding of up to 17.7 percent has been secured so far<sup>155</sup>. Some of the critical challenges in refugee camps thus far include; a growing number of unaccompanied and separated children (1,769 Burundians), lack of sufficient ECD and primary school facilities, limited availability of dischargeable latrines and safe water access, limited availability of land to construct temporary shelter, limitations in birth registration, expensive health care, sexual exploitation of female refugees is increasing and so is GBV<sup>160</sup> and there are gaps in child protection services.

### 2.12.3 MIGRATION

Rwanda has historically experienced various mass movements of its people for different reasons including politically, ethnically or economically motivated migration. The migration history of Rwanda's' people dates far back as 1959 when political and social instability forced over 700,000 thousand people to move to mostly neighbouring countries of DRC, Burundi and Uganda. The 1994 genocide against the Tutsis also resulted in an exodus of over 2,000,000 people out of the country, again to mostly neighbouring countries, especially DRC<sup>161</sup>. Following establishment of a Government of national unity and restoration of peace and security in the country, the four years after 1994 saw an influx of over 3 million Rwandans from all parts of the world. This has continued through the last two decades, between 1994 and 2014 over 3.4 million Rwandans have migrated home and reintegrated within the Rwandan society as shown in the table below<sup>162</sup>.

	Country of origin	1994-1998	1998-2003	2004-2008	2009-2013	Total
1	Burundi	534,485	867	17,698	50	553,100
2	Tanzania	847,127	44,565	16,501	14,443	922,636
3	Uganda	333,755	629	7,184	8,226	349,794
4	DRC	1,421,425	107,201	42,231	49,548	1,620,405
5	Others	2,466	1,133	532	759	4,890
6	Total Civilians	3,139,258	154,395	84,146	73,026	3,450,825
7	Ex armed groups				5,925	5,925
8	Ex armed groups family				7,436	7,436
	Total					3,464,186

Table 15: Repatriated refugees from 1994 to October 2013

Source: MIDIMAR, Repatriation and reintegration programs for Rwandan refugees, 2014

In spite of the above massive repatriation and migration, UNHCR's statistics reveal that over 100,000 Rwandan refugees still reside in different parts of the world and fall into the scope of the cessation clause. On June 30, 2013 the implementation of the Cessation Clause for Rwandan refugees came into effect as recommended by the UNHCR. This recommendation applies to Rwandan refugees who fled the country between 1959 and December 31, 1998. The Cessation Clause for Rwandan refugees was invoked after the UNHCR and the international community realised that fundamental changes had taken place in Rwanda, and that all circumstances that led to massive exile of Rwandans had ceased to exist. Thus, Rwanda and host countries were requested to start implementing all aspects of that clause, including the promotion of voluntary repatriation and reintegration of Rwandan refugees, local integration or alternative legal status in countries of asylum, continuing to meet the needs of those individuals unable to return to Rwanda for protection-related reasons and elaborating a common schedule leading to the cessation of refugee status. In this regard, the GoR has established sustainable programmes and mechanisms for effective repatriation and reintegration of Rwandan refugees. Transit and reception centres have been set up in the east and western provinces for these returnees and along with UNHCR and WFP, repatriation packages are given to returnees. Also, MIDIMAR with partners such as IOM have implemented projects aimed at socioeconomic reintegration by supporting them through provision of vocational skills and starting up income generating activities. Also in response to the Cessation Clause, which can lead to massive repatriation of Rwandan refugees, the GoR and One UN have launched a broad programme named "Sustainable Return and Reintegration of Rwandan Returnees." This programme worth of USD \$11 million targets about 70,000 Rwandan returnees expected in two years after the invocation of the Cessation Clause. Through the programme, returnees will be assisted in the areas of governance, education, health and nutrition, housing, justice and food security. The main challenges this repatriation and reintegration process face to date include the high cost of the process with limited funding to ensure implementation of more sustainable economic activities for the returnees. Also, the reception centres have insufficient capacity to accommodate the influx of returnees.

In the recent years, especially after 2005, Rwanda's migration pattern has taken more of an economic perspective with movement of people in and out of the country being for mainly education, employment and other reasons. This has led to the consideration of remittances to be one the economic indicators for not only Rwanda, but also several developing countries. Some countries have come to consider remittances as a major international resource, sometimes exceeding the flows of FDI<sup>163</sup>. Workers' remittances and compensation of employees comprise current transfers by migrant workers and wages and salaries earned by non-resident workers have risen from 0.1 percent of GDP in 1990 to 1.99 percent in 2015, peaking at 3.22 in 2007<sup>164</sup>. Despite this growing contribution of migrant workers to Rwanda's economic development, there isn't sufficient data on Rwanda's migrant statistics, especially Rwandans in diaspora. However, IOM is working with directorate of migration and emigration to develop a migration profile for Rwanda that will enable better planning and policy formulation to enhance the positive impact migrants have on Rwanda's

economy and society that goes beyond remittances but also address issues such as skills transfer. There is also no migrant workers' policy or regulatory framework in Rwanda, limiting the capacity of Rwanda to harness migrant skills and capacities in the country. Absence of such frameworks with the advent of globalisation and dynamics such as the free movement in the labour market in the EAC, presents risks to the local job market which if not addressed will continue to hinder the potential benefits of migration. Other issues in migration include the need for improved boarder management to eliminate illegal human movements across the Rwandan boards, especially human trafficking.

Overall, other than reintegration projects, migration in the UNDAP context has mostly been considered from a humanitarian perspective rather than a conduit for development. This has the potential to change in the next phase if migration is tackled from remittances, skills and knowledge transfer standpoints.

#### 2.12.4 PEACE AND SECURITY

In Rwanda's strive to never return to the events that led up to the 1994 Genocide against the Tutsis, peace and security have remained one of the founding pillars of the post-genocide regime and a base of development and social stability. In light of this context, aspects such as safety and security have been established as important measures of good governance in the country and included in monitoring tools such as the Rwanda Governance Scorecard (RGS) and Rwanda Reconciliation Barometer (RRB). Among other aspects of society, these tools monitor issues such as maintenance of security, national security, personal security, unity, reconciliation and social cohesion. Recognising these aspects as important to national peace and security, the GoR through its security organs, primarily the Rwanda National Police (RNP) and other partners has laid out robust measures including a comprehensive legal and policy framework and strengthened institutional capacity to prevent and respond to incidents that cause insecurity and has also heightened citizen engagement in ensuring national security though initiatives such as community policing.

Through these different initiatives the country has been able to achieve laudable levels of peace and security recognised locally, regionally and globally. The 2017 World Economic Forum tourism report ranks Rwanda as the ninth safest country in the world. The rankings consider "the costliness of common crime and violence as well as terrorism, and the extent to which police services can be relied upon to provide protection from crime." The 2015 Gallup Poll ranks Rwanda fifth after Singapore, Hong Kong, Norway and Spain 165. This safety status is reemphasized by the 2016 RGS that established Security and Safety as the best performing indicator with a score of 92.6 percent. Citizens express highest satisfaction (99.1 percent) with the ability of the Rwanda Defence Forces (RDF) and RNP (89.8 percent) to maintain national security. However, there is still a considerable level of dissatisfaction in personal and property safety (89.2 Percent) with most of the discontent arising from local community security apparatus "Inkeragutabara" that scores only 78.8 percent <sup>110</sup>. Also, even though 96.2 of Rwandans today report that they perceive unity and reconciliation has been achieved, there are still some concerns around cohesion and mutual trust that score 75.8 percent, well below most of the other related sub-indicators. The main challenges highlighted by the reconciliation barometer that present risks to peace and unity include continued ethic-based stereotypes expressed by 27.9 percent of citizens, persistent genocide ideology (25.8 percent) and unhealed psychological scars emanating from the divisive past and genocide (4.6 percent)<sup>166</sup>

As Rwanda continues to ensure a stable and peaceful internal environment, the GoR remains cognisant of the country's need to contribute to maintenance of regional and international peace, security and conflict resolution. Rwanda's commitment to contributing to the maintenance of international peace and security is based on the firm belief that the international community has a responsibility to prevent conflict and to act when confronted with challenges to peace and security. This principle is influenced by the 1994 genocide against the Tutsi and the failure of the international community to intervene. In this Regard, Rwanda deployed its first peacekeepers to the African Union Mission in Sudan (AMIS) in 2004. Since then, Rwanda

has grown to be the fifth largest troop and police contributing country to UN peacekeeping with over 5,500 troops, over 1000 police and 32 military observers in seven UN Missions. These include; the African Union-United Nations Hybrid Operation in Darfur (UNAMID); the UN Mission in South Sudan (UNMISS); the UN Stabilization Mission in Haiti (MINUSTAH); the UN Mission in Liberia (UNMIL); the UN Interim Security Force in Abyei (UNISFA); the UN Operation in Côte d'Ivoire (UNOCI); and the International Support Mission to the Central African Republic (MISCA)<sup>167</sup>.

In regard to regional peace, Rwanda is part of the thirteen countries<sup>VIII</sup> signatory to the Peace, Security and Cooperation Framework for the Democratic Republic of the Congo and the region (PSC Framework) that was established in 2013. This framework has four Guarantors including the UN, AU, the Southern African Development Community (SADC), and the International Conference on the Great Lakes Region (ICGLR). The PSC Framework serves as a strategic tool to promote stability in the DRC and the larger Great lakes Region. It sets out commitments at the national, regional, and international level and calls for actions to end the recurring cycles of violence in eastern DRC and the region. The PSC-F also provides space for collaboration between countries in the region, regional organizations and the international community to work together and address the structural causes of instability in the DRC and the region. Following partners' meetings in 2014 and 2015, six key areas were identified as the pillars upon which strategic interventions would be focused on, especially by member countries' UNCTs to address regional issues of peace and security. These six pillars include: mobility; youth; gender; trade and food security; energy; and justice and conflict prevention. The justice and conflict prevention pillar is both a stand alone pillar and cross-cutting theme, while the energy pillar covers sustainable natural resources and the trade and food security pillar addresses economic integration as well<sup>168</sup>. Despite these commendable efforts to ensure peace and security in the region, the situation in eastern DRC, Burundi and the entire region remains fragile. The PSC framework faces persistent challenges in its implementation including; outstanding issues in the implementation of the Nairobi Declarations of the Kampala Dialogue<sup>169</sup>, slow progress in the neutralization of armed groups, and the lack of meaningful progress in the surrender or defeat and disarmament of the FDLR in the eastern DRC. These factors perpetuate mistrust in the region, and inhibit meaningful dialogue between leaders in the region to address root causes of conflicts and lead to continued unrest and insecurity in the region.

# 2.13 PEACE HUMANITARIAN DEVELOPMENT NEXUS CLUSTER: PRIORITIES AND ANALYSIS OF UNDAP PROGRAMMING PRINCIPLES

The CCA classifies areas described under this section as the peace, humanitarian and development nexus cluster. Against each of the areas described in the preceding sections of this report, the CCA has identified key priorities in each area based on gaps identified in the context analysis as well as priorities emanating from consultations with sector working group leaders and respective sector strategic plans under development. These priorities are summarised in the table below and provide targeted starting points for the UNDAP planning processes.

A brief analysis of the current statuses of the different areas is also provided against the four UNDAP programming principles; Leave no one behind, Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment, Sustainability and resilience and Accountability. For each of these programming principles, the CCA provides not only gaps in the context and implementation status of each area but also highlights positive progress or lessons that provide opportunity for lesson learning, replication across sectors and clusters as well as scaling up where applicable, however, emphasis is majorly placed on where gaps exist around the programming principles. Also using the concluded Rapid Integrated Assessment of Rwanda national policy

VIII Angola, Burundi, Central African Republic, DRC, Republic of the Congo, Rwanda, South Africa, South Sudan, Tanzania, Uganda, Zambia, Kenya and Sudan

frameworks alignment with the sustainable development goals, SDGs and SDG targets under respective sectors and sub-sectors are presented in the table below.

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles		
	2 End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and		
25. Disaster risk management	promote sustainable agriculture           12         Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns		
	12         Insure sustainable consumption and production patterns           13         Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts		
• Given the limitations of the national risk	Leave no one behind		
atlas design, in especially availability of data,	• The largest proportions of the population with highest		
support should be provided to conduct	vulnerability to the different disasters are mainly the most poor		
localised detailed assessments of risk based	living in rural areas		
on exposure and vulnerabilities identified in			
the different districts, and more effective disaster response and management systems	Human rights, gender equality and women's		
put in place to address specific disasters.	empowerment		
	• Agriculture is the most exposed economic activity to almost		
• Enhance collaboration with neighbouring	all potential hazards, thus women being the most reliant on		
countries in disaster assessment and risk	farming as their main source of livelihood, implies they are most vulnerable to disasters.		
monitoring, observation and planning as some risks such as windstorms	most vumerable to disasters.		
predominantly originate from Tanzania.	Sustainability and resilience		
	Limited local capacity and resources to ensure effective		
• Support the Rwanda Meteorology Agency	contingency planning leaves Rwanda exposed to the identified		
in establishing effective data collection and treatment systems and strengthen the data	hazards and highly susceptible to the social and economic		
infrastructure for hazard and risk	losses that reduced community resilience to poverty shocks		
assessment	caused by hazards.		
	Accountability		
• Strengthen capacity within MIDIMAR and the broader institutional framework for	• Limited availability of historical data that can be used in more		
disaster management in Rwanda.	accurate disaster risk assessment and prediction and reporting		
	to stakeholders.		
	1 End poverty in all its forms everywhere		
	2 End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture		
	3 Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages		
	4 Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all		
26. Refugee	5 Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong		
20. Relugee	learning opportunities for all		
	6 Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all		
	7 Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy		
	for all 8 Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and		
	productive employment and decent work for all		
• Support refugees to fully engage in	Leave no one behind		
economic activity and contribute to local	• Other than MIDIMAR no other ministries or government		
economic development through job- creation and taxes through advocacy and	agencies focus specifically on refugees issues, also sector		
mobilising support for implementation of	strategic plans are yet to fully integrate refugees in their key target groups, presenting the risk of leaving them behind in		
the "economic inclusion of refugees in	national development despite their rights and potential		
Rwanda" Strategy 2016 -2020.	productive capacities.		
• Advocate for inclusion of refugees affairs as			
a crosscutting issue in all applicable sector	Human rights, gender equality and women's		
strategic plans and provide technical	empowerment		
assistance in mainstreaming refugees affairs	• The demographic structure of the refugee population with		
in the SSPs.	proportionally more women and children requires that socio-		
• Fast-track refugee documentation processes	economic initiatives must be tailored to specific characteristics		
to enable access to formal employment and			

Table 16: Peace Humanitarian development nexus Clusters priorities and programming principles

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles
<ul> <li>which personal identification is a prerequisite, for example opening bank accounts.</li> <li>Strengthen measures to provide appropriate assistance to victims of all offences under the Optional Protocol, including their full social reintegration and physical, psychological and psychosocial recovery. For example strengthen and expand Isange One Stop Centre in other provinces and adopt specific measures for the reintegration of refugee and asylum-seeking child victims, who are especially vulnerable to becoming victims of the offences covered under the Optional Protocol.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>The rights and needs of refugees - such as freedom of movement, protection, access to basic services and livelihood opportunities - must be understood not only as "humanitarian" in nature, but equally as development challenges to be addressed in concert with the needs of host communities and local institutions</li> <li><i>Sustainability and resilience</i></li> <li>Refugee-hosting Districts are more vulnerable due to refugees' underlying poverty in relation to nationals, the demands on already-stressed resources, and refugees' limited resilience. For both refugees and host communities, a focus on community resilience, in particular economic self-reliance and food security, needs be adopted to allow them to sustainably manoeuvre weather market price volatility, food ration reductions and other socio-economic challenges.</li> </ul>
27. Migration	Accountability         • Lack of consideration of refugees in national development frameworks limits the nations ability to track their contribution to overall economic development as well as limits accountability regarding the refugees livelihoods and progress         1       End poverty in all its forms everywhere         8       Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all         10       Reduce inequality within and among countries         17       Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global
• Support capacity building for relevant authorities in the requirements and how to effectively implement the Convention on the protection of Migrant Workers and members of their families	<ul> <li>partnership for sustainable development</li> <li><i>Leave no one behind</i></li> <li>No consideration of migration or its impact on society makes it difficult to establish who is being left behind or presents risks of living behind migrants in Rwanda.</li> </ul>
<ul> <li>Support the directorate of migration and immigration in the development of a system to capture all relevant migration data required for compliance to the CMW.</li> <li>With the coming into effect of the cessation clause, there is need to develop a detailed mechanism on how Rwanda will be able to manage the potential influx of returnees from especially the region and beyond.</li> <li>Develop strategies on how to harness migration in socio-economic development through for example leveraging diaspora skills and experience, labour migration and remittances.</li> <li>With further regional integration and globalisation, healthy, legal and safe border management needs to be prioritised to combat issues such as illegal migrants and</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Human rights, gender equality and women's empowerment</li> <li>Women's empowerment has not featured much in migration strategies or policies. Need to find ways to mainstream gender in migration management.</li> <li>Sustainability and resilience</li> <li>Migration is not being harnessed for development as a means to sustain the gains from migrants, for example their skills and remittances and through Student Mobility (Rwandans studying abroad and bringing back knowledge from a third country).</li> <li>Accountability</li> <li>Limited availability of data on migration limits accountability in this area of interest.</li> </ul>
human trafficking. 28. Peace and security	<ul> <li>5 Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls</li> <li>12 Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns</li> <li>16 Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels</li> </ul>

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles		
	16.5Substantially reduce corruption and bribery in all their		
	17	Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global	
• Droomand machanisms that have as for	Loda	partnership for sustainable development e no one behind	
• Programs and mechanisms that have so far proved effective in promoting unity and			
reconciliation should be reinforced with		der communities tend to be most affected by regional	
both technical and financial support to		ct but there are no concerted efforts to reduce impacts of ct on these communities.	
enable them reach more segments of	conn	ct on these communities.	
society, especially, in areas were issues such	Hum	an rights, gender equality and women's	
as genocide ideology still persist. Some of		werment	
the programs include; Itorero, Ndi	-	ng times of conflict it is mainly women, youth and	
Umunyarwanda, Umuganda among others.		en who are worst affected as they are the most	
• Support development of psychosocial		rable, but there are not dedicated to ensure their rights,	
support programmes to address the	securi	ty and freedoms are protected the most	
extensive amount of post-genocide trauma			
that still exists and affects social and	Susta	inability and resilience	
economic progress		e and Security will always remain an underlying	
• Increase support to integration and delivery		ninant of sustenance of individual and national	
of peace education through the existing		opment sustainability and resilience, however continued	
education curriculum and promote dialogue		al cycles of violence that spill over into Rwanda continue	
between different groups in society to		se risks to sustainable peace and development.	
openly discuss issues associated with true-	• Peace	e building not sufficiently addressed through education	
reconciliation.	(teach	er development and curriculum) and at community level.	
• Given that events in one country generate			
reactions and repercussions in neighbouring	Acco	untability	
countries, the success of national level peace		ence of regional frameworks such as International	
initiatives will be enhanced when they are		erence on the Great Lakes Region provides a peace and	
implemented as part of a regional focus, with simultaneous and/or complementary		ty accountability mechanism that stretches beyond	
action across the relevant countries.	Kwan	da's borders.	
Therefore the cross-boarder priorities in			
addressing peace and conflict in the region			
should include:			
• Support efforts to neutralise forces with			
relevant UNSC resolutions			
• Promote peaceful, inclusive and			
transparent elections			
• Strengthen the PSC framework regional			
oversight mechanism and technical			
<ul><li>support committee.</li><li>Facilitate durable solutions for refugees</li></ul>			
• Facilitate durable solutions for refugees and internally displaces persons (IDPs)			
<ul> <li>Facilitate socio-economic development</li> </ul>			
to consolidate peace gains and advance			
regional economic integration with			
special focus on Youth employment.			
• Mobilize active forces of the region:			
women, youth and civil society, to build			
the constituencies under the PSC			
Framework and promote a shared vision			
for peace and prosperity in the region			
<ul> <li>Facilitate regional initiatives to fight impunity, improve accountability and</li> </ul>			
advance regional judicial cooperation to			
strengthen the rule of law			
• Lead and coordinate the international			
community's support to the			
· · · · ·			

Priorities	UNDAP Programming Principles
implementation of the PSC Framework, including mobilization of resources and strengthened donor and partner relations.	

## 3. COUNTRY RISK PROFILE

The CCA is expected to identify key risks that could impact the development trajectory of Rwanda ranging from climate change through disaster risks, rapid urbanisation, and conflict to financial and economic shocks. These risks are elaborated in the preceding sections under each of the sectors and subject areas described and analysed. To avoid duplication of information no separate risk assessment or profiling is presented herein except for the risks associated with Rwanda's financing landscape that will have significant influence on implementation of the next UNDAP, as these have not been addressed exhaustively under any one sector.

## 3.1 FINANCING LANDSCAPE

The Rwanda economy is projected to grow by 6.2 percent in 2017 and 6.8 percent in 2018 from 5.9 percent in 2016. This growth is supported by improvements in the agriculture sector from food crops and export crops following on going investments in agro-inputs and in the industry and construction sectors due to improvements in international mineral prices and construction of the Bugesera Airport project respectively. However, as mentioned in previous sections, majority of these improvements are majorly reliant on public expenditure. The budget for the financial year 2017/18 is projected at RWF 2,094.9 billion with 65.7 percent of the resources to fund the budget from domestic revenue including tax, non tax revenue and domestic financing. The increase in tax revenue is expected to rise from an increase in collection of value added tax (VAT) and direct taxes as a result of the "EBM for all" project. Grants and loans contribute 17 percent each to the resources for the budget, indicating a significant decline in reliance on foreign financing that has dropped by Rwf 31.4 billion from Rwf 343.9 billion in FY 2016/2017 to Rwf 312.5 billion in FY 2017/2018.

As the GoR has made commendable progress in transforming its financing landscape from being heavily donor reliant to being locally funded, which seems to be more sustainable, the rising global fuel and food prices pose a significant threat to the country's medium-term financing. Inflation headlined at the end of 2016 stood at 7.3 percent. The annual average went up from 2.5 percent in 2015 to 5.7 percent in 2016, mainly driven by rising food prices and transport cost. The increase in food prices was caused by reduction in food supply and poor performance of the agriculture production following poor harvests due to drought and floods in some parts of the country. Other factors posing threats to inflation include imported inflation due to currency depreciation, increase in transport costs attributed to the increase in price of fuel. Therefore, inflation for 2017 is expected to increase to 7 percent and increase in later years if not curbed.

Providing financing for public investment is a necessary but not sufficient condition for success because it is also highly dependent on effectiveness of investment spending. Overall, Rwanda ranks high on public investment management among developing countries. However, most of the investment needed to stimulate the process of structural transformation such as seen in agriculture and tourism has mainly taken place through public domain. This has led to a sharp rise in the public debt level from 18 percent of GDP in 2012 to a projection of 47.1 percent of GDP by 2018 and this implies that the room for further government borrowing is limited. Although Rwanda continues to face a low risk of external debt distress as demonstrated by the country remaining below the policy dependent benchmark<sup>170</sup>, Rwanda still needs to remain prudent about the terms and amounts of external debt it contracts.

External financing remains important to Rwanda, especially in its social sectors. In a growth regression for

the six fast non-resource growing countries in sub-Saharan African over the 1999-2010 period, the aid ratio was found to be highly significant and contributed <sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub> percent to per capita growth in Rwanda<sup>171</sup>. However, even though official development assistance (ODA) remains important in Rwanda, it will not be sufficient to achieve the SDGs. Due to Rwanda's robust ODA management and implementation system, ODA continues to be a major resource for financing development strategies, although its share in the total development finance is declining mainly due to the significant increase in the volumes of other forms of finance, primarily of private origin. Overall, in the financial year 2015/16 Rwanda's aid dependency (ODA/GNI ratio) stood at 11 percent, a significant drop from 18.5 percent in the year 2000 and the net ODA per capita was US\$ 78.9172. In this same year 2015/16, development finance was a total of US\$ 1,479.6 million, of which ODA from traditional and non-traditional donors constituted 66.6 percent and private flows including: FDI, overseas remittances and non-public and philanthropic flows, contributed 33.4 percent. The development assistance total reported represents 82.7 percent of ODA recorded on budget. The top five donors in this period included; World Bank, USA, African Development bank, European Union (EU) and Global Fund. Meanwhile, the top five supported sectors included; health, agriculture, social protection, energy and transport. ODA inflows to Rwanda have been on steady rise from 2006 to 2011, exceeding US\$ 1 billion in 2011, reduced notably in the 2012 and 2013 but restored in 2014 as shown in the figure below. Flows from bilateral donors have slightly increased (1.2 percent), while flows from International Financial Institutions (IFISs) and multilaterals have decreased by 6.2 percent and 7.3 percent respectively. The UN ODA has decreased by about 30 percent compared to FY 2014/15. Non-traditional assistance almost doubled between 2013/14 and 2014/15 but decreased by nearly 16 percent in 2015/16<sup>173</sup>.



Source: DAD-Rwanda

#### Figure 10: ODA to Rwanda, 2013/14 - 2015/16

Although ODA decreased relative to Rwanda's GDP, it still remains the largest source of external flows for the country and has more than doubled over the last ten years. However, other sources, specifically FDI and remittances have notably increased to reach 4 percent and 2 percent of GDP respectively. Also, non-traditional assistance (NTA) through south-south cooperation providers (China and India) and Arab development funds has significantly increased reaching 0.5 percent of GDP in 2015/16.

Rwanda's external development finance landscape has evolved over the last ten years with the importance and significance of FDI and remittances share of total external flows gradually growing from less than 6 percent for both to 22 percent fro FDI and 11 percent for remittances as shown in the figure below. With the growth and diversification of Rwanda's private sector and increasing globalisation, these percentages can be expected to increase in the coming years. Also in recent years, flows from non-public entities and private philanthropic foundations have risen to US\$ 10.1 million in FY 2015/16.



Figure 11: Evolution of Rwanda's major development finance flows

Disaggregation of the total external flows to Rwanda's development finance for the FY 2015/16 indicates that both traditional and non-traditional sources disbursed US\$ 984.9 million to 275 projects. The One UN fund supported the most projects (21 percent) but only accounts for 3.8 percent of the total external funding, compared to the first three funding sources that supported only 18 percent of all the projects with 51 percent of the total disbursement. This trend is not able to establish if the UN is spreading to thin across too many projects hence reducing chances of visible and/or sustainable outcomes, or is very efficient in ensuring it achieves value for money.

Funding Source	# of Projects	Disbursed, US\$	% Of total disbursement	% Of projects
WB Group	23	231,099,032	23.5%	8%
United States of America	5	170,434,858	17.3%	2%
AfDB Group	22	99,549,562	10.1%	8%
European Union	18	88,534,746	9.0%	7%
Global Fund	3	75,722,246	7.7%	1%
Netherlands	13	39,101,843	4.0%	5%
United Nations	58	37,366,225	3.8%	21%
Germany	16	36,298,981	3.7%	6%
United Kingdom	13	53,907,168	5.5%	5%
Belgium	23	29,198,896	3.0%	8%
China	1	25,936,870	2.6%	0%
Japan	32	25,586,321	2.6%	12%
South Korea	20	23,798,060	2.4%	7%
Switzerland	9	15,938,574	1.6%	3%
OPEC	3	9,335,019	0.9%	1%
Sweden	5	6,159,777	0.6%	2%
BADEA	5	6,117,224	0.6%	2%
Saudi Arabia	3	5,211,008	0.5%	1%
Kuwait	1	4,076,773	0.4%	0%
India	2	1,493,750	0.2%	1%
Total	275	984,866,933	100.0%	100%

Table 17: Composition of ODA by source of funding

Source MINECOFIN ODA Report

Quantifying the financial resources needed to implement the SDGs is complex and estimates vary widely. While ODA remains important, it will not be sufficient to achieve the SDGs. Drawing on all sources of finance, public and private, domestic and international will be essential, therefore catalysing financing for SDGs will remain an important part of the UNDAP planning and implementation process. This will require the UN to shift from the **funding** of individual projects to the **financing** of transformative change. While funding is about transferring resources from a financial contributor to a recipient, financing is about structuring different financial flows to achieve a common result. The shift from funding to financing (F2F) will entail developing the UN capacity to influence different sources of public, private, domestic and international finance to achieve collective, transformative, sustainable development results<sup>174</sup>.

## 3.2 NATIONAL SDG PROCESSES AND PROGRESS

Rwanda is in the process of ending the EDPRS II and commencement of a new cycle of the country's poverty reduction strategy that has evolved into the National Strategy for Transformation (NST), commencing in July 2018. Formulation of these policies is being strongly underpinned by recent global and international agreements. Formulation of the NST is also being undertaken with reference to an analysis of synergies between GoR policies, specifically the different sector strategic plans (SSPs), to be completed in November 2017, and evaluation findings of the EDPRS II achievements and limitations. The processes also utilise lessons from other countries and the evolving financing landscape among others

Two key benchmarks (upper middle income by 2035, and high income by 2050), and three pillars (economic transformation, social transformation and transformational governance) have been established to guide development of the NST. Consultations for the development of Vision 2050 and NST are on-going across government and with development partners, private sector, public, the Rwandan diaspora, CSOs and academia. Following the submission of drafts to a National Steering Committee, it is expected that final drafts of Vision 2050 and NST will be submitted for Cabinet approval at the end of 2017.

In addition, Following the GoR Cabinet approved roadmap for SDG domestication in December 2015, a comprehensive national plan for SDG domestication led by MINECOFIN, with support from One UN was developed and is under execution. This includes a wide range of discussions with sector and thematic working groups to mainly map synergies and divergences between SDG and sector indicators. It is expected that by the end of 2017, the SDGs will be fully integrated into new sector strategic plans and district development plans, and fully reflected in the final draft versions of Vision 2050 and NST.

Despite the commendable progress in the SDG domestication process, a 2016 GoR SDG planning gap analysis suggests that more effort is required to further align national policy with the SDGs. More specific recommendations from the analysis emphasise the need to enhance investments in developing human capital and institutional capacity; data quality and M&E systems; financing for development; and, prioritization of GoR resource allocation. However, participatory exercises around SDG domestication are still on-going and most of the integration is expected to be completed with the finalisation of the SSPs.

#### 3.3 RWANDA TOWARDS VISION 2050

As Rwanda nears the year 2020 the country is in the process of updating its aspirations to reflect Rwandans' new ambitions that will be elaborated in the country's Vision 2050 statements. The Vision 2050 statement will aim to build on the progress achieved in Vision 2020 and the elaboration process will be informed by overarching new global commitments including, Addis Ababa Action Agenda (financing for development) – 2030, Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) – 2030, Paris Declaration on Climate Change – 2030, EAC Vision – 2050 and the African Union Agenda – 2063.

The main focus of the Vision 2050 is ensuring high standards of living for all Rwandans. Attaining this vision will require the country to attain and sustain high economic growth, foster positive Rwandan values and build on successful foundations. Vision 2050 targets for Rwanda to reach upper middle income by

2035 and high income statuses by 2050 with per capita GDP of USD 4,035 and USD 12,476 respectively, among an estimated population of 22 million Rwandans. To achieve these targets that strategic framework of the vision is being modelled around the following five main areas<sup>175</sup>;

I. Quality of life	II. Modern Infrastructure and
The quality of life pillar of the Vision 2050 aims to ensure	livelihoods
all Rwandans attain an expected standard of living through	The second pillar of the Vision 2050 will focus on
the provision and sustenance of the following features of	ensuring modern infrastructure is established,
quality living;	maintained and accessible to all Rwandans. The
	priority features of the modern infrastructure will
Sustained food security and nutrition for all households and age groups	include;
• Universal, sustainable and reliable access to water (in houses) and sanitation	• Modern and SMART cities (optimal space utilisation and connectivity)
• Affordable, sustainable, reliable and modern energy	<ul> <li>Eco-friendly cities and neighbourhoods (renewable energy and recycling)</li> </ul>
• Universal access to quality health care, quality education, financial services, dignified and SMART	<ul> <li>SMART towns and rural settlements</li> </ul>
housing, pension, medical insurance and savings.	<ul> <li>Modern transport facilities and services</li> </ul>
	(efficient public transport and reliable
Environmental friendly and climate resilient	infrastructure)
surroundings	<ul> <li>Efficient public and private services</li> </ul>
Sustained national security     III. Transformation for prosperity	IV. Core values for Vision 2050
Rwanda envisions transforming its economy through	For Rwandans to achieve their aspirations there is
<ul> <li>mainly increasing productivity and competitiveness while ensuring a primary focus on job creation for all Rwandans. This transformation process will build on the country's initial attention to creating a knowledge-based society and subsequently prioritise the services and affiliate sectors.</li> <li>Primary areas of focus in the transformation for prosperity pillar will include;</li> <li>Diversified tourism</li> <li>High value IT and Tech services and industry</li> <li>Business and financial services hub</li> <li>Logistics and aviation</li> <li>Agro-processing and technology intensive agriculture</li> <li>Scientific and technological innovations</li> <li>Construction industry</li> <li>Value addition in extractive industries (mining, oil and gas)</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>need for the country's people to share the same vision for the future and be ready to contribute to social cohesion, equity and equal opportunity. This would require Rwandan society to share core values as a society, these will include;</li> <li>Self-determination, including self-sufficiency as a Nation, Solidarity and Dignity (Agaciro)</li> <li>Unity and Rwandan Identity (cultural values)</li> <li>Integrity</li> <li>Equity (including gender)</li> <li>Transparency and openness</li> <li>Accountability</li> <li>Community participation and contributing to local innovation</li> <li>National stability</li> </ul>
V. International cooperation and positioning	
The fifth pillar of the Vision 2050 will aim to espouse	
international cooperation and positioning of Rwanda	
through four main mechanisms, including:	
Regional integration	
Multi-lateral and bilateral cooperation	
Public and Private positioning abroad	
Freeing Rwanda from aid dependency	

## 4. COMPARATIVE ADVANTAGES OF THE UN IN RWANDA

Identification of the comparative advantages of the One UN in Rwanda is a key component of the CCA that was conducted as part of the process to support the organisation in enabling Rwanda achieve its targets across relevant sectors. The comparative advantage is an important element used to determine the UNDAP priorities, as it is in these areas that support will be most efficient and effective. Following a consultative comparative advantage analysis process, the strengths of the One UN in Rwanda majorly described as the characteristics of the UNCT that give the institution a competitive advantage over other development actors in Rwanda are describe herein;

## The UN's convening power

The One UN in Rwanda is recognised by all its stakeholders as a legitimate authority in almost all its areas of intervention. As such, the UN is perceived as one of the only international organisations in Rwanda with the ability to bring together individuals and groups from various backgrounds for a particular purpose and be successful in getting all or most of those convening to act on or pay particular attention to a specific cause. The convening power of the UN has recently been demonstrated by the organising and contextualising of key international events such as World Refugee Day (WRD) 2017, World Water Day, International Day of Democracy and others. Different actors attribute the increased attention to some pertinent issues such as the contribution of refugees and participatory and inclusive governance to such events that have been primarily spearheaded by the One UN in Rwanda. Furthermore, this convening power element is recounted by stakeholder to have enhanced relationships between the UN and the GoR as well as built relations with different donors through increased recognition of the UN's legitimacy in particular sectors.

# Technical expertise

The One UN in Rwanda is noticed by most of its partners as an organisation with a wealth of experts, both local and international. Stakeholders describe how the UN is not only able to utilise its local experts to provide mainly technical assistance in policy and strategy analysis and formulation but also at implementation in certain cases, the organisation has a dense and vast system that makes it able to draw on expert knowledge from almost any part of the world. This makes the UN staff better equipped to design and implement programs usually beyond the capacity of local actors to execute effectively and efficiently. This has increased the relevance of the UN in Rwanda in especially areas such as humanitarian and disaster response, early childhood development, WASH, ICT in health and others.

# Knowledge creation and sharing

Almost all external stakeholders identify the creation and sharing of knowledge by the UN system in Rwanda as the most significant contribution and strength of the UN agencies in Rwanda. There is reiterated reference to analysis of issues and formulation of policies, strategies guidelines, SOPs and protocols across sectors, all of which has been many times initiated and delivered by the UN. The south-to-south learning, creation and sharing of knowledge by the UN have been instrumental in bringing certain previously diluted issues to attention and prioritisation by the GoR. Some examples accentuated by partners include, malnutrition, specifically stunting, ECD, child protection and better understanding of inequality.

## Normative and regulatory frameworks

The UN in Rwanda is observed by many as the country's most strategic partner in the support to development of norms and standards in conventions, declarations, regulatory frameworks, agreements, guidelines, codes of practice and other standard setting instruments, at global, regional and national levels. As part of the UN's normative work in Rwanda, the organisation has supported implementation of different instruments at policy level, specifically, their integration into legislation, policies, strategies and development plans, and implementation at the programme level. The normative work of the UN in Rwanda has been

mainly highlighted in the areas of gender equality, labour laws and policies and health sector guidelines and regulations.

## Impartiality and neutrality

The principles of neutrality and impartiality are traditionally essential elements of the UN, specifically its peacekeeping operations. The UN in Rwanda has been able to portray itself as such by not taking sides in any political-economy agenda and reemphasising the importance of non-discrimination and proportionality through its programming principles, specifically, leave no one behind and human rights and gender equality. This identity of the One UN in Rwanda as a neutral and impartial partner has enhanced the organisation's ability to have constructive dialogue on sensitive issues with the GoR which many other development partners have not been very successful in achieving over the years. Specifically, discourse among actors indicates that amidst various criticism of the GoR human rights track record, civil society engagement in political spaces, media freedoms and others, only the UN has been able to work along with the GoR to develop programmes that tackle these sensitive issues and has led to specific results such as media reforms that can be directly attributed to the UN's engagement on issues. The counter-argument to this assertion is presented in the weaknesses section of this report.

# Catalyst for resource mobilisation

In a global environment where financial resources, specifically apportioned to aid and development are diminishing, the UN is still perceived in certain sectors as a catalyst for resource mobilisation. Stakeholders, especially in government institutions, describe how the UN has access to elaborate funding mechanisms, both internal and external, that not many development actors have or can access. Specific reference is made to the Central Emergency Resource Funds (CERF) and the UN Trust Fund for Human Security (UNTFHS) resources that have been used previously to support large-scale joint One UN-GoR disaster recovery programmes in districts affected by El Nino caused floods in 2016.

## Alignment to government development agenda

The One UN in Rwanda is commended by its government partners as one of the development partners that practically demonstrate commitment to alignment of the organisation's actions and priorities to the country's development agenda. This affirmation is mainly attributed to the alignment of the UNDAP to Rwanda's development planning cycle and frameworks. There is also reiteration of the presence of UNCT representatives in almost all Sector Working Groups and active participation in especially sector analyses and monitoring and evaluation. Bilateral donors also cite the preference for the UN as a funding mechanism to direct earmarked support to specific sectors. The country and sectoral alignment has greatly contributed to enhancement of collaboration between the UN agencies and the GoR.

#### Deliver as one

Though not yet to the point of perfection, the delivering as one (DaO) approach being led in Rwanda is considered by both internal and external stakeholders of the One UN as a key strength of the UN. GoR partners elaborate how in the past, coordination of development assistance was one of the challenges they faced, but the drive to consolidate UN support has improved how the government works with the UN. Examples of joint programmes with steering committees that have representatives from government and different UN agencies has enhanced coherence, reduced duplication and fragmentation of efforts and increased better utilisation of scarce resources. Within the UN, proponents of the DaO describe how the approach has to an appreciable extent reduced competition for resources, while the Business Operations Strategy (BoS) has generated related economies of scale and reduced duplication, built inter-agency relationships and enhanced knowledge and experience sharing.

The One UN in Rwanda maintains a unique comparative advantage as a dedicated, impartial and neutral partner of the GoR in its ability to respond to specific development and humanitarian needs of the country. Guided by universally recognised human rights standards and international norms, the One UN in Rwanda offers its services and support in: i) promotion of innovative, home grown and thought leadership; ii) development of policies and normative frameworks, and their implementation in line with international conventions and treaties to which Rwanda is a state party; and iii) innovation—piloting new initiatives, and developing knowledge networks and sharing, including to promote South-South learning. These comparative advantages mean the One UN in Rwanda remains well placed to forge partnerships to leverage its local and global technical expertise, capacities and resources of external partners to support Rwanda in achieving its medium goals and long-term vision.



Following the above descriptive and analytical process of identifying the UN's strengths and points of convergence and divergence as perceived internally and externally, the following five areas were agreed on as the points of consensus that define the comparative advantage of the UN in Rwanda going forward.

- I. Convening power based on ability to bring together diverse categories of partners (individuals, groups, institutions) around key issues, including sensitive issues given the normative roles and credibility built with key stakeholders over time in
- II. Ability to influence and advocate on key national and regional issues in a number of areas/sectors based on evidence (knowledge creation and sharing), global presence and networks and normative agenda/mandates.
- III. Multifaceted functions/capacities/mandates of the UN system in Rwanda, spanning a broad spectrum of areas including development, humanitarian, peace, security and human rights undertaken through different strategies including policy advise, capacity development, service

delivery, technical assistance/expertise, analytical and data generation capacities, leading to holistic and sustainability of interventions.

- IV. **Credibility of the UN system in Rwanda**, as a trusted partner not only by the government but also other partners due to its impartiality, strong relationship with the Government built over time, alignment to national frameworks and priorities.
- V. **Delivering as One (DaO) as an approach for the UN system in Rwanda**, leading to greater coherence and enhance visibility and impact of the UN system's interventions, and reduced transaction costs for government and other development partners.

# 5. CONCLUSION

Rwanda aims at being a developed country with high living standards for its populace, a GDP per capita of US\$ 4,051 by 2035 and US\$ 12,555 by 2050. Based on the modelling conducted by the harnessing the demographic dividend in Rwanda study, this has the highest probability of being achieved if the GoR adopts a policy strategy that goes beyond strategy of focus on investments in the economic sectors, and embraces integrated implementation that also focuses investments in the social sector. The integrated approach that emerges to address majority of the critical gaps described in the Rwanda context presented in this CCA report is one that integrates and prioritises the following key areas;

- I. Accelerating fertility decline and improving maternal and child health.
- II. Creating a healthy workforce through fusing food security and healthy living determinants.
- III. Improving the quality of education and skills development.
- IV. Accelerating economic growth, creating quality decent work and promoting self-reliance.
- V. Improving governance to bridge the gap between policy, programme action and service delivery.
- VI. Harnessing the gender dividend and eradicating factors augmenting inequalities in the society.
- VII. Promoting green growth and ensuring climate change resilience for sustainable development.

#### 6. APPENDICES

#### **ANNEXE 6.1: CITATIONS**

<sup>3</sup> One UN Rwanda, Terms of Reference, Common Country Analysis – UNDAP 2, 2017

- <sup>5</sup> NISR, Rwanda Integrated Household Living Conditions Survey (EICV 4) 2013/2014, 2014
- <sup>6</sup> MINECOFIN, Rwanda's Foundations for the Future: Growth, Business and Development, 2013
- <sup>7</sup> The World bank, Doing Business 2016; Measuring Regulatory Quality and Efficiency
- <sup>8</sup> NISR, Establishments census 2011, 2014

- <sup>10</sup> MINEACOM, Private sector development and youth empowerment joint sector review 2015/2016, 2016
- <sup>11</sup> International monetary fund, Rwanda Selected Issues Paper, 2017
- <sup>12</sup> International monetary fund, African Department Database, 2014
- <sup>13</sup> Retrieved From: <u>Http://Www.Eac.Int/Commonmarket/Index.Php?Option=Com\_Content&View=Article&Id=88&Itemid=139</u>
- <sup>14</sup>NISR, National Accounts 2016 resource balance, 2016

<sup>16</sup> Ibid.

- 18 MINEACOM NTB National Monitoring Secretariat (NMC), 2017
- <sup>19</sup> Sida, GoR, Energy mapping study in Rwanda, 2016
- <sup>20</sup> MININFRA, Energy Performance Report/Backward Looking JSR FY 2015/16
- <sup>21</sup> NISR, EICV 4, Poverty Thematic Report, 2014
- <sup>22</sup> National Bank of Rwanda, financial stability report 201-16, 2016
- <sup>23</sup> Retrieved from: <u>http://projects.worldbank.org/P150844?lang=en</u>
- <sup>24</sup> Retrieved from: <u>http://www.myict.gov.rw/fileadmin/Documents/ICT Sector Profile 2015/ICT Sector Profile 2015.pdf</u>
- <sup>25</sup> ITU, Global ICT Development Index, 2016
- <sup>26</sup> WEF, Network Readiness Index, 2016
- <sup>27</sup> UNDESA, Network Readiness Index, 2016
- <sup>28</sup> NIRDA, Strategic plan for the National Industrial Research and Development Agency 2017 2022, 2017
- <sup>29</sup> GoR, N° 06/2015 of 28/03/2015, law relating to investment promotion and facilitation
- <sup>30</sup> The World Bank Group, Doing Business 2016; Measuring Regulatory Quality and Efficiency, 2015
- <sup>31</sup> MINECOFIN, Mid-term review of the FSDP II, 2016
- <sup>32</sup> Access to finance Rwanda, Finscope, 2016
- <sup>33</sup> Economist Intelligence Unit, Global Microscope Report, 2016
- <sup>34</sup> MINECOFIN, Mid-term review of the FSDP II, 2016
- 35 Ibid
- <sup>36</sup> MINECOFIN, National Financial Education Strategy, 2013
- <sup>37</sup> World Bank, Global Financial Inclusion (Global Findex), 2015
- <sup>38</sup> Micro pension Foundation: Draft Concept Note Rwanda Personal Pension Scheme, 2016
- <sup>39</sup> NISR, Labour force survey, 2017
- 40 NISR, EICV4 2014 Economic activity thematic report, 2016
- <sup>41</sup> NISR, EICV3 2012 Economic activity thematic report, 2014
- <sup>42</sup> The World Bank, Rwanda Employment And Jobs Study, 2015
- <sup>43</sup> ILO, Future of work; Rwanda issues paper, 2016
- <sup>44</sup> Rwanda Revenue Authority, RRA Annual Activity Report 2015/16, 2016
- 45 GoR, National Policy On Workplace Learning To Prepare Rwandan Youth For Employment (Workplace Learning Policy), 2015
- <sup>46</sup> Callund Consulting Ltd, Feasibility Study On The Development Of An Informal Sector Pension Scheme (ISPS), 2014
- 47 Ibid
- <sup>48</sup>NISR, EICV 4, Poverty profile, 2016
- <sup>49</sup> NISR, National Accounts 2016
- <sup>50</sup> BNR, Formal exports and informal cross-border trade statistics, 2016
- <sup>51</sup> NISR, Rwanda Comprehensive food security and vulnerability analysis 2015
- <sup>52</sup> NISR, Seasonal Agricultural Survey, 2016
- <sup>53</sup> MINAGRI, CIP Program document, 2007
- 54 MINAGRI Data
- 55 NISR, Seasonal Agricultural Surveys 2013A-2017A
- <sup>56</sup> ILRI, Rwanda livestock sector analysis report, 2017
- 57 Ibid

58 Ibid

- 59 MINAGRI, Irrigation Master Plan, 2010
- 60 MINAGRI, PSTA III Mid-term review, 2016
- <sup>61</sup> National Agribusiness Investment Promotion Strategy 2017
- <sup>62</sup> UN WOMEN, Estimation of Cost of gender gap in agriculture productivity in Rwanda, 2017
- <sup>63</sup> NISR, Fourth population and housing census, Rwanda 2012, Thematic report, Population projections, 2014
- 64 NISR, Ministry of Health, & ICF International, 2015
- <sup>65</sup> African Institute for Development Policy, Harnessing the demographic dividend in Rwanda, 2017
- 66 African Union Commission, harnessing the demographic dividend through investments in youth, 2017
- <sup>67</sup> The Evolution of Poverty in Rwanda from 2000 to 2011, Results from the Household Surveys (EICV 3), NISR

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> UNDG, United Nations Development Assistance Framework Guidance, 2017

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> UNDG, UNDAF Companion Guidance, 2017

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> UNDP, Human Development Report 2016,

<sup>9</sup> African Development Bank, Country strategy paper 2017 -2021, 2017

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Ibid.

<sup>17</sup> MINECOFIN, Mid-Term Evaluation of EDPRS II 2013 - 2018, 2017

68 Ibid

- <sup>70</sup> MINALOC, National Social Protection Policy, 2005
- <sup>71</sup> LODA, VUP Impact assessment, 2014
- <sup>72</sup> NISR, EICV4 2014 Social protection thematic report, 2016
- <sup>73</sup>Retrieved from: http://www.who.int/healthsystems/publications/Abuja10.pdf
- 74 MoH, HSSP III Mid-Term review, 2015
- 75 Ibid
- <sup>76</sup> NISR, Rwanda Demographic and Health survey 2014-15, 2016
- 77Ibid
- <sup>78</sup> University of Rwanda, Evaluating impact of RapidSMS, 2016
- <sup>79</sup> Retrieved from: <u>http://www.who.int/immunization/policy/position\_papers/pp\_menA\_2015\_presentation.pdf?ua=1</u>
- <sup>80</sup> International Food Policy Research Institute; From promise to impact: Ending malnutrition by 2030, 2016
- 81 Retrieved from: http://oor.tw/news-detail/?tx\_ttnews%5Btt\_news%5D=1531@cHash=3c14ccfb2dd2127994ea12010107ftcf
- <sup>82</sup> UNICEF, Children right and sustainable development in Rwanda, a situation assessment and analysis, 2-17
- <sup>83</sup> FAO MAFAP, Measuring the impact of land consolidation on consumption patterns and nutrient availability: evidence from Rwanda, 2017
- <sup>84</sup> FAO, IFAD, UNICEF, WFP, WHO, The State of Food Security and Nutrition in the World 2017, Building resilience for peace and food security, 2017
- 85 UNAIDS, UNAIDS Data, 2017
- 86 RBC, Behaviour Surveillance Surveys (BSS) for Female Sex Workers (FSWs), 2014
- 87 RBC, Behaviour Surveillance Surveys (BSS) for MSM, 2014
- 88 MoH, End-Term Review of Rwanda National Strategic Plan for Elimination of Mother to Child Transmission of HIV (2011 -2015),
- 2015

<sup>89</sup> Retrieved from: <u>http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/10665/208825/1/9789241549684\_eng.pdf?ua=1</u>

<sup>90</sup> MININFRA, National Water Supply Policy,2016

<sup>91</sup> Retrieved from: <u>www.who.int/water</u> sanitation health/publications/washmmutrition/en/

- 92 NISR, EICV Utilities and amenities thematic report, 2013/14, 2016
- <sup>93</sup> RURA, Water supply Progress reports 2015, 2015
- 94 RURA, Key statistics in Water Supply sub-sector, 2015

95 MININFRA, National sanitation policy, 2016

- 96 UNICEF/WHO: Joint Monitoring Programme, 2017
- <sup>97</sup> MINECOFIN, EDPRS II 2013 2018, 2012
- 98 MINEDUC, Education Statistical Yearbook, 2016
- 99 WHO, World Disability report, 2011
- 100 REB, Learning achievement in Rwanda Schools (LARS II), 2016
- <sup>101</sup> The Belgian Development Cooperation, Country Sheet Rwanda, 2017
- <sup>102</sup> Finnoff, K. Decomposing inequality and poverty in post-war Rwanda: The roles of gender, education, wealth and location, 2015
- <sup>103</sup> University of Rwanda, Facts and Figures 2017, 2017
- <sup>104</sup> Scopus, 2017
- <sup>105</sup> Retrieved from: <u>http://www.webometrics.info/en/africa/rwanda</u>
- 106 Lutz, G. Reflection on Rwanda's electoral regulations. Swiss Agency for Development & Cooperation. 2005
- <sup>107</sup> Texas A&M University, Vision 2020 Mid-Term Review Report, 2017
- 108 Mo Ibrahim Foundation, A Decade of African Governance 2006-2015: 2016 Ibrahim Index of African Governance, 2016
- <sup>109</sup> The World Bank, World Development Report 2011: Conflict, Security & Development, 2012

<sup>110</sup> RGB, Rwanda Governance Score Card, 2016

<sup>111</sup> Transparency International Rwanda, Rwanda Civil Society Barometer, 2015

<sup>112</sup> Freedom House, Freedom in the world report, 2016

<sup>113</sup> MINALOC, National Decentralization Policy, Revised, 2012.

<sup>114</sup> Law N° 08/2006 Of 24/02/2006 Determining the organization and functioning of the district

<sup>115</sup> Ingalere, B, Do we understand life after genocide: Centre and periphery in the construction of knowledge in post-genocide Rwanda, African Studies Review, 53(1), 2010.

<sup>116</sup> UNDP, Mid-term evaluation of the deepening democracy through citizen participation and accountable governance program, 2016 <sup>117</sup>Rwanda Media Commission, The state of Media Freedom in Rwanda, 2015

<sup>118</sup> Prime Minister's Order N° 123/03 of 13/10/2010 Establishing the justice sector

<sup>119</sup> World Economic Forum, The Travel & Tourism Competitiveness Report, 2017

- <sup>120</sup> OSAC, Rwanda 2016 Crime & Safety Report, 2016
- 121 NPPA, GBV, Human Trafficking and Drogue Cases January 2015-March 2016, 2016

122 Ibid

<sup>123</sup> LAF and MINIJUST, Building the Foundation for Access to Justice in Rwanda: A report of the Legal Aid Baseline and Needs Analysis Survey, 2007

124 Microjustice4All, Microjusticia Rwanda: Overview and Objectives 2013-2016, 2013

125 MINIJUST, Annual Report 2016/17, 2017

- <sup>126</sup> NISR, Fourth Population and Housing Census, 2012
- <sup>127</sup> NCHR, Annual report 2015/16, 2016

<sup>129</sup> UN Human Rights Council, National report submitted in accordance with paragraph 5 of the annex to Human Rights Council resolution 16/21, 2015

- <sup>130</sup> World Economic Forum, Global Gender Gap Report 2016, 2016
- <sup>131</sup> GoR, Advancing Rwanda through women's empowerment and gender equality, 2015

<sup>132</sup> Burnet, J.E, Gender Balance and the Meanings of Women in Governance in Post-Genocide Rwanda, 2008

133 Coffé H, Conceptions of Female Political Representation: Perspectives of Rwandan Female Representatives, 2012

<sup>69</sup> NISR, Rwanda poverty profile report, 2015

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> GoR, Second and Third periodic reports on implementation of the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the child, 2014

- <sup>141</sup> Debusscher, Petra and An Ansoms, Gender Equality Policies in Rwanda: Public Relations or Real Transformations, 2013
- <sup>142</sup> UNDP, Basic Facts about PEI Rwanda, 2014
- <sup>143</sup> GoR, National land policy of 2004, 2005
- <sup>144</sup> MINIRENA, National Forestry policy, 2011
- 145 MINIRENA, ENR Sector progress report 2013-2017, 2017
- 146 Retrieved from: http://www.mininfra.gov.rw/fileadmin/user\_upload/new\_tender/ESSP\_17th\_March\_2015.pdf
- <sup>147</sup> RNRA, Rwanda water resources master plan, 2014
- 148 Law n°63/2013 of 27/08/2013 determining the mission, organization and functioning of REMA

<sup>149</sup> UNDP, GoR, UNEP, Assessment of the economic, social and environmental benefits of Rubaya green village in Gicumbi district, Rwanda and benefits of project replication, 2017

<sup>150</sup> RMA, Rwanda climate data policy, 2016

- <sup>151</sup> Retrieved from: <u>http://www.preventionweb.net/countries/rwa/data/</u>
- <sup>152</sup> MIDIMAR, National Disaster Management Policy, 2012
- <sup>153</sup> MIDIMAR, Annual report 2013/14, 14/15, 15/16, 2016
- <sup>154</sup> MIDIMAR, National Risk Atlas, 2015
- <sup>155</sup> UNHCR, Rwanda Monthly Fact sheet, August 2017, 2017

<sup>156</sup> Permanent mission of the republic of Rwanda to the UN New York, Note verbal GoR commitments at the US leaders summit Rwanda, 2016

- <sup>157</sup> J. E. Taylor, et al., Economic impact of refugees, 2016
- 158 UNHCR, Economic inclusion or refugees in Rwanda, a joint strategy by MIDIMAR & UNHCR (2016-2020), 2017
- <sup>159</sup> Organic Law N° 30/2008 OF 25/07/2008 Relating To Rwandan Nationality

<sup>160</sup> UNHCR, MIDIMAR, UNWOMEN, Inter-agency gender assessment for refugee camps in Rwanda 2016, 2017

- <sup>161</sup> John Erickson, et al, The international response to conflict and genocide: Lessons from the Rwanda experience, 1996
- 162 MIDIMAR, repatriation and reintegration programs for Rwandan refugees, 2014
- <sup>163</sup> Dietmar. M and Adela. S, The impact of remittances on economic growth: an econometric model, 2017
- <sup>164</sup> Retrieved from: <u>https://fred.stlouisfed.org/series/DDOI11RWA156NWDB</u>

<sup>165</sup> Gallup, 2015 Global Law and order report, 2015

<sup>166</sup> NURC, Rwanda Reconciliation Barometer, 2015

- <sup>167</sup> Retrieved: <u>http://rwandaun.org/site/un-peacekeeping/</u>
- <sup>168</sup> UN Resident Coordinators, Great lakes UNCTS' regional strategy paper, 2015
- <sup>169</sup> Declaration of commitments by the Movement of March 23 (M23) at the conclusion of the Kampala dialogue, 2013

<sup>170</sup> IMF, Rwanda: 5<sup>th</sup> review under the policy support Instrument and request for extension, and Request for an arrangement under the standby Credit facility-debt sustainability analysis, 2016

- 171 IMF, Regional Economic Outlook: Sub-Saharan Africa, Keeping the Pace, 2013
- 172 Retrieved from:, http://data.worldbank.org/indicator

<sup>173</sup> MINECOFIN, 2015-16 ODA Report, 2017

- <sup>174</sup> UNDG, funding to financing UNDAF companion guidance, 2016
- <sup>175</sup> The Rwanda we want: Towards Vision 2050, MINECOFIN, National Dialogue Presentation, 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> International Development Law Organization (IDLO), accessing justice: models, strategies and best practices on women empowerment, 2013

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> Gender Monitoring Office, Gender and Agriculture, 2017

<sup>136</sup> NPPA, Status of GBV Cases Prosecuted: Challenges and Strategies, 2016

<sup>137</sup> UNWOMEN, Towards gender equality and women's empowerment in Rwanda, 2015

<sup>138</sup> Retrieved from: <u>https://darpg.gov.in/sites/default/files/Rwanda.pdf</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>139</sup> GMO, Annual Report 2014-2015, 2016

<sup>140</sup> McKinsey Global İnstitute, The Power of Parity: How Advancing Women's Equality Can Add \$12 Trillion to Global Growth, 2015